

Institutional Integration Strategies: Promoting Civic Engagement through Skilled Civic Education in Educational Institutions of Punjab, Pakistan

Zulfiqar Haider Zaidi,¹ Aamir Jawad Munir,² and Maida Khurram³

Article Information	Abstract
Received: November 14, 2024 Revised: December 20, 2024 Accepted: December 29, 2024	The integration of civic engagement into educational institutions is a complex pedagogical process that requires a transformative strategy, confirming that individuals acquire the skills and knowledge necessary for active participation in civic life. This study explores how civic engagement through skilled civic education can be institutionalized in the educational institutions for community development in Pakistan, focusing on the Bahawalpur Division, which includes the three districts of Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar, and Rahimyar Khan, Punjab. A qualitative approach is carefully employed to address the research objective and achieve the study's ultimate goals. Qualitative data is collected through semi-structured interviews with sixteen different personalities and analysed through thematic analysis. More accurate findings are obtained through cross-referencing triangulation. This method ensures deeper insights, with key respondents providing valuable opinions on strategies to promote civic engagement through skilled civic education. The findings highlight several critical strategies, including institutionalizing community service learning, integrating skilled civic education into the curriculum, and employing effective pedagogical strategies such as learner-centred methods. Additional strategies include awarding academic credit for learning, implementing teacher pre-service training, providing incentives and accountability measures, and establishing collaborations with key stakeholders. By implementing these strategies, public college educational institutions play a transformative role in nurturing socially responsible and engaged citizens, contributing to the development of individuals and communities.
Keywords: <i>Institutionalization of Civic Engagement</i> <i>Skilled Civic Education</i> <i>Community Development</i> <i>Bahawalpur Division</i> <i>Pakistan</i>	

1 Introduction

Every nation in the world has adopted and developed civic education. This subject is known by many different names, including civic education, citizenship education, and democracy education in the world (Rafzan et al., 2022). Education for civic engagement refers to how young people are equipped with the civic knowledge and skills, to effectively participate in community life to solve its problems

¹Professor, Department of Public Administration, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan.

Email: zhyder.zaidi@usindh.edu.pk

²PhD Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan. Corresponding Author. Email: aamir.jawad49@gmail.com

³PhD Research Scholar, Department of Business Management, National College of Business Administration and Economics, Bahawalpur Campus, Bahawalpur, Pakistan. Email: maida.bwp@ncbae.edu.pk

(Schugurensky & Myers, 2008). It includes knowledge about civic processes, as well as, opportunities for participation both within the educational environment and the wider community (O'Connor & Keenaghan, 2012).

In Indonesia and France, civic education is a compulsory subject within the structure of the educational curriculum. Canada has a well-established system of citizenship education for more than a hundred years. This system is strongly connected with the education system where it is taught with supporting material and evaluated like STEM (Science Technology Engineering and Math) subjects. In the US, it is requisite for high school students to pass the US citizenship exam before graduation. The federal government in the US provides grants for civic education throughout the country. In comparison to these countries, Pakistan has a relatively poor civic education system. Either a few topics with basic understanding have been merged into the social studies syllabus and it has no co-relation with the social fabric of Pakistan. As a result, few civic education topics could not contribute to the strengthening and promotion of democratic values and principles in Pakistan (Sohaib, 2022).

In contrast to Pakistan, where children are deliberately exposed to propaganda at a young age in schools, streets, and homes, youth in the West are exposed to civic education and are taught about preserving the public good. This educational disparity has a significant impact on the type of citizenship exhibited by youth as they grow up. In Pakistan, a lack of civic engagement and a failure to protect the public good is largely the result of a lack of civic education. Civic education and engagement must be incorporated into educational institutions (Haider, 2014).

According to the UN Population Fund Report, (2017), Pakistan is considered to be the fifth largest young country in the world. Around 63 percent population of the country comprises youth aged between 15 and 30 years. Such a large young population has posed daunting challenges to the social, economic, and political sectors of the state (Hafeez & Fasih, 2018). The key elements of civic education and engagement seem to be the missing link at almost all stages of education (Winthrop, 2020). Looking at the curriculum and textbooks of public educational institutions, these themes are touched upon very half-heartedly in social studies or Pakistan studies. All these subjects have to offer written content, leaving the students with nothing but ideas about what the state is what a citizen's rights and responsibilities are, and what the responsibilities of an individual towards the state (Shagufta Gul, 2018).

Political leadership, policymakers, and educational supervisors of public sector educational institutions must recognize the importance of civic engagement & education and work together to bring this theme to the centre of the education learning process (Dean, 2005). Young people need such platforms that provide them with the opportunity to interact with communities to solve their problems at the educational institution level. This is by helping young people develop and practice the knowledge and skills needed to participate in civic life. The educational system as a local social institution can directly provide such opportunities for civic engagement to the youth as a local institution that can connect young people across the communities to solve their problems (Winthrop, 2020).

2 Literature Review

The connection between skilled civic education and civic engagement is critical in promoting community development. Skilled component of civic education enable learner with the proper knowledge and skills required for the effective civic participation in the society, whereas civic engagement entails individuals taking an active role in their communities and addressing societal issues. Active participation in community affairs, such as volunteering, community service, and grassroots initiatives, is encouraged through skilled civic education (Kirlin, 2003). Individuals gain the knowledge and skills needed to contribute meaningfully to their communities, collaborate with others, and address local challenges through civic education. Effective participation strengthens communities and fosters a sense of belonging and ownership, leading to community development (Burgess, 2011).

Skilled civic education is essential for the development of the country's communities. It increases people's understanding and relevance of politics, governance, and civic society in their daily lives. It also encourages civic participation, which is one of the features required for community development (Eurydice et al., 2012). Furthermore, it assists youth in developing the knowledge such as (, skills, understanding, and values needed to participate in developmental projects, public debates, politics, and constitutional-making by empowering them to think systematically and developing the mental strength and intellect necessary to understand and think intelligently (Schwarz et al., 2014).

The World Bank's Youth Development Report in 2007 highlighted youth civic participation as a promising community development strategy (Etra et al., 2010). The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) proposes to support youth development as a major contribution to viable human development. The (UNDP), Youth Engagement Strategy suggests that young people in all their diversity, have both a right and a duty to participate and contribute to development at the community level. In line with its mandate, the Strategic Plan fostering youth empowerment has been a growing priority for UNDP, 2014-2017, and its first global corporate youth strategy 2014-2017. Between 2012 and 2015, UNDP implemented over 550 youth-related projects in more than 120 countries dealing with civic engagement and political inclusion that included support to young people and their organizations, economic empowerment, and fostering peacebuilding (Nyo, 2021).

In the 1980s, American higher education began to respond to condemnation of its lack of responsiveness to social concerns. Later, AASCU (American Associations of State Colleges and Universities) in 2002, explored the idea of colleges and universities as with other public bodies, sharing responsibility for shaping the communities (Boyer, 2016). Educational institutions began to rediscover their relationship with society. Institutions in the United States and other European countries have been embracing and promoting civic engagement (Bowen, 2010). The recent review of the mission statements of 45 randomly selected colleges located in Australia, Africa, America, Europe, and Asia has revealed that community civic engagement is articulated widely as an institutional priority (Irving & English, 2008). More than 1,100 college and university presidents in the United States are current members of Campus Compact, a nationwide alliance dedicated to achieving higher education's civic responsibilities. The group, which was founded in 1985, "advances the public purposes of colleges and universities by strengthening their ability to improve community life and educate students for civic and social responsibility." The Carnegie Foundation established a "community engagement" rating for higher education institutions in 2006. Institutions around the United States are classed as displaying either curricular engagement, outreach, partnerships, or both, based on voluntary participation (Reich, 2014). In Australia, the increasing of community engagement policies and practices in higher education has been influenced, to some extent for the most part, however, colleges adapted and refined their public service role mainly because of a changed educational, political, and economic context in which the Commonwealth Government released policy documents articulating perceived support for college community engagement, particularly in regional areas. Now, Australian colleges/universities are expected to function as "sites of citizenship" that adopt social responsibility and civic engagement (Winter et al., 2006).

3 Research Question

How can educational institutions promote civic engagement through skilled civic education for community development in Pakistan?

4 Objective of the Study

To investigate the strategies that educational institutions can employ to promote civic engagement through skilled civic education for community development.

5 Hypothesis

Educational institutions can significantly promote civic engagement by incorporating skilled civic education through a multilayered approach, including institutionalizing community: service learning, integrating skilled civic education into the curriculum, effective pedagogical strategies including learned cantered methods, credit for learning, teacher pre-service learning, incentives & accountability and establishing collaboration with key stakeholders.

6 Research Methodology

Using a qualitative methodology, this research addresses the research question.

6.1 Population and Sampling of the Study

The researcher employed a purposive sampling technique to collect qualitative data, selecting participants deemed reliable and relevant to the research topic (Kumar, 2011). This approach ensures that inclusion of individuals with the expertise and insight necessary of addressing the study's objectives (Bhardwaj, 2019). The sample size in qualitative research is influenced by the methodological framework adopted. For instance, grounded theory studies typically involve 20 to 30 participant interviews, while case studies generally require 15 to 30 interviews (Marshall et al., 2013). Grounded theory studies often use 20 to 30 participant interviews, whereas case studies typically use 15 to 30 interviews. Similarly, 15 to 20 data items are recommended for a major research project's thematic analysis (AMAN, 2021). Therefore, a sample size of sixteen experts was selected for this study to provide meaningful qualitative data.

Table: Sample size of colleges

S#.	Category	No. of Individuals	Respresentations
1	Director Colleges	01	District Bwp
2	Principals	03	One from each district
3	Subject related professors	06	One from each district and three from "The Islamia University Bahawalpur".
4	Legislators	03	One from each district
5	Director / Dy Director Social Welfare	03	One representative from each district
Total			16

6.2 Qualitative Data Analysis

Thematic analysis, recognized as systematic and reliable method for qualitative analysis (Yelvita, 2022), was used in this study to analyze the qualitative data and address the resdarch question effectively.

6.3 Phases of Data Analysis

This study employed Braun and Clarke's (2006) six steps thematic analysis to identify recurring patterns of meaning within the data. categorizing and refrains the themes, defining and naming themes, and creating the final description. Respondents' views were constructing a coherent analysis of civic engagement and skilled civic education, offering a valuable insight into institutionalizing of civic engagement for community development through skilled civic education.

6.4 Research Validity

Validity is a fundamental aspect of any research project, ensuring the trustworthiness and utility of its findings, to enhance validity (Jonathan A. Smith, 2015). This study adopted a comprehensive triangulation approach involving “cross referencing” (Campbell et al., 2020), and verifying findings derived from interviews. This method ensure that the conclusion align with existing knowledge in the field thereby reinforcing the credibility of the research.

7 Findings

7.1 Institutionalizing Community: Service-Learning

The insights of this study acknowledged from previous studies align with the findings of the current research, highlighting community service learning as a particularly effective means of cultivating civic engagement. According to the respondent claim in this study community service learning is an experiential technique that extends beyond the classroom and emphasizes the incorporation of real-world community service into educational programs finds substantial support in scholarly works exemplified in the work of Adha and Ulpas (2020) statement aligns with broader theories of service learning, which emphasize the shared nature of the relationship between academic institutions and communities.

7.2 Integration of Skilled Civic Education into the Curriculum

The majority of the respondents agree that encouraging civic engagement needs the incorporation of advanced skilled civic education within educational institution curricula. Their perspectives highlight the concept that by deliberately including civic education in the curriculum, institutions may develop important values such as community service and social responsibility in students. The work of Kahne & Middaugh (2008), has steadily highlighted the positive impact of integrating civic education for effective civic engagement.

7.3 Effective Pedagogical Strategies

The study’s findings reveal a variety of effective methods for teaching skilful civic education in public college educational institutions. Particularly, the emphasis on adopting a learner-centred approach as the underlying principle for delivering effective civic education is a crucial distinction.

7.3.1 Teachers Subject Associations

It has been evident through the respondents views the SCE can be achieved effective attachment with civic education associations. One of the participants commended that, the organized professional conferences and workshops serve as platforms through which subject associations, teachers, and other professionals collaboratively assess the performance of skilled civic education. Finings of this study can be verified through the work of Jecobsen,et al (2009), according to them these association can be nominated from the geography of surroundings of the various educational institutions or from a single institutions.

7.3.2 Inviting the Experts

One effective pedagogical approach for teaching Civic Education involves inviting experts or professionals to deliver specialized topics for the students learning outcomes. This technique, explained by a respondent in the study, introduces real-world expertise and practical insights into the classroom. By leveraging the knowledge and experience of specialists in the field, students gain a deeper understanding of civic concepts and their real-world applications.

7.3.3 Conducting Government Office's Educational Tours

Respondents solidly agreed that teaching subjects like skilled-based-civic education should be practiced by education tours of government institutions concerning the topic learner in a specific period. The idea that visits to public institutions might act as immersive contexts for civic education involvement is supported by McCowan's (2009) study, which features experiences including elections, trials, and parliamentary processes that closely resemble real-world events. This approach successfully introduces students to the real-world applications of the material they study in class.

7.3.4 Civic Education and Community Engagement

The present study's findings emphasize the vital role of the community engagement approach in the teaching of civic education. This method is more significant because it actively introduces students to current, relevant civic matters of their community. Muleya (2015) and Xu (2010) refer to the concept of combining community service with classroom study as "service learning".

7.4 Learner Centred Methods

The findings of this study argued that skilled-based-civic education should be practiced through a learner-centred method approach also associated with the work of Hill (2002), who claims in his work, that while teaching civic education the role of the instructor should be a facilitator, and provide multiple learning experiences. This approach expedites the learning action. Another study by Eurydice (2017), demanded that the learning approach necessitates including a new pedagogical strategy for developing a complete grip on societal issues by learning through skilled civic education.

7.4.1 Group Discussion

The findings of the study that teaching skilled-based-civic education in the public college educational institutions can be effectively practiced through discussion method. McCowan (2009) also argued in his research that discussion method is very effective for students learning about civic issues. Such topics allow students to modify their views. During this learning process the learner are free to express their views ideas and understanding related to civic issues.

7.4.2 Debate Method

The debate approach was suggested by teachers as the ideal strategy for teaching skilled Civic Education. This technique needs learners to be divided into two groups and given a topic on which to argue. The teacher may decide to assign a topic to the students ahead of time so that they can debate on it. The findings associated with the work of Kamp (2011), who highlighted debate method is useful to get interaction, build relationship and opportunity to work in the various dimensions by practice students' civic skills.

7.4.3 Explanatory Method

It was a subject-related teacher who familiarized with this approach. The study showed that the teacher summarizes the entire subject by integrating the perspectives of both students to make sense of the lesson's objectives through useful discussion and debate. At this point, the teacher's job is to describe the entire lesson so that the students have a comprehensive understanding of the material. McCowan

(2009) provided evidence for this claim by stating that the explanation method expands by fostering debate and discussion in which students can express their opinions and adjust them in light of those of others. This approach is crucial because it places students in the right context concerning the syllabus's goals.

7.5 Credit for Learning

The notion of awarding extra credit for community service-learning projects, as proposed by the professor, is well-supported in existing scholarly work. Research in education, such as the study conducted by Eyler and Giles (1999), emphasizes the positive impact of service learning on student motivation and engagement. The integration of academic recognition with community service aligns with Tinto's (2012) theory of student retention, where engagement in meaningful activities outside traditional coursework fosters a sense of belonging and motivation.

7.6 Teacher Pre-Service Learning

The study's findings also highlight the changing nature of effective community service-learning implementation. The study proposes an approach that goes beyond typical teaching approaches by highlighting the necessity of pre-service learning programs for teachers. It encourages educators and program designers to embrace creative tactics, adjust their approaches to the community's specific needs, and provide participants with the skills and information required for effective civic engagement. Authors like Toler, Chenneville & Butler, 2012 endorsed the arguments of this study and contended that teachers are responsible for producing active citizens with the requisite knowledge, skills, and sense of responsibility to be civically engaged in society.

7.7 Incentives and Accountability

Professor perceptions on the multifaceted approach to teacher training, especially pre- and post-service-learning experiences, resound with contemporary scholarly perspectives in education. Hattie's (2009) meta-analysis supports the opinion that professional recognition and career advancement opportunities significantly contribute to teacher motivation and job satisfaction. Respondent views on accountability mechanisms, including a transparent evaluation system with regular assessments and peer reviews, are consistent with the scholarly work of Darling Hammond (2017), who claims for comprehensive teacher evaluations to ensure continuous professional development.

7.8 Collaboration with Government key Stakeholders

The study's findings signify educational institutions can foster strong partnerships with local community organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and other government institutions as a key strategy. The work of various authors such as Anderson, Houser, & Howland, (2010); BRYK, (2010); Colean, (1988); McAlister, (2013); Sanders, (2006) Participation in the community is essential for college students to succeed in learning experiences that take place outside of the classroom.

8 Qualitative Data Thematic Analysis

The key themes identified from the respondents' perspectives revolved around strategies to promote civic engagement through skilled civic education. Participants proposed several strategies, which are central to addressing the study's objective and advancing the institutionalization of civic engagement for community development.

8.1 Institutionalizing Community: Service Learning

It is suggested by the respondents that community service learning be institutionalized to improve experiential education and encourage community engagement. According to respondents, establishing

civic engagement in the curriculum can provide students with practical, real-world experiences while creating a feeling of civic responsibility and positively contributing to the community.

Respondent, Director Colleges:

"In my opinion, institutionalization of civic engagement is a strategic framework for community service-learning projects. I firmly advocate for the critical importance of inserting civic engagement as community service learning within educational institutions. This strategic move is essential for every individual [students], irrespective of their academic discipline. It allows them [students] to actively participate in addressing real-world challenges as a responsible citizen."

(An interview with Director Colleges, Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, Principal of a govt. college:

"The inclusion of community service initiatives in our college curriculum provides an important link between theoretical knowledge and practical, real-world applications. Engaging students in hands-on community development activities allows them to apply academic principles, creating dynamic learning experiences outside of the classroom."

(An Interview with a Public College Principal of District Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, subject related professor:

A "Civics" educator indicates the same concern about initiating community service-learning programs. He said, *"I think, community service-learning initiatives are an effective way to help students better grasp how academic material [skills] is applied in real-world settings. Through the integration of these projects into the curriculum, students are able to observe the direct relationship between the subjects we cover in class and community growth."*

(An interview with Subject Related Professor of Public College Educational Institution of District Bahawalnagar, 2023).

Respondent, professor, the Islamia University Bahawalpur:

One educator says that *"It is cognizant effort to integrate civic engagement into the core structure of the institution. From my point of view civic engagement is strategic framework and I strongly believe that institutionalizing civic engagement within educational institutions is crucial for nurturing responsible citizenship, because students regardless of their field of study, engages in real world problem solving through connecting academic knowledge with practical application"*

(An interview with the Professor of the Political Science Department, 2023).

Respondent, Deputy Director Social Welfare

"Civic engagement learning initiatives are extremely beneficial from the perspective of social welfare. Such programs give students a direct way to interact with the community and see how their activities affect it."

(An interview with Deputy Director Social Welfare, Bahawalpur, 2023).

8.2 Integrating Skilled Civic Education into the Curriculum

Respondents highlight the critical need for incorporating skilled civic education into the core curriculum as a cornerstone for building effective civic engagement activities. They also emphasized that a robust civic education is not just an addition to academic learning but a fundamental necessity for shaping responsible and engaged citizens.

Respondent, Director Colleges:

“In order to encourage civic engagement activities, educational institutions must incorporate skilled civic education into their curricula.”

(An interview with Director Colleges, Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, Principal of a govt. college:

“By embedding civic education into the curriculum, we can instil values of community service and social responsibility to the students.”

(An Interview with a Public College Principal of District Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, Associate Professor:

“Integrating civic education into our curricula not only enhance the students understanding of societal issues but also prepare them for responsible citizenship. It’s about equipping them with the knowledge and skills they need to handle societal issues.”

(An interview with an Associate Professor of Public College Educational Institution of District Bahawalpur, 2023)

8.3 Effective Pedagogical Strategies

This part compresses the pursuit of the third theme of the objective, aiming to identify the teaching-approaches employed in delivering skilled civic education in public college educational institutions. The findings also highlight a diverse array of learner-centred methodologies implemented by teachers in teaching skilled civic education.

8.3.1 Teachers Subject Associations

The first theme emerged from this point in the teaching of Civic Education with the formation of the subject association.

Respondent, Associate Professor, the Islamia University Bahawalpur:

He said, “contents of skilled-based-civic education can be reviewed professionally through subject related teacher association. They can also evaluate the area who are doing well or not. Teaching level of civic issued can be viewed in the organized conferences and local and national workshops. This could be happened at college level subject related association continuously professional interact with each other”.

(An interview with an Associate Professor of the Department of Public Administration, 2023).

8.3.2 Inviting the Experts

Respondents conveyed their perspectives on civic education instruction by inviting professionals to address the topic in hand. They said,

Respondent, Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur

“,,,,,He said According to him “students show enthusiasm when inviting a subject field professional, working in government sectors. Therefore, the college administration invites professional personnel from various local government departments to share their experiences and answer the student's questions.”

(An interview with a Professor of Political Science Department, 2023)

Respondent, Legislator:

“He advocates that Interactive sessions that involve local government office holders and district administration can be organized within educational institutions to bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical implementation. This approach can help students understand the importance of active civic participation and community engagement.”

(An interview with a Legislator District Bahawalpur, 2023)

8.3.3 Conducting Government Office’s Educational Tours

Respondent, Principal:

“He said education tours conducted by various government departments can play a vital role in enhancing students understanding of civic education. These tours offer practical, real-world exposure to the functioning of government institutions and the practical application of civic principles. By witnessing how government bodies operate and interact with the community, students can gain a deeper understanding of the impact of civic engagement. These tours can serve as an experiential learning opportunity.”

(An interview with a College Principal of District, Bahawalpur, 2023)

8.3.4 Civic Education and Community Engagement

Respondents highlighted the importance of teaching civic education with the combination of community engagement.

Respondent, Director Colleges:

“Integrating community engagement improves civic education by providing students with practical experiences to engage with social issues.”

(An interview with Director Colleges Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, Principal:

He added the common views “by providing opportunities for community participation, skilful civic education can be taught. He further added that it helps students to learn practical skills necessary for responsible citizenship”

(An interview with a College Principal of District, Rahimyar Khan, 2023)

Respondent, Lecturer:

“Establishing partnerships with local communities improves the effectiveness of teaching skilled Civic Education and they [Students] obtain an understanding civic issue.”

(An interview with a Lecturer of Public College Educational Institution of District Rahimyar Khan, 2023)

All of the respondents emphasize the critical importance that a variety of activities play in helping students develop a thorough knowledge of civic education and fostering a culture of civic engagement.

8.4 Learner Centred Method

This theme emphasizes the focus on individual learners and tailoring educational methods to meet their needs, fostering a more effective learning experience.

8.4.1 Group Discussion

Respondent, Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“This method technique helps students to take out issues from the viewpoint of how they comprehend the topic. As a teacher, we do want to teach them a traditional method of moralizing the learners. Only the discussion method is

used in the teaching of civic education as it provides a platform for pupils to get engaged with the instructor on various civic issues.”

(An interview with a Professor of Entrepreneur Department of Management Science, 2023)

8.4.2 Debate Method

Respondents declared debate method a superlative strategy in teaching CE. They said, Respondent, Associate Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“In the case of teaching civic education, the debating technique is a dynamic teaching approach that promotes civic responsibility and civic-mindedness.”

(An interview with an Associate Professor of Public Administration Department, 2023)

Respondent, Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“Through debates, students learn to consider multiple perspectives and appreciate the complexities of civic issues. Debates empower students to articulate and defend their viewpoints.”

(An interview with a Professor of Political Science Department, 2023)

8.4.3 Explanatory Method

A Civics subject Professor express support for the aforementioned learner-centred method. Reflecting on their perspective.

Respondent, Subject Related Lecturer:

“Following the students' discussions, debates, and presentations of their research findings, we, as instructor, play a crucial role in providing explanations regarding the implications of these topics for the learners. Our explanations are grounded in the curriculum, syllabus, and available literature. This step is vital to ensure that students' contributions are accurately guided and aligned with educational objectives. Our role, therefore, is to offer contextualized explanations that enhance understanding and contribute to the overall clarity of civic concepts in accordance with the established educational framework.”

(An Interview with a Lecturer of Public College Educational Institution of District Bahawalnagar, 2023)

8.5 Credit for Learning

One Professor recommended additional marks for the community service-learning project for the students. He suggested this strategy will enhance student motivation to meaningful participation in community service-learning projects. He said,

Respondent, Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“This approach would elevate student motivation and encourage more meaningful engagement. By linking academic recognition to community service, students are incentivized to actively contribute to projects, fostering a sense of purpose and commitment beyond conventional coursework. This strategy aligns academic achievement with social impact, promoting a holistic and enriching learning experience for students.”

(An interview with a Professor of Political Science Department, 2023)

8.6 Teacher Pre-Service Training

Respondents highlighted the significance of pre-service learning projects as a unique strategy. Educators can enhance their instructional approaches, adapt to changing educational landscapes, and continuously improve their abilities to serve the changing demands of students and society by reflecting on the impact of their projects on both students and communities. According to them;

Respondent, Director Colleges:

“.... Well, the importance of teacher competency in providing high-quality civic education and believes that training programs are crucial to provide teachers with the tools they require to engage students with the communities to introduce them with the civic issues.”

(An interview with Director Colleges, Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent, subject related Lecturer:

“As a teacher I feel service-learning programs improve teacher education by allowing educators to model successful teaching practices, address various student needs, and incorporate community-based experiences into their pedagogical approaches.”

(An interview with a Lecturer of Public College Educational Institution of, District Bahawalnagar, 2023)

Respondent, Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“In my perception institutions should provide pre-service training opportunities for educators to equip them with the necessary skills to effectively deliver civic education to their students.”

(An interview with a Professor of Entrepreneur Department of Management Science, 2023)

Respondent, Associate Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

Another teacher added: *“continuous teacher training can enhance the quality of civic education programs and ensure its sustainability.”*

(An interview with an Associate Professor of Public Administration Department, 2023)

8.7 Incentives and Accountability

In a discussion with Professor Bukhari, a distinguished academic and expert in the field of education, insightful views were shared on the establishment of criteria for incentives and accountability in the context of teacher's pre- and post-service-learning training programs. He said:

Respondent, Professor, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“I emphasized the need for a multifaceted approach to ensure effective mechanisms in teacher training. Regarding incentives, it was highlighted that financial rewards alone might not be sufficient; instead, a combination of monetary benefits, professional recognition, and career advancement opportunities could serve as powerful motivators. He also stressed the importance of aligning incentives with measurable outcomes, such as improved student performance and enhanced teaching methodologies. On the side of accountability, the respondent expressed the need for a transparent evaluation system that includes regular assessments, peer reviews, and continuous professional development monitoring. According to the professor, this would create a culture of accountability and drive teachers to

continuously improve their skills ultimately benefiting the overall quality of education.”

(An interview with a Professor of Political Science Department, 2023)

8.8 Collaboration with Government Key Stakeholders

These diverse responses illustrate the multifaceted nature of stakeholder partnerships in fostering a robust civic education ecosystem. Participants recognize the unique contributions that various stakeholders can make to enrich the learning experience and prepare students for active civic engagement.

Respondent, Principal:

“Key strategy for educational institutions is to build strong relationship with local government offices and NGOs.”

(An interview with a College Principal of District, Bahawalpur, 2023)

Respondent: Associate Professor, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur:

“In my opinion collaboration with government stakeholders such as local government offices, civil society and NGOs goes beyond traditional classroom learning. Through these partnerships, students become integral contributors to societal development.”

(An interview with an Associate Professor of Public Administration Department, 2023)

Respondent, Deputy Director Social Welfare:

“The importance of collaboration with local institutions is emphasized, with the goal of providing students with enhanced learning experiences through shared resources, knowledge, and cooperative activities.”

(An interview with Deputy Director Social Welfare, District Bahawalnagar 2023)

9 Conclusion

This study climaxes the implication of institutionalizing community service-learning and skilled civic education as essential components of fostering civic engagement. The integration of experiential learning methods, such as learner-centred approaches, group discussions, debates, expert-led sessions, educational tours, and service-learning, has been revealed to enhance the understanding and real-world application of civic education. The findings also emphasize the importance of teacher subject associations, professional development through pre- and post-service learning, and collaboration with government stakeholders to create a robust civic education framework. Additionally, recognizing student's contributions through academic credits and providing incentives and accountability mechanisms for educators are essential to maintaining motivation and engagement. Overall, these strategies collectively aim to nurture socially responsible citizens equipped to actively participate in their communities.

References

- Almarae, M. A. (2016). The University and the Voluntary Work Culture: Reality and Perspective. *International Education Studies*, 9(12), 109. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v9n12p109>
- Balsano, A. B. (2010). *Youth Civic Engagement in the United States : Understanding and Addressing the Impact of Social Impediments on Positive Youth and Community Development Youth Civic Engagement in the United States : Understanding and Community Development*. 8691. <https://doi.org/10.1207/s1532480xads0904>

- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic Analysis Thematic Analysis. *APA Handbook of Research Methods in Psychology*, 2, 57–71.
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2005). CONFRONTING THE ETHICS OF QUALITATIVE RESEARCH. *Journal of Constructivist Psychology*, 18(2), 157–181. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10720530590914789>
- Camara, P. F. (2012). *THE EFFECTS OF COMMUNITY SERVICE ON THE ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE OF STUDENTS AT A MASSACHUSETTS MIDDLE SCHOOL*. July, 1–117.
- Campbell, R., Goodman-Williams, R., Feeney, H., & Fehler-Cabral, G. (2020). Assessing Triangulation Across Methodologies, Methods, and Stakeholder Groups: The Joys, Woes, and Politics of Interpreting Convergent and Divergent Data. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 41(1), 125–144. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098214018804195>
- Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship Education In Pakistani Schools: Problems And Possibilities. *International Journal*, 1(2).
- Engel. (2017). Perception of personal civic responsibility among undergraduate students at the University of Kansas. *Paper Knowledge . Toward a Media History of Documents*.
- Etra, A., Prakash, K., Graham, L. A., & Perold, H. (2010). Youth Development through Civic Engagement : Mapping Assets in South Asia. *Innovations in Civic Participation*.
- Grubisich, K. (2018). *The Relationship Between Participation in Community Service and Students Academic Success*. 24–32. <https://thekeep.eiu.edu/theses/2620>
- Haider, M. (2014). *Pakistan's need for Civic Education - DAWN.COM*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1097292>
- Jnanathapaswi, S. G. (2021). An Introduction to Social Science Research .Thematic Analysis & Coding : An Overview of the Qualitative Paradigm. *Research Scholar in Education*, December, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.17159249>
- Jonathan A. Smith. (2015). Qualitative Psychology. A Practical Guide to Research Methods. In *The SAGE Dictionary of Qualitative Inquiry* (3rd ed.). SAGE. <https://doi.org/10.4135/97814129862681.n287>
- Mattick, K., Johnston, J., & Croix, A. De. (2018). *How to ... write a good research question*. April. <https://doi.org/10.1111/tct.12776>
- O'Connor, U., & Keenaghan, C. (2012). The Children and Youth Programme. *Children and Youth Programme*.
- Phillips, A. (2011). Service-Learning and Social Work Competency-Based Education: A “Goodness of Fit”? *Advances in Social Work*, 12(1), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.18060/1318>
- Qu, S. Q., & Dumay, J. (2011). The qualitative research interview. *Qualitative Research in Accounting and Management*, 8(3), 238–264. <https://doi.org/10.1108/11766091111162070>
- Rafzan, R., Budimansyah, D., Rahmat, R., Fitriarsi, S., Arzam, A., & Sulman, F. (2022). *Civic Engagement and Higher Education Develop Student in Civic Education Through based Project Citizen Model Learning*. January. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.3-11-2021.2314834>
- Schugurensky, D., & Myers, J. P. (2008). Citizenship Education: Theory, Research and Practice. *Encounters in Theory and History of Education*, 4(June 2008), 0–10. <https://doi.org/10.24908/eoe-ese-rse.v4i0.655>
- Shagufta Gul. (2018). *The youth needs civic engagement - Daily Times*. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/286918/the-youth-needs-civic-engagement/>
- Sohaib. (2022). *Civic education and our curriculum - Daily Times*. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/674833/civic-education-and-our-curriculum/>