



Department of Pakistan  
Studies

# Sadiq Journal of Pakistan Studies

---

Editor in Chief Prof. Dr. Aftab Hussain Gillani



The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan



# **Patron in Chief**

**Prof. Dr. Athar Mehboob**  
Vice Chancellor The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

# **Patron**

**Prof. Dr. Jawed Hassan Chandio**  
Dean Faculty of Arts and Languages I.U.B.

# **Editor in Chief**

**Prof. Dr. Aftab Hussain Gillani**  
Dean Faculty of Law  
Chairman Department of Pakistan Studies I.U.B.

# **Editor**

**Dr. Robina Yasmin**  
Assistant Professor, Department of Pakistan Studies I.U.B.

# **Managing Editor**

**Muhammad Ahsan Ghazali**  
Associate Lecturer Department of Pakistan Studies I.U.B.

# Advisory Board

## *International Advisors*

**Prof. Francis Robinson**  
(Royal Holloway University of  
London, UK)

**Prof. Sara F.D. Ansari**  
(Royal Holloway University of  
London, U.K)

**Prof. Aslam Syed**  
(Prof. Harvard University, USA)

**Prof. Rohani Bt Haji Ab Ghani**  
(University Utara Malaysia)

**Dr. Mohamed Ali bin Haniffa**  
(University Utara Malaysia)

**Dr. Nor Azlah Sham Bt Rambely**  
(University Utara Malaysia)

## *National Advisors*

**Prof. Dr. Riaz Ahmed**  
(Ex Director NIHCR)

**Prof. Dr. M Iqbal Chawla**  
(Ex Dean Arts & Humanities,  
University of the Punjab, Lahore)

**Prof. Dr. Imdad Hussain**  
(Ex. Dean Social Sciences Shah  
Abdul Latif University Kherpur,  
Sindh)

**Prof. Dr. Hameed Raza  
Siddiqui**  
(Ex. Principal SE college  
Bahawalpur)

**Prof. Dr. Shahid Hassan Rizvi**  
(Ex. Chairman History Department,  
The Islamia University of  
Bahawalpur)

**Prof. Dr. Asmat Naz**  
(Ex. Dean Social Sciences, Women  
University Multan)

**Prof. Dr. Mehboob Hussain**  
(Chainman Department of History &  
Pakistan Studies, University of the  
Punjab Lahore)

## SADIQ JOURNAL OF PAKISTAN STUDIES

Volume.1, No.1	January – June 2021	Sr. No.
The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization for Assimilation of Baluchistan in Pakistan (1999-2008)	Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim	1
Democratization and Local Body Election in the Punjab: The Study of Local Election 2015 in District Bahawalnagar	Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim Prof. Dr. Razia Musarrat	16
Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan: A Case Study of Baba Guru Nanak's Dev Shrine – Kartarpur	Sara Iftikhar	31
Women Empowerment and Women Rights during Pervez Musharraf Period	Rehana Kausar	40
Iran And KSA Using Sectarian Proxy Warfare To Counter Each Other's Regional Influence - Implications For Pakistan	Muhammad Ahsan Ghazali Sajjad Hussain	49
Musharraf Legacy & Triple "N" Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR	Dr. Mian Saeed Ahmad	50

**The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization for  
Assimilation of Baluchistan in Pakistan (1999-2008)**

By

**Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim**

Director Colleges Bahawalpur Division Bahawalpur

---

**ABSTRACT**

*The study will deal the ethnical divided society of Baluchistan. The lawlessness of society has deep impact on the state structure. The ethnic based extremism flourished in the Baluchistan. The objective of the study is to present constitutional model for the peaceful solution for the assimilation of different ethnic groups in Pakistan. Although the society of Pakistan is multi-ethnic based but it is analyzed on the democratic ground. Ethnic conflicts and military intervention in politics leads to a highly centralized government while democracy needs full participation of people in governance. The citizens of Baluchistan are very anxiously willing for constitutional model under real democracy in Pakistan. The country have been remained under the crises of ethnic movements, deposition of elected Prime Ministers and governments, unconstitutional initiatives of military rulers and political elites, lawlessness by the institutions and trend of law breaking among the masses. The analytical method is adopted to study the implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization for Assimilation of Baluchistan.*

**KEYWORDS:** Demography; History of Insurgency in Baluchistan; Issues and Challenges of Baluchistan; Constitutional Model; Political Parties' Role for Assimilation; Constitutional Role for Assimilation.

---

**INTRODUCTION**

Pakistan is ethnically divided society on language, religion and region based. There is detail analysis of the constitutional model through democratization with the special reference of multi-ethnic society of Pakistan. The ethnic issues of Baluchistan have deep impact on the situation of lawlessness. It is challenge for state institutions to handle lawlessness situation of Baluchistan. These ethnic issues are major cause of extremism in all aspect of life which converted in to militancy in different part of province of Baluchistan of Pakistan. The disparities of social and economic of different ethnic groups are also cause of lawlessness.

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... The attempt is made to show lawlessness and its impacts on democratization and the process of assimilation in multiethnic culture with the perspective of constitutional model (Nadeem, 2002, p. 21).

The different armed groups operated in some areas of Baluchistan for Greater Baluchistan in Pakistan. The democratic process is adopted under the Constitutional Model for the Assimilation in Pakistan. Eighteenth amendment has a significant role to handle the grievances of different regional groups. PPP government started move of Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Baluchistan in which financial resources as well as job opportunities awarded to Baluchistan. The data of natural resources and population support to resolve such issues. Data of census gives significant facts about people's belonging with language which is shown as:-

Table No 1  
The Percentage of Language Speaking People

Provinces/ Regions	Languages						
	Urdu	Punjabi	Pashto	Sindhi	Balochi	Saraiki	Others
Islamabad	10.1	71.6	9.5	0.6	0.1	1.1	7.0
Punjab	4.5	75.2	1.2	0.1	0.7	17.4	0.9
Sindh	21.1	7.0	4.2	59.7	2.1	1.0	4.9
Baluchistan	1.0	2.5	29.6	5.6	54.8	2.4	4.1
NWFP	0.8	1.0	73.9	–	–	3.9	20.4
FATA	0.2	0.2	99.1	–	–	–	0.5
Pakistan	7.6	44.1	15.4	14.1	3.6	10.5	4.7

Source: (Pakistan, 2009, p. 333)

### Introduction of Baluchistan

Baluchistan is located in the West side of Pakistan having adjacent boundary line with Afghanistan and Iran. It has 347190 square kilometers that is 44% of Pakistan. The population of Baluchistan is 80 00,000. It is 5% of the total population of Pakistan. There is long coastal boundary line of Baluchistan with the Arabian Sea. (Khan, 2011). Baluchistan is enriched with natural resources. There is great charm for the federal government in the natural resources of Baluchistan. There are different projects started in the province. Frédéric Grare citing about natural resources of Baluchistan and said, "It holds large quantities of coal, gold, copper, silver, platinum, aluminum, and, above all, uranium, and is a potential transit zone for a pipeline transporting natural gas from Iran and Turkmenistan to India." (Grare, 2006, p. 4). The major ethnic group is Baloch

while other major ethnic group is Pashtun and some other tribes are also part of population of Baluchistan. The Baloch tribes preserved their culture and traditions. The tribal chiefs have sovereign power in the respective areas. The protuberant Baloch tribes are Mengal, Marri, Bugti, Mohammad Hasni, Zehri, Bizenjo and Raisani in Pakistan. Describing the lifestyle of the Balochi people, Encyclopedia of Britannica mentions:

“The Balochis are traditionally nomads, but settled agricultural existence is becoming more common; every chief has a fixed residence. The villages are collection of mud or stone huts; on the hills, enclosures of rough stone walls are covered with matting to serve as temporary habitations. The Balochis raise camels, cattle, sheep and goats, and engage in carpet making and embroidery. Their agricultural methods are primitive.” (Britannica, 2015)

### **The History of Insurgency in Baluchistan**

The crisis in Baluchistan is since inception of Pakistan. Baluchistan's violence has pivotal position for security institutions of Pakistan. The major cause of violence is the nonexistence of constitutional institutional machinery in the state. The initiation of skirmish is sketched after short period of independence of Pakistan. Baloch leadership started the bloody terrorist activities in Baluchistan. There are several such waves of conflict in Baluchistan.

Arrest of Khan of Kalat was on distrust in 1958. The conflict escalation was maximized during the military operation in Bhutto regime from 1973 to 1977. The situation was further intensified during Musharraf regime's military operation. The recent insurgent move emerged in 2000 at exploration oil and natural gas in the province. The insurgency was spread in the non-tribal Bloch areas. Elected governments tried to play role for rescuing from the violence in the province from violence. Several attempts made but in vain. (Harrison S. , 1981, pp. 150-52)

The major concerns of Baloch Nationalists are for controlling authority of natural resources of their province. The prominent leader Nawab Akbar Bugti has raised the issue of control of natural resources of Baluchistan by the federal government. Akbar Bugti claimed; “They think that natural resources are national assets, and we think that they are Baloch assets, and whoever wants to use them must do so through us, not by direct possession.” (ICG, 2006).

Bloch leaders Nawab Akbar khan Bugti and Mir Balaach Marri publicized 15 point agenda for provincial autonomy of Baluchistan in 2005. Since that time, the bloody and brutal conflicts had been emerged and suppressed by the government. The military government resisted Nawab Akbar Bugti declaring him a rebel/ traitor. After eight months of military operation in Baluchistan, Nawab Akbar Bugti the ex-governor and Chief Minister of Baluchistan killed in an attack by Pakistan air force in August 2006. Insurgency prevailed in the province and Bloch nationalists' movement got intensity after Nawab Akbar Bugti's death. After four months of this incident, Sardar Akhtar Jan Mengal the leader of Mengal

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... tribe was sent to jail and Mir Balaach Marri was killed in 2007. The issue of missing person's dead bodies was fanning the flames of separatists' movement against state. The prominent Baloch leader Nawab Akbar Bugti was murdered in this operation. The killing of Baloch leader was not supported in democratic regimes. It is not the final solution to murder the political leadership without fixing charges and investigations. The constitution provides the right of fair trial for the principle of justice.

The Baluchistan Liberation Army demanded for an independent 'Greater Baluchistan was consisting of Baloch areas of Pakistan. The Baloch leadership has different concerns in the federation of Pakistan such as, the conversion into minority in the province, the issue of royalty. The cultural and linguistic differences among the two main groups demanded for division of the province became an issue and lead to conflict. (Memon, 1997, p. 211). These concerns were exploited on the foreign support. The majority of Baloch were living in rural areas. The strong the economic and political infrastructure is needed for this community. Then provincial government can handle the Baluchistan. (Reilly, 2006, p. 49)

The fact that the insurgency is still continuing indicates the difficulties of finding a determined political solution of Baluchistan. It is quite clear that use of forces and kidnapping are not the solution of ethnic issues. Sectarian conflicts have also increased in Baluchistan but government did not respond it seriously. Baluchistan insurgents also targeted gas pipelines and infrastructure. A political solution is not possible until military operation does not end in Baluchistan. Peace and prosperity can be achieved only through peaceful talk.<sup>1</sup>

The federal government without consulting with provincial government leased Gwadar port for 40 years to Singapore Company in February 2007. The Bloch demanded justice and fairness to resolve the sensitive issues of provincial autonomy. They want to be honored and acknowledged their rights. The political leaders from Baluchistan stressed upon the violation of the constitution as the root cause of all the conflicts. The people of Baluchistan were struggling for their rights and there was no other conflict in the province. They did not want to dissimilate the country but their rights to live with dignity and honor. The military rule that never allowed democracy to flourish in the country. (Shahbaz Rana, 2009, p. 12 ).

The public is not aware of the issues of the backwardness areas and military operations in Baluchistan. The Bloch insurgency started when they demanded their due rights and military used against them during Musharraf regime. The civilian democratic government came in 2008, it was hoped that the new government would halt wrong policies of previous government but it disillusioned the people to following the previous policies. (Editorial, 2011)

### **The Issues and Grievances of People of Baluchistan**

---

<sup>1</sup> Daily Times, Islamabad, 31-07-2011



According to a research report of United Nations world food program, 11 districts of Baluchistan out of 20 districts of food insecure districts of Pakistan are suffering from poverty which outcomes are violence and militancy. In Baluchistan extremist activates are due to socio-economic injustice. (Suleri, 2009, pp. 84-85)

The low development and poverty are cause of the poor law and order situation and political instability. Discrimination and inequitable distribution of natural resources on regional identity basis are the cause of unrest in Baluchistan. Now Bloch are not agree for sharing their resources but have been demanding separation for their own people only because they have been remain deprived from their due share for a long time. Their nationalist political parties are being criticized due to failure of their performance in acquiring their rights. The government did not increased in budget for investment of development projects in Baluchistan's prosperity and stability that out of 26 districts of Baluchistan only four have the facility of gas. Baluchistan receives only 12.4% of royalty of gas. The population of the province has been suffering from poverty and central government paid a little attention towards health, education and other public welfare projects. Bloch grievances are the Punjab dominating army and neglecting the needs of Bloch population that is the cause of resentment and violence. (Mahmood, 2007, p. 153)

Educational deprivation of tribal population is one of major obstacles to progress. The central governments' response increased the economic and social grievances. The federal government allocated funds on population size of the provinces which deprived and created the feelings of resentment and exploitation in Baluchistan. The federal government has to redress these grievances. (Mahmood, 2007, p. 156)

The federal and provincial governments seemed ineffective in Baluchistan while security forces are authority for decision making process. The young innocent who have come from the other parts of the country to serve as teachers, doctors, engineers, political workers and government servants that may contribute for the betterment of their society, are being kidnapped and their deaths created unrest and paramilitary forces and government are seen silent spectator that cannot stop them. Almost 13000 deaths are the proof of senselessness of government and worse situation of stability in the province. Short sightedness and the policies of hatred and cruel treatment fuelled the separatist sentiments of the Bloch people.

Political parties protect the ethnic criminals. The ethnic violence such as kidnapping and robberies is backed by the nationalist movement. It has authoritative duties of federal government to make efforts for addressing the grievances of Baluchistan. Government has to pay full attention on their economy, social and security needs of Baluchistan.<sup>2</sup> Nationalists blamed for exploitation of natural resources of Baluchistan without their due share. Economic, industrial and

---

<sup>2</sup> Baluchistan Violence, The Dawn, Islamabad, 14-03-2011.

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... resource development projects do not let to work that resulted in the form of increasing poverty and backwardness.<sup>3</sup>

The people do not take interest in ethnic violence with their own will, they are fuelled by nationalist leaders. They realized them that they are being deprived. Bloch nationalist leaders are playing a negative role in Baluchistan against Punjab province and Pakistan army. They persuade youth for separation of their region from the rest of Pakistan that is quite nonsense.<sup>4</sup>

The infrastructure development is comparatively far less than other provinces of Pakistan that increased deprivation feelings in Bloch. The Bloch do not want the reshaping of their province on linguistic basis because in this way the Pukhtoon populated area would separate from the Bloch tribal area and Brahvi-speaking Mengal tribes can also demand for their separate identity of language and thus the province would cut short in size further more.

Many moderate nationalists have been eliminating from the scene of Baloch politics. Several Bloch people has been mysteriously picked up, tortured and even killed ruthlessly and later on their dead bodies are found from different parts of Baluchistan. Ghulam Muhammad Bloch was killed along with two other nationalist leaders by the Pakistan security forces in April 2009<sup>5</sup> which showed the conflict between Bloch activists and sectarian agencies. Separatists attacked security forces, government officials and non-Bloch residents of the province. The dead bodies left the question mark whether security agencies killed them or insurgents. Mostly Bloch considers such kinds of actions from the security forces and fuelled the separatist sentiments among the Bloch. The security forces are handling military pattern not as political way through civil leadership. Frontier corps has been conducting operations in Baluchistan. The provincial authorities of Baluchistan claimed Baloch people have no interest in the separation move. Some people propagated on the separatist movement issue.<sup>6</sup>

The government must take the situation seriously and address the grievances of Bloch who have been waiting for social and economic justice. Pakistan needs the natural resources of the province and Bloch need the fair deal from the state. So both are need of each other and political solution is the need of time. The government must compensate Baluchistan through correct decision urgently.<sup>7</sup>

The province and center relations are tense at some issues. There is incompetency of provincial governments is also the reason behind the crisis. After general election 2008 a coalition government under leadership of Aslam Raisani is

---

<sup>3</sup> Baluchistan cannot Suffer Anymore, Daily Times Islamabad, 25-03-2011

<sup>4</sup> Mengal's no Nonsense Message, Daily Times Islamabad, 21-12-2011

<sup>5</sup> Baluchistan Waiting for Justice, Daily Times, Islamabad, 28-02-2011

<sup>6</sup> Baluchistan Scenario, Daily Times Islamabad, 20-04-2011

<sup>7</sup> Baluchistan Talks, The Dawn, Islamabad, 14-07-2011

initiated. Not only had the military but also the civilian rulers damaged the stability of the country. (Harrison S. S., 2009)

### **The Constitutional Model to Resolve Grievances of Baloch Community**

Pakistan people's party government apologized from the people of Baluchistan after elections 2008. It is promised for allocation a handsome amount for development projects. But ethnic and tribal identity has deep roots in Baluchistan and the province is fragmented among several groups based on different norms and social values. The Bloch leaders must have to cooperate with government for the better living standards of Bloch people. (Jamil, 2011).

Prime Minister Gilani visited Baluchistan and assured to promote development, improved security and start negotiations with Bloch nationalist leaders for the national interest. The government launched Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Baluchistan package in 2009 containing 39 points to address the grievances of Bloch consisting of special age relax and academic qualifications to get government jobs and offered to negotiate with exiled Bloch leaders. The federal government of Pakistan has announced 7th National Finance Commission (NFC) Award in 2010. The package of Constitutional amendments named 18th Amendment that incorporated many dispensations. Consequently outcomes are the abolition of concurrent list from the Constitution that provided superiority of federal government on the provinces. The incumbent Chief Minister & the President of the National Party of Baluchistan Malik Baloch conversed;

“The abolition of concurrent list and giving 50 % share to provinces on oil and gas resources was a progress in the right direction but even then... It will be disaster if the implementation of 18th amendment is stopped.” (Mujahid, 2012, p. 145)

Although announcements are made but practically no one has contacted with the Bloch leadership nor are these political dialogues useful in the presence of security forces. Just promises cannot address the grievances of the people of Baluchistan. Therefore these promises could not attract the Bloch people due to reasons. First, according to Bloch nationalists it has been too late and its implementation is slow. Second, The feeling of deprivation for a long time resulting in the form of poverty and third, the federal government with other provinces have been exploiting the natural resources of Baluchistan. So they have been expressing their hatred against non-Baluchis and federation. The government promised to focus on Baluchistan but did not fulfill. Governor Baluchistan said that progress in talks cannot be possible with ‘angry Bloch’ who is struggling to get social, economic and political rights.<sup>8</sup> The government of Pakistan admitted insurgency and problems in Baluchistan first time. Baluchistan is declared a land

---

<sup>8</sup> Qaisar Rashid, Address the Bloch Grievances, Daily Times Islamabad, 14-12-2011

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... of grievances and bloodshed, because it was ignored in the history, and no government took interest in developmental projects in Baluchistan.

The seventh National Finance Commission Awards is another attempt of the federal government to allocate additional funds for the development of the province. The share in federal revenue has increased due to NFC award. The right of profit of Baluchistan has acknowledged from its natural resources. Sindh and Punjab have willingly accepted a cut in their allocations to compensate Baluchistan for the past negligence. But these efforts are not sufficient. The serious issue is to find the missing persons and executing of civil government peacefully otherwise these packages are useless as compare to attacks and killings.<sup>9</sup> The constitutional assurances for the natural resources may prove helpful for assimilation of small units of federation of Pakistan.

Pakistan military has been showing interest in establishing educational institutions and by taking Bloch youth in army. Army has been opening up schools and technical and vocational training institutes and providing facilities for specialized education for Bloch students in different disciplines especially relevant to the province. Of course these initiatives are beneficial to make better the skills of youth and assimilate them as productive citizens of Pakistan. The recruitment of the Bloch youth in army and in different development projects of provincial administration can make better the socio-economic conditions and bring the youth in to the mainstream through induction in armed forces. Army also started educational institute projects. But elected civilian government must take interest to improve the living standard of the people and restore their confidence at government. (Jamil, 2011).

The parliament passed 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in 2010 in which provincial autonomy granted to all provinces. It was a great achievement of the parliament in the constitutional history of Pakistan. The concurrent list has abolished and for the first time the federation has devolved the powers to the provinces to increase their autonomy. From the 1<sup>st</sup> July 2011 the federal government would deal five subjects, communication, defense, foreign affairs finance and revenue. The small provinces have serious grievances from Punjab. Now the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment has bestowed provincial autonomy and addressed the genuine grievances of the smaller provinces.<sup>10</sup>

Parliament represented the will of the people of Pakistan. All political parties expressed their full consensus over 18<sup>th</sup> amendment. The approval of 18<sup>th</sup> amendment shows that the politicians of multiethnic groups can play their role for national integration and mutual harmony. (Cookman, 2010) The military dictators violated the constitution of 1973 and made amendments according to their own will. They did not give importance to the constitution any more than a piece of paper. It was the responsibility of the civilian government to restore the constitution to its original form. The restoration of the Constitution is for

---

<sup>9</sup> Baluchistan Killings, The Dawn Islamabad 31-03-2011

<sup>10</sup> Devolution of Power, The Daily Times, Islamabad, 30-06-2011

democracy and national consolidation in never denial from political leadership. The issue of the provincial autonomy could not resolve. The removal of concurrent list has increased the provincial autonomy and gave the right to legislate 47 subjects to the provinces. But the federal list still has the right to legislate on 67 subjects' including taxes, revenue and duties. One of them is the right to control the movement of the population within the country to the over populated cites. (Khan, 2011, p. 32)

The prosecution Nawab Akbar Bugti case was included in the Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Baluchistan. The Baluchistan High Court issued the warrants of General Musharraf and other accused persons. These persons should have to present in the court. But the government has taken no action. The Bloch nationalists demanded for the fair enquiry to assess the causes and facts for Nawab Akbar Bsugti case that for what General Musharraf adopted the military action path instead of taking legal action against him or to solve the problems through negotiation and reconciliation. (Rashid, 2011).

After the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment, the NFC Awards and Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Balochistan Package the provincial autonomy and billions of rupees are allocated to the province and Baluchistan's share has increased from 5% to 9%. 20 billion rupees are paid and 100 billion rupees are promised for more gas development funds and surcharges. Baluchistan needs maximum autonomy and self-governance in its affairs, increased development funds, job quotas and educational and military institutions but there are many obstacles in the way of progress to bring change. The provincial government has been suffering from corruption and lack of human resources and government has no resources to fulfill promises and meet the challenges.<sup>11</sup>

### **Challenges and Issues in the Grievance's Handling**

It is observed that lack of peace and stability has no attraction to the investors for investment in business and industries that is helpful for improving the living conditions. In the presence of target killings of Punjabis, Baluchistan package cannot be proved fruitful. Ethnic and sectarian conflicts have disturbed the environment of peace and harmony that is essential for assimilation. Some professional criminals have been fuelling to create disintegration among the people. Pashtun political parties had strictly condemned the target killings and motivated Bloch nationalists to discourage the killing of innocent citizens (Jamil, 2011).

Military operations and guerrilla war is not a permanent solution. The welfare measures taken by army cannot decrease violence. The war in Baluchistan shows that Pakistanis are not single nation even nationalities dilemma has been remaining a major problem in the past scenario. The steps taken to achieve integration of the various communities would prevent such conflicts in future. There is need of dialogue with nationalist leaders and guerrillas in the mountains

---

<sup>11</sup> Baluchistan Visit, The Dawn, Islamabad, 13-10-2011

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... and the people of Baluchistan to bring them in to the mainstream through the process of reconciliation that needs a vision in leaders. The governments have to pay attention to the grievances of Bloch otherwise the situation would be out of control in Baluchistan.<sup>12</sup>

The society respects individual freedom, shows accommodation and tolerance, it proved more potential for democratic government. Assimilation causes the change in the socio-economic structure. Governments can encourage as well as discourage discrimination in the workplace and society on the basis of race, dress or language. A comparison among multi-ethnic societies of developed countries and under developing countries on the process of assimilation reveals that it is not attaining impossible, it may possible but through a set of rules and regulations and laws in the constitutions. (Darity, 2008 2nd ed, p. 92). General Musharraf tried to merge military rule with the modernization and liberalism focusing on economic development that seemed essential after September 11, 2001 International scenario. (Nasr, p. 32)

### **The Role of Weak Political Parties for Assimilation**

Political parties have prime role in the democratic process to resolve such issues. It is admitted fact and reality of democratic system. The parties have to promote democratic process to represent public desires and interests in an organized and systematic pattern as well as can create conflicts, destabilize the democratic process and promote regionalism against the national interests in multiethnic societies. Stable political parties with a solid agenda for national interests can integrate disperse groups and individuals through democratic process. (Reilly, 2006, p. 122)

It was observed from the time of creation of Pakistan, Muslims of subcontinent forgot ethnic differences under the leadership of Muslim League but after partition the cleavages began to emerge more extensively. (Kukreja, 2003, pp. 5-8). There are six major political parties have been working and about 171 minor political parties are registered in Pakistan. But these political parties never perform their role for the supremacy of law, development of constitutionalism and democracy rather they exploited the masses at the name of democracy. (Sanjay Dutt, 2000). The disintegration of political parties has deep impact on the assimilation of small units as in Baluchistan with Pakistan. The local and regional political parties are functioning in Baluchistan. These parties have no major role in the formation of federal government.

Equal distribution of opportunities of economic development can lead to assimilate and integrate the people of Pakistan. If political parties want to keep peace and prosperity in Pakistan, they have to play their role with sincerity and resolve the issues through negotiation not force. (Moudud Ahmed, 1995, p. 370). Elected representatives contact to the people of their constituencies only during the election campaign and know a little bit about their problems. Democratic process cannot be stabilized without political awareness and active participation.

---

<sup>12</sup> Baluchistan Scenario, Daily Times Islamabad, 20-04-2011

The people of Pakistan have knowledge of the importance of democratic process and they desired that all institutions must work within their constitutional parameters. It is due to the bitter experience of military dictators' rule over Pakistan almost 33 years and democratically elected governments could not complete their tenure from 1988-99. Military governments created intolerance and ethnicity due to narrow minded policies. Peace, progress and prosperity can be achieved through democracy in the multi- ethnic society of Pakistan. (Time ' . D., 2011)

### **The Role of Constitution for Assimilation in Pakistan**

Constitution and democracy are two interchangeable synonymous. If constitution is supreme then ultimately the democratic system is functioning. But in Pakistan none of the three Constitutions could provide the real constitutional democracy in the country. Obviously 54% of Pakistanis want constitutional democracy. The individuals who remained authoritative and did unconstitutional acts should be brought to justice to compensate the whole nation. According to a survey 70% people of Pakistan want the trial of those persons, who brought changes in the constitution illegally without the consent of the parliament elected by the people of Pakistan. Abrogating the constitution is a delinquency and those persons who indulged in it must be prosecuted. (Ahsan, 2009). General Zia-ul-Haq emphasized on the Islamic democracy confessed the importance of constitutionalism and said, "The constitution is the gate way to democracy." (Ahmad, 2001, p. 229). The leadership changed three constitutions with amendments in a short period. There are severe constitutional controversies and constitutional conflict among the institutions. The provincial autonomy is major concern in Pakistan. it is needed to bring reforms through consensus in the constitution and overcome the contemporary national issues. Pakistani rulers are sent into exile in disobedience of the Constitution. The supreme law of the state and break the rules and do illegal actions. Pakistani courts let them free to go and settle abroad without any accountability. (Anwar Syed, 2010, p. 74)

Pakistan faced the challenges concerned to the rule of law because the rich people of elite class made the rules and laws for the poor people to keep them always poorer ignoring their consensus. While they themselves are free from all the rules and laws enjoying health and education and entertainment facilities that are available only to them.

The analysis of the Constitutions illustrate that the legislative assemblies of Pakistan always recommended a democratic, parliamentary and federal system. It failed miserably because of the rigid behavior of political elite class. Parliamentary democracy would take root and flourish in Pakistan only when there was implemented rule of law, impartial and neutral bureaucracy and free judiciary the prerequisites of democracy while in Pakistan law of necessity and rule breaking by the ruling class have been remaining a tradition. The rulers always practiced unconstitutional and illegal actions against the interest of people and judiciary remained a silent spectator or supporter of the government. The rulers and the ruling class indulge in many crimes, illegal and unconstitutional acts are given special protocol and the bureaucracy seems paralyzed. (Idris, 2010, p. 94)

## The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...

To sustain democracy the most important task is the continuity of constitutional rule. "It is also the desire of the people of Pakistan that under no circumstances the constitution should be disrupted. Regardless of whether a party is in power or in opposition, the democratic order must be sustained by two ways. Firstly, any military or extra-constitutional intervention must be resisted and a law should be introduced to punish not only to those who seek to illegal regime but also their supporters. Secondly, democracy can flourish if the government is accountable to the people" (Moudud Ahmed, 1995, p. 369)

The public would have the right to reform, alter or change their government by lawful means when they desire. It is the responsibility of the government to promote the general welfare. The legislative, the executive and the judiciary are the institutions have to work under separation of power. The military force should be under the control of the civilian executive branch and dependent on the legislature.

Chief justice Iftikhar Muhammad Chaudhry declared any action by the army without the direction of federal government would be unconstitutional, illegal having no legal effects. He further said that "the constitution was made to restrict the army to defend the borders of the country and safe ground of the constitution from adventurism". (No more Army, 2011).

## Conclusion

Pakistan remained in the hands of selfish uneducated politicians, feudal lords, bureaucrats, and military dictators that exploited the economic rights of the people by dividing them in to factions, groups and sects, fanning their ethnic identities through wrong policies for their own political interest. Political instability, break down of law and order, corruption and attacks on judiciary became usual things. (Chadda, 2003, p. 67) These factors are proving hurdles in the assimilation of small ethnic groups.

The democratic forces come in power. The democratic leadership is feeling the actual realization of people. Therefore trends of governance have been changing. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment has resorted the provincial autonomy and supremacy of parliament. The importance of consensus, reconciliation, accommodation and dialogue has been increasing day by day. Major political parties' are agreed upon the supremacy of the constitution.

The main issue is the implementation of constitutions in Pakistan. The constitutional structure remained failed to maintain the check and balance on the operational machinery of state institutions. In all three constitutions there was no check and balance system on the executive. In Pakistan federalism never worked satisfactorily and previous constitutions changed because federating units demanded provincial autonomy. The issues that arose within the framework of the political and constitutional debates can be divided into three main categories: the religion in Pakistani politics, the issues of center and provinces, and the national



language issue. The military is only the most powerful institution that cannot be challenged because no other institution is given such importance, finance, concentration and free hand in its internal matters as army. It easily takes over power of government.

### **Recommendations**

The government would have to stop military operation in Baluchistan before starting dialogue for peace restoration in the province. Government policies like Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Baluchistan package cannot remove ethnic difference and violence practically until government heal the wounds of the Bloch instead of fanning violence through contradictory statements. Frontier Corps is responsible for serious security threats. Extra judicial killings should be stopped; missing persons should be recovered and ensure that no government secret agency will harass Bloch people.

The constitutional provisions are needed to protect the rights of all ethnic minorities including provisions for the protection and development of their language, culture, economy and human rights. Steps must be taken to achieve integration among the various communities of Pakistan to avoid great conflict and bloodshed. The constitution is only the key to protect the rights of ethnic minorities on controversial issues.

The rule of law binds people to constitutional limits to cure to the basic rights of people. The constitutional model of government proved helpful and satisfactory for the assimilation with federation. The issue of Baluchistan can be resolved under the Constitution and public of Baluchistan will also contented in the frame of constitution. The constitution can secure their rights. The feelings of deprivation are minimized with provincial autonomy. The NFC and CCI are suitable constitutional forums to resolve all the issue related to Baluchistan. There is restricts on to them who demanded the unconstitutional step to change the civil governments.

### **Bibliography**

- No more Army. (2011, November 1). *Daily Times*. Islamabad.
- No More Military Adventurism' Daily Time. (2011, November 14). Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Ahmad, M. (2001). *Nawaz Sharif, Politics of Business*. Karachi: Royal Book Company .
- Ahsan, I. (2009, September 11). [Musharraf's Trial] *The Nation*, 11-09-2009, p.6. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Anwar Syed. (2010, March). Pakistan: Democracy as an Issue Digest of Current Affairs & Pakistan Affairs. *Stabilizing Democracy*. Punjab, Pakistan: Doger Sons Publishers Lahore.
- Chadda, M. (2003). *Building Democracy in South Asia India, Nepal, and Pakistan*. New Delhi: Vistar Publication.
- Cookman, C. (2010, April 19). The 18th Amendment and Pakistan's Political Transitions. Center for American Progress.

- The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...
- Darity, W. A. (2008 2nd ed). *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*. Detroit : Macmillan Reference USA.,
- Editorial. (2011, November 07). *Killings in Baluchistan Continue*. Islamabad: Daily Times .
- Grare, F. (2006, January). Pakistan: The Resurgence of Baluch Nationalism. *Pakistan: The Resurgence of Baluch Nationalism*. . Washington, DC, USA: Carnegie Papers (65).
- Harrison, S. (1981). *In Afghanistan's shadow: Baluch nationalism and Soviet temptations*. Washington DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace .
- Harrison, S. S. (2009). Ethnic Conflict and the Future of Pakistan. In W. John, *Pakistan: The Struggle Within* (pp. 18-128). Dehali: Dorling Kindersley India, Pvt Ltd, 2009.
- ICG. (2006). *Pakistan: The Worsening Conflict in Baluchistan- Asia Report N°119*. International Crisis Group.
- Idris, K. (2010, February). (Pakistan: Need for Impartial Bureaucracy), Rule of Law & Civil Service. *Digest of Current Affairs & Pakistan Affairs*, Dogar Sons Publishers Lahore,.
- Jamil, M. (2011, April 13). The Mayhem in Baluchistan, The Nation. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Jamil, M. (2011, April 13). The Mayhem in Baluchistan, The Nation. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Khan, A. S. (2011, November). *Policy Analysis of Education in Balochistan*. Retrieved November 15, 2014, from United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO): [:http://unesco.org.pk/education/documents/situationanalysis/Education](http://unesco.org.pk/education/documents/situationanalysis/Education)
- Kukreja, V. (2003). *Veena Kukreja, Contemporary Pakistan*. New Dehli: Sage Publications India Pvt.
- Mahmood, S. (2007, January). Current Affairs Digest, *Internal Conflicts*. Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan: A.H. Publishers Lahore.
- Memon, A. N. (1997). *Pakistan: Islamic Nation in Crisis*. Lahore: Vanguard Books Pvt Ltd .
- Moudud Ahmed. (1995). *Democracy and the Challenges of Development*. New Dehli: Vikas Publishing House Pvt Ltd.
- Mujahid, A. B. (2012). Balochistan and Eighteenth Amendment. *Pakistan Vision Vol. 13 Issue 2, p145* .
- Nadeem, A. H. (2002). *Pakistan the Political Economy of Lawlessness*,. Oxford: Oxford University Press .
- Nasr, V. (n.d.). Current Affairs Digest ed by. (Safdar Mahmood). *Military Rule Islamism and Democracy in Pakistan, (Quoted in)* . Pakistan: Current Affairs Digest.
- Pakistan, G. o. (2009). Population Census Organization. *Pakistan Statistical Year Book*. Islamabad, Pakistan: Statistics Division, Federal Bureau of Statistics, Government of Pakistan.
- Rashid, Q. (2011, December 14). Address the Bloch Grievances, Daily Times. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Reilly, B. (2006). *Democracy and Diversity: Political Engineering in the Asia Pacific*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Sanjay Dutt. (2000). *Inside Pakistan 52 Years Outlook*. New Dehli : A.P.H Publishing Corporation .
- Shahbaz Rana. (2009, January 29). Baluchistan needs Justice, Fairness, The Nation. IslamAbad, Pakistan.
- Suleri, A. Q. (2009, May). Baluchistan Woes (Quoted in) . *Digest of Current Affairs and Pakistan Affairs, Dogar Sons Lahore* , pp. 84-85.

**Democratization and Local Body Election in the Punjab: The Study of Local Election 2015 in District Bahawalnagar**

By

- 1. Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim**  
Director Colleges Bahawalpur Division Bahawalpur
- 2. Prof. Dr. Razia Musarrat**

---

**ABSTRACT**

*The work has focused on significance of local governing system. The local government system is back bone of democratic system. The local government institution drills for democratization in states the masses avail opportunity for participation in decision making process at lowest level. The public participation can be enhanced in democratic process. The objective of study is to observe voting behavior and its impact on democratization. The political parties and biradery system has significant role in local bodies election. The empirical study will be adopted in district Bahawalnagar in local body election 2015. The election of local body will prove fruitful for democratization.*

**Key Points:** Historical Background; Demography; Ethnic issue; Local body Election

**Introduction**

Pakistan is divided on basis of religion, region, language and race which has impact on democratic system of Pakistan. Pakistan mostly remained under authoritarian pattern of governance. The authoritarian era established local body institution to flourish democratic process. The cure of polarized and immature society is the local body system. The power sharing is at local level through the elected representative at local unit. (Ayoob, September 1985)

The local body elections are contested on ethnic as well as political based issues of different political parties. The major focus of contesting candidates is local issues on ethnic grounds. Pakistan is ideological state on religion. The constitutional development has major focus on this basis. The ethnic issues are defined as following. Davos defined as, "An ethnic group is a self-perceived inclusion those who hold in common a set of traditions not shared by others with when they are in contact. Such traditions typically include folk, religious belief and practices, language, a sense of historical continuity and common ancestry or place of origin." (Crystal, 1991). Cambridge Encyclopedia describes as, "It is

group of individuals identified on the bases of race, color, language and territory”. (Cashmore, 1988)

Ethnic group was elaborated in Encyclopedia Britannica, “A social group or category of population that in a larger society is set apart and bound together by common ties of race, language, nationality or culture. As a general case, at the core of ethnic identification is what has been termed as primordial affinities and attachments derived from the place of birth, kinship relationship, religion, language, and social practices that come natural to an individual to attach him to other individuals from the same background. These attachments remain in the unconscious and can be rekindled by appropriate stimuli” (Ahmed, June 1984).

The history of Pakistan has been recognized with different unconstitutional decisions that have deep impact on the democratic institutions. The paper deals electoral aspects of local body 2015 for democratization in district Bahawalnagar of Punjab. The analysis will be made on the impact of Biradarism and political parties in these elections that has significant impact on democratization.

### **Historical Background**

The world states followed charter of United Nation at different issues. United Nation focused on local government that described about the organization that was controlled suitable means. This organization was elected through election by people. The organization has authority for imposing taxes. The French scholar De Tocqueville said, “Respect of local assemblies of citizens constitutes the strength of free nation. A nation may establish a free government system. But without municipal institution, it may not be the spirit of liberty”. (Ch., 1994, p. 7)

Laski said: “We cannot realize the full benefit of a democratic government, unless we start recording all the problems are not major problems, and that the results of problems, not the center of their appearance, requiring the decision to place and people, where and by who the incidence is most deeply felt” (Malik, 2006, p. 16)

The panchayet system functioned in villages of subcontinent. Panchayet is an old institution of decision making at village level. The institution is consisted of authority of elders. The authority made decisions related to public life of people and implement these decisions. This authority maintained law and order in villages. In the Mughal era powers of these institutions enhanced. These institutions were made responsible for to financial, religious, and other public issues. These institutions were made for rulings system (Saran, 1994, pp. 246-52). The Muslim emperor introduced new trends of governance for implementation of democratic system at grass root level in the subcontinent. First of all district governments established in era of Sher Shah Shori 1529-1545. He divided his states in 47 departments or Sarkars. (Ahmad, 1997, p. 339). The British Government introduced different pattern of local system in Subcontinent. Lord Ripon was introduced in Lahore in 1850 and 1882 that proved fruitful for the democratization in Pakistan. (Ahmad, 1997, pp. 44-45).

## **Historical Background of Local Body Election in Pakistan**

Pakistan was facing serious challenges of democratization since the independence time. The institutional development was major concern of society and state. The constitution was not framed. Therefore, there was challenge to hold election in Pakistan. The political elite were not focusing on the development of democratic process in Pakistan. There was delay in the formulation of Constitution that provided state structure. Ayub Khan inducted local body governing system was. Later on, local government system institution was declared as Electoral College for Presidential election. The local body system was known as Basic Democracies. These basic democrats were awarded authority to resolve local issues. The basic democrats system was implemented from October 27, 1959. (Tinker, 1968). These members were elected by people who shaping democracy. The union council is the lowest tier of political system. It was comprised of specific strength of members. These members were elected on the principle of adult franchise. The higher tier of official of local government was elected indirect method and some were nominated by the government. (Rizvi, 1976).

Ayub Khan introduced local body democratic institution at grass root. Three tiers of this system but administrative level some official were also nominated as head of basic democrat institutions. The controlling authorities were government bureaucrats. "The Basic Democracies Scheme (was) not, in reality, democracy, for it (did) not represent control by the people over government power except in an extremely limited manner" (Friedman, 1960, p. 144) .

Local body elections were held in 1979, 1983, 1987 and 1991 in Pakistan. General Zia-ul-Haq held local body elections on non-party basis for the public participation in the governing issues at local level. (Wilder A. R., 1999, pp. 85-87). The head of local governments were the chairmen. The local body elections were not held during the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto democratic government. The devolution power plane was implemented in 2001 by Pervez Musharraf. The Local Government Ordinance that was implemented in each province in 2001 as, Baluchistan LGO 2001, North West Frontier LGO 2001, Punjab LGO 2001 and Sindh LGO 2001. (The Punjab Gazette 8th October 2001., 2001). The local body ordinance specified that the election held under supervision of the Chief Elections Commissioner. (Constitution). The local body elections were held through constitutional institution. The electoral process was fruitful for the establishment of democratic institutions in Pakistan.

The local representatives elected on non-party basis under new devolution power plan. The new local body set up was consisted of Nazims and Naib Nazims at three stages as union councils, tehsil councils and district councils. The devolution power plan proved as nursery of future political leadership in Pakistan. The prominent political families having influence in the respective areas performed in the new local body elections. (Khan, 2004, p. 12)

The local body institutions established in five phases in Pakistan. The devolution plane was implemented through gradually purpose of elections that were started from small cities to big cities. The next coming phase was reformed from the observation of last phase of election. The first phase of elections was held on December 31, 2000. This phase consisted of eight districts of Punjab three districts of Sindh, four districts from KPK and three from Baluchistan. The 2<sup>nd</sup> phase of election for the devolution power plane was conducted on the March 21, 2001. It contained nine districts from Punjab, five districts from Sindh five districts from KPK and one from Baluchistan. The 3<sup>rd</sup> phase of election was conducted on May 31, 2001. This phase of election encircled the Faisalabad district from Punjab, two districts from Sindh, one district from KPK and five districts of Baluchistan. The fourth phase held in July 2001 in all the provinces. The fifth phases of elections of devolution power plane were held in 2001 in all the provinces. (Khan, 2004, pp. 11-13)

The local body elections were held in two phases from August to October 2005. 53 districts were included in first phase for local body elections. The elections were conducted for councilors, nazims and naib nazims of union councils on Thursday, August 18, 2005. The 2<sup>nd</sup> phase of elections held on August 25, 2005 in 54 districts of four provinces. Election Commission of Pakistan conducted the elections for the position of members of Zilla Councils and Tehsil/Taluka council or town councils against the seats reserved for women, peasants/workers and minority communities. Further the Nazim and Naib Nazim of district and tehsil councils were also elected on Thursday, October 6, 2005. It was democratic process in which people was elected their representatives for local democratic system. These elected leaders should have to responsible for strengthening the democratic system of governance. The performance of local body institution was helpful to enhance the public participation. These local leaders may be elected for provincial and national level in future. "The Provincial Assembly passed local government law on August 23, 2013, the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 (XVIII of 2013), by replacing the Punjab Local Government Ordinance, 2001, (XIII of 2001). Later, on 13th September, 2013, vide Notification No. SOR (LG) 39-20/2013, issued under sub-section (3) of section 1 of the aforesaid Act, all provisions of the Act except section 154 thereof dealing with repeal of 2001 Ordinance were enforced with immediate effect." (2014, p. 7)

### **Demography of District Bahawal Nagar**

The demographic position of Bahawalnagar is mentioned.<sup>1</sup> It is included in biggest districts of Pakistan with population of 2061447 in 1998. It is estimated 2603000

---

<sup>1</sup> The location of Bahawalnagar is as 30.55° in North latitude and 73.39° in East longitude. The elevation height above from the sea level is 159 meters. District Bahawal Nagar has covered an area of

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... till December 2011 that is consists of urban population is 496000 while rural population is 2107000. (Book, 2011) Asia. The local as well as migrated people are part of population of district Bahawal Nagar since 1947. The people belong to rich culture and heritage. The inhabitants of this region are having deep interest in agriculture during era of Nawab of Bahawalpur. Therefore Nawab has taken keen interest in development of the irrigation system for this region. The major source of irrigation is the River Sutlej. The major populated areas located near river Sutlej. The main tribes and sub tribes are arain the decadents of Umayyad Arab soldiers who arrived with Muhammad Bin Qasim, rajput, malik, jatt, cheema, mahar, lodi (pathan), bhatti, paracha, hotiana, wattoo, gorgani, joyia, sukheras, khkwani, chishti and many other small clans. Most progressive landlords are basically cheema, paracha, wattoo, arian. These tribes have a great contribution in the politics of district Bahawalnagar. (H A Rose) . The identity of race is become source of ethnicity. The ethnic issue polarized the public opinion on prejudice of race. The democratic process helped to minimizing the issues. The continuous process to hold elections proved fruitful for the democratic process.

The district Bahawalnagar consisted of five tehsils Bahawalnagar, Haroonabad, Minchin Abad, Chishtian and Fort Abbas. There is one town committee Dunga Bunga. The major towns are Mecload Gunj, Mandi Sadiq Gunj, Faqirwali, Madrisa, Dahrnawala, Yateemwala, Maroot and Dunga Bunga. The major villages of Bahawal Nagar district are harnwala Ratteka, Neza Jodheka, khokran wali, Kharajpura, Ghulab Ali, Maharwali, Takhat Mehal, Bala Arain, Fateh Kot, Mandi Gorgan, Qaziwala and Bukhshan Khan, Nathywala, basti Mohallan, Panjkosi, Maqsood Abad (Basti Langah), Jenjeranwali, and Togera Sharif.

### **Electoral Politics of District Bahawal Nagar**

The political ideology had always dominance on the society that functioned as major factor to determine the nature of existed political system at the local and national level in the state. The local body election remained failed to weaken the influence of biradarries in the electoral process for democratization. The band of biradery has strong impact on the parliamentary elections for national and provincial elections. It was seen in the opinion of Andrew Wilder,

*“The 1985 National and Provincial Assemblies elections demonstrated that Local Body politics had become the entry point into Provincial and National politics. According to one press account 124 of the 240 members elected to the Punjab Provincial Assembly were sitting members of Local Body. It meant that Provincial and National politics began to resemble Local Body politics. Patronage politics became the order of the day, and representing personal and constituent interests became much more*

---

8,878 square kilometers. North-South length of the district is 128.5 kilometers. It has width from East West 69 kilometers



*important for legislators than representing national interests and this put the PPP, which had not actively participated in Local Body politics, at a severe disadvantage". (Wilder A. R., 1999, p. 133)*

The major villages, towns have biradery basis ethnic issue. The Bahawal Nagar district has single dominant language Punjabi. Therefore, there are no ethnic issues on language, region or religion base. The major ethnic issue based on biradery or caste system. This issue has great impact on electoral politics in district Bahawalnagar. There majority of candidates used such slogans in the election and consequently, got success in the election on the ethnic base issue. The issue of ethnicity has deep impact on the democratization.

Punjabi was the main language of district Bahawalnagar according to census 1998. 1.85 million people speak which accounts 90%. of population. National language, Urdu is spoken widely while English by educated elite. Riasti (Saraiki) is spoken by 3% (61843) of the district population. Haryanvi language is spoken by 0.1 million people. Total Christian population in this district is 12094 which makes it 0.59% of the total population of this district. The total Christian rural population is 8,063. The total Christian urban population is 4031 (Fatima, 2002). The ethnic conflict also based on language basis in Pakistan. The district bahawalnagar has no such issue. Therefore politicians could not in position to highlight languuistic ethnic aspect in electoal politics. There are other sub division of ethnicity in electoral politics that is linked on caste or bradherly system. It is significant aspect of electoral politics in district Bahawal Nagar. Therefore it is selected for study to evaluate findings for betterment of democratic proceess that will be fruitfull at grass root level.

The study of General Zia-ul\_Haq was concluded that biradarism factor was highlighted and emotionally attached with political activities. One other factor was also detrimental for the political system was localization of politics. It was political legacy of Zia in Pakistan.

The shift of local identity that was attached with biradarism was ingredient of politics of Punjab. The loyalty with political system was determined through family, groups or biradari roots. The trends of local politics diverted political mechanism for formulation and implementation of public policy. It should have to deal the national interests instead of thana katchari issues. The local body organizations should have to deal jobs for unemployed youth, welfare fund, and community development. There should be strategy to divert the decision making process from national level to local level. It is based on the decentralization model of governance. The biradarism issue in the election enhanced the ethnic issue in Pakistan. Such ethnic issue increased the polarization in the politics. There was multi-level division, as biradari, religion sects and language. The political polarization had deep impact on the political parties. The polarization split the political parties into small groups and regional parties. The political parties are tool of democratic process.

## **Local Body Administration 2015**

## The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...

The basic unit of local government is the union council of district government and is primary institution of democratic process. The masses of local unit have right to select their representative for local decision making process. Union council is defined under the local government act 2013 as, "A union council shall be an area consisting of one or more revenue estates or, in the case of an area where revision of settlement under the law has not taken place, one or more census villages or, in the case of an urban area, a census block or blocks as determined for purposes of the last preceding census or a census block or blocks and a revenue estate or revenue estates, delimited and notified as such by the Election Commission." (Composition of Local government, 2013, p. 4). The limitation of boundaries made on population basis for the local elections 2015. There were great concerns for de-limitation of union councils. The union was consisted of chairman and vice chairman with six councilors that were elected on basis of adult suffrage by public through electoral process. (Composition of Local government, 2013, p. 5)

The basic structure of local body institution was union council that was delimited on the population basis. The grass root democratic institution was union council. All the process was creating political awareness in the people. The people were involved in the process keenly. The interest made them responsible for local government institution responsibilities.

There were two pattern local government institutions in Punjab. There were city municipal committees comprised of city councilors of urban areas. The union councils were formulated lawfully after national based census. There was no census conducted after 1998. The issue was raised by the provincial government that first of all population census is conducted then local body election process will be started. The Supreme Court of Pakistan decided and ordered to all provincial governments and Chief Election Commission of Pakistan for the conduct of local body election. Therefore population census of 1998 is based for formulation of union councils for local body election 2015.

The delimitation for union council was basic requirement for the election of local body. The union councils were formulated on the population basis. The de-limitation was critical issue linked with democratization. The transparency was needed to establish union councils on the requirement based, not on the political based. The transparency in the formulation of union council was also needed for the transparent and fair election that was basic component for democratization. There were district council represent the rural areas. The names of union councils included in district councils are given in table no1. The urban areas voters elected the councilors for the municipal committees of respective tehsil headquarters and Donga Bongs town Committee of district Bahawal Nagar. The rural areas nazim of union council should have to elect the chairman of zala councils. City municipal committee strength is given in the table as,

Table No 2

## Strength of City Municipal Committees District Bahawal Nagar

Name Municipal Committee	No of Councilors
Bahawal Nagar	47
Chishtian	36
Haronabad	24
Minchin Abad	12
Fort Abbas	12
Dunga Bunga	08

Source: Election Commission of Pakistan ( Notification, 2015, pp. 2-3)

The voter strength of district Bahawal Nagar was 1367541 in 2007 that were reduced to 1183826 in 2011 due to elimination of bogus votes. The total voter strength of district Bahawalnagar was 1122702 in which male 646203 and female 476499 voters registered in the voter list for local election 2015.

The transparent voter list was basic need to hold election on the fair basis. There was major issue of rigging about the general election 2013. The transparent voter rolls were concerned for the transparent electoral process. The major issue was the conduction of population census to update the electoral lists of voters. The democratic process was based on the electoral process that was attached with updated of data related to electoral process. The census of population was also considered as the primary need of democratization. The democratic process could be promoted with such transparent decisions. The popular public will should also have to stand with such decisions for the betterment of democratization in the Pakistan. The last population census report of district Bahawal Nagar was given bellow in the table tehsil wise,

Table No 3

## Population 1998 of District Bahawalnagar Tehsil Wise

CO Unit	Population 1998			Population in 1981	Increase in Population
	Both Sexes	Males	Females		
Bahawal Nagar	541553	282987	258566	367367	2.31
Chishtian	498270	256122	242148	326790	2.51

## The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...

Tehsil					
Fort Abbas Tehsil	285596	147371	138225	195476	2.25
Haronabad	381767	196155	185612	258276	2.32
Minchin Abad	354261	184776	169485	225838	2.68
Total	2061447	1067411	994036	1373747	2.41

(Report F. A., 2008 )

The local body elections for general seats were held on October 31, 2015 in first phase of election scheme. The elections for reserved seats conducted on December 17, 2015. After that elected councilors meet for municipals committees and District Councils selection were summoned to gather on the specific place on fixed date to elect the members for the reserved seats. The chairmen and vice chairmen are selected of the District Council in the First Schedule, with the majority of those present and voting. (Www.electionpakistani.com).

There was great delay in the selection of District Councils and Municipal Committee's chairman. The delay in the local body institution complete formulation was not matched with democratic norms. The local body institution played the key role for democratic process in Pakistan. The undemocratic decisions created distrust in the people. Several time made changes in the local government law. It led to un-matured decisions with accordance of democratization. The democratic government should have to complete the process of local body institution. It will be fruitful to develop the public awareness in the public to enhance the public participation. The public participation should be helpful to strengthen the democratic process. The following strength is given in the table for reserved seats for the specific segment of society.

Table No 4  
The Reserved Seats in Municipals Committee

Name Of Tehsil	Seats for Women	Seats for Peasant	Seats for Non-Muslim	Seats for Youth
Bahawalnagar	05	02	02	01
Haronabad	05	01	01	-
Chishtian	05	02	02	-
Minchin Abad	03	01	01	-
Fort Abbas	03	01	01	-
Dunga Bunga	02	01	01	-

Source: www.ecp.gov.pk

These elected members vote for reserve seats. There are reserved seats for two women, one for worker, one for young and one non-Muslim. There are two hundred registered voters in union council. This is condition for non-Muslim councilor in union councils. There were seats reserved for the peasant, women and non-Muslims at union council, tehsil and district level. (2014, p. 7) There are reserved seats for district councils fifteen for women, three for peasant, five for non-Muslim and one for technocrats. These segments were not in position to participate in direct election and contested in competition of others. The seats were made reserve to balance the issue representation of different segment of society. (Composition of Local government, 2013, p. 5). The city councilors are elected from cities of municipal committees and town committee. The chairmen and vice chairmen are elected in union councils of district Bahawalnagar. The councilors for general seats are elected in union councils of district Bahawalnagar. The strength of union councils of district Bahawal Nagar is given in the table as,

Table No 5  
Union Council wise Population of District Bahawalnagar

Tehsil	Number of U.C	Voter's Strength		
		Male	Female	Total
Bahawalnagar	32	150194	109831	260025
Chishtian	33	158013	118350	276363
Haroonabad	25	122342	91662	214004
Fort Abbas	20	99493	70090	169583
Minchin Abad	25	116161	86566	202727
Grand Total	135	646203	476499	1122702

Source: Election Commission of Pakistan (Report, 2012)

Although nazims were gained votes biradarries basis but influence was minimized during local body election 2015. The political ideology has dominance in political activities. The important factor is voting behavior and public participation in electoral process. The caste, clan and biradery has significant role in elections at local level. The political parties have to keep view in selection of candidates for contesting election.

The elections are conducted on October 30, 2015 for rural councilors, chairman and vice chairman. The same day voting held for urban or city councilors of five tehsils of district Bahawal Nagar. The local body elections are conducted on the party basis. Although the Punjab Government wanted to conduct local body election on the non-party basis but Election Commission announced for the conduct of these election on the party basis. The political parties took full interest in the local body election. The public has to decide for the selection of

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization... their representative for establishment local governing system set up. There are 135 union councils in district Bahawalnagar. ( Notification, 2015, p. 2). The detail results with casting percentage tehsil wise given in the table as,

Table No 6  
Result Sheet of Local Election 2015

Name of Tehsil	Total Union Council Strength	Total Votes			Total Casting Votes			Male %	Female %
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total		
Bahawal Nagar	32	150194	109831	260025	109480	75355	184835	73%	68.7%
Chishtian	33	158013	118350	276363	105361	76198	181559	66.6%	64.24%
Haronabad	25	122342	91662	214004	78478	60321	138799	64.24%	65.96%
Fort Abbas	20	99493	70090	169583	69546	49850	119396	69.95%	71.2%
Minchin Abad	25	116161	86566	202727	83170	57438	140600	72%	66.5%

Source: www.ecp.gov.pk (Election Results Union Councils wise, 2016)

The casting rate in the local election 2015 is sufficient. The public participation in the local body showed public interest for the democratization at local level in the form of local body election 2015. The public showed their affiliation with democratic system under the leadership of democratic civil leadership. The second stage of local body administration is selection of chairman tehsil council or city council. The chairmen are members of District Council of District Bahawalnagar. First of all members are selected on reserved seats. Then selection will be made of District Chairman and Vice Chairman of District Council of Bahawalnagar. The local body elections should also be conducted after specific interval of time for the public aspiration. So that people avail opportunity for the choice of local leadership that prove helpful to resolve local and basic need issues. Although elections are conducted for the direct selection of public representative of their own choice but minorities, peasant and women are such segments of society, have not worth for the contest election and selected for the representation of related segments. Therefore provincial governments decided that some seats made reserved for these segments of society.

The people got learning about the functions and performance of local government institutions. It proved helpful for the public participation in the electoral process and institutional development in the democratic process. The

public participation is the spirit of democratization. The local government election proves training institution for provincial and national level. These institutions provide leadership national level. The local body institution made decision process at the door step of people and people feel comfortable in the process. Therefore it is called grass root level government.

### **Conclusions**

The objective of the study is for the rationalization on the issue of biradari politics. The significance of biradari politics is study in elections of local body in Punjab. It is concluded that the biradari political process is the basis of local body authorities of politics and local body system. The bond of biradari has significant role and caused of serious divisions within the civil society for the voting system. The people are ready to stirring tribal quarrels on biradarism. They are ready to contest the next election. The dominant biradari has chance to win. The political parties supported such candidates having strong clan in the area. It is natural phenomenon that the people exercise their preference for ethnic group in case of aggression against other.

There are some positive aspects also concluded in the study. The focus of local body election is biradari. It is helpful to minimize the gap between different political parties. The competition between either political parties or different biradarities is essential feature of democracy. It is spirit of democracy. The biradari system offers sense of safety to members of respective clans. It is source of energy for the millions of member. It provides identity. It is system of kinship. There are social activities in which members are involved in the biradari system. These are occurred frequently. These are not happened in the political parties set up with similar scale. Ayub Khan introduced grass root level democracy in the controlled democracy model. General Zia-ul-Haq promoted the biradarism in the local body election. The non-party basis election provided the support to ethnicity. General Musharraf had no intention for the involvement of biradarism in the local body election under the devolution plane. Local body elections strengthen local body governing system which is fruitful to promote democratization. local body system provides political leadership to democratic system.

### **Recommendations**

The political awareness is the social fabric of society. There are some proposals in the study to eradicate the social structure of the productive role of the biradarism in the society of Pakistan. The local authorities of urban and rural areas have to resolve the local issues at local level. The local authorities has the check and balance system. The constructive role of biradarism is fruitful for the establishment of national policies at national level. The elections of district nazims are conducted on the party basis. The candidates run their campaign with specific ideology. It is beyond the biradarism impact. Such decisions forced the different biradarities to made consensus to win the election. There is fear and doubts that nazims offer jobs and facilitate their respective biradarities. It is needed to resolve to such doubts.

## The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...

The political parties are needed to participate in local body elections. The participation of political parties strengthened at grass root level. The involvement of political parties in rural areas is fruitful in the promotion of democratic values in the country. The political activities based educational policies are indispensable to initiate at the grass root level. It is not in the trend in the society of Pakistan. The awareness related to the political activities is lead to the predominance of transparent and accountable system of local bodies. The local body institutions are the participatory institutions. These are complement of representative democracy. The officials have to decide if delegating decision-making authority to citizens coincides with their own interests. The elected representatives have to determine for accommodation of the demands that the citizens presented in participatory institutions within their broader electoral, intraparty, governing, and policy agendas. The minimize authority of delegate with the willingness of governments, it also has impact on the quality of the participatory program which then limits efforts to improve the quality of local democracy.

### **Bibliography**

The Punjab Gazette 8th October 2001. (2001, October 8). *Local Government Ordinance (LGO) (2001)*. Punjab: Government of Punjab.

Composition of Local government. (2013, August 23). *The Punjab Local Government Act 2013*. Lahore, Punjab: Government of Punjab.

(2014). *An Analysis of Local Government Status The Punjab And Khyber Pakhtunkhwa*. USA: U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID).

Notification. (2015, August 26). Islamabad, Pakistan: Election Commission of Pakistan.

(2015). *Data*. www.ecp.com.

(2016). *Election Results Union Councils wise*. Bahawal Nagar: District Election Commission Office .

Ahmad, S. (1997). *Public Administration: With Special Reference to Pakistan*. Lahore: Famous Books.

Ahmed, F. (June 1984). *Ethnicity, State and national Integration' in Asian Survey*. Asian Survey.

Ayoob, M. (September 1985). *Dateline Pakistan. A passage to anarchy, Foreign Policy No. 59*, 154-173.

Book, S. P. (2011). *Statistical Pocket Book Of The Punjab*, Bureau of Statistics. Lahore: Government of The Punjab.

Cashmore, E. E. (1988). *Dictionary of Ethnicity: Race and Ethnic Relations*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul. p.97.



- Ch., A. (1994). *Local Governments*. Karachi: Tahir Sons.
- Constitution. (n.d.). *Section 150, Local Government Ordinance 2001* . Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Crystal, D. (1991). *The Cambridge Encyclopedia*. London: Cambridge University.
- Fatima, Z. o.-P. (2002). *Federal Bureau of Statistics based on 1998*. Islamabad: Herald issue of October.
- Friedman, H. J. (1960, June). Pakistan's Experiment in Basic Democracies. *Pacific Affairs XXXIII*.
- H A Rose, v. I. (n.d.). *A glossary of the tribes and castes of the Punjab and North - West provinces VolIII*.
- Khan, S. R. (2004). *Pakistan under Musharraf (1999 – 2002). Economic reform and political Change. Ist Ed*. Islamabad: Vanguard Book.
- Malik, M. A. (2006). *Local Self Government in Pakistan*. Lahore: Publishers Emporium .
- Report. (2012). *District Statistical Office Bahawalnagar*. Bahawalnagar.
- Report, F. A. (2008 ). *Field Appraisal Report TMA Bahawal Nagar*. Punjab Municipal Development Fund Company.
- Rizvi, S. A. (1976). *Changing Patterns of Local Government in Pakistan*. Karachi: Pakistan Historical Society.
- Saran, P. (1994). *The Provincial Government of the Mughals 1526-1658*. Allahabad: Kitabistan.
- Tinker, H. (1968). *The Foundations of Local Self-Government in India, Pakistan*. New York: Praeger.
- Wilder, A. R. (1999). *The Pakistani Voter: Electoral Politics and Voting Behavior in the Punjab*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Wilder, A. R. (1999). *The Pakistani Voter: Electoral Politics and Voting Behavior in the Punjab*. Karachi: Oxford University Press. .
- Www.electionpakistani.com. (n.d.).

The Implementation of Constitutional Model through Democratization...

Table No 1

List of Union Councils of District Bahawalnagar

Tehsil	Name of Union Councils	Total
Bahawal nagar	1.Kala Shah, 2. Qasimka Otar, 3. Sanatteka, 4.Mominabad, 5.Mari main Sahab Otar, 6. Mosa Bhota, 7. Rojhan Wali, 8. Jhullan Arain, 9. Toba Qalinder Shah, 10 Muhammad Pur, 11.Kot Fateh Muhammad Shah, 12 Islampura, 13 Malak Pur, 14. Sawai Wala, 15. Korian Wali, 16. Dinan Wala, 17. Soonda, 18. Ghulabali, 19. Teku Ram Pura, 20. Bara Sajwar Khan, 21. Khattan, 22, Khetran Wala, 23. Nathu Dhacca, 24. Jand Wala Kalan, 25 Kishan Garh, 26. Noor Sar, 27. Nathe Wala, 28. Mahar Wali, 29. Ganga Sing, 30. Rab Nawaz Pura, 31. Takht mahal, 32 Kapuran	32
Minchin Abad	1.Dault pur, 2. Laleka, 3. Bachyan wali, 4. Fadai Shah, 5. Said Ali, 6. Shahbazpur 7. Bunga Akbar Mari Nihal, 8. Behramka, 9.Khola Mirzaka, 10. Peer Garh Chisti, 11.Ahmad pur Macleod Gunj, 12. Hassan Wala, 13. Lala Amer Singh, 14. Hasil Saru, 15 Mat Wala, 16. Bhole Wala, 17. Mandi Sadiq Gunj, 18. Qaimpur, 19. Giriabad, 20. Ber Wala 21.Behkan Wala 22.Rohana, 23. Muhammad Pur Sansaran, 24. Toba Baluchan, 25. Kabutry	25
Chishtian	1.Chak Sadiq Nagar, 2. Sheli Gharbi, 3. Dula Bahdera, 4 Shahar Farid, 5. Sodh, 6. Maharani Sharif, 7. Jhedwan, 8. Mehta Jhedue, 9, Qabool Fatani, 10. Mari Shauq Shah, 11. Chak No 4/G, 12. Chak No 3/ F.W, 13. Chak No 28/G, 14. Cahk No 35/F, 15. Chak No 23/G, 16. Chak No 42/F, 17. Chak No 40/F, 18. Chak No.118/M, 19. Chak No.128/M, 20. Chak No.112/M, 21.Chak No. 98/F, 22. Chak No. 201/M, 23. Chak No 169/M, 24. Chak No.173/M, 25. Chak No.177/M, 26. Chak No.95/F, 27. Chak No 167/M, 28. Chak No134/M, 29. Chak No.45/F, 30. Chak No.54/F, 31. Chak No.5/FW, 32. Chak No.9/FW, 33. Chak No 10/ FW	33
Fort Abbas	1.Chak No 327/H-R, 2.Chak No.319/H-R, 3.Chak No.311/HR, 4. Chak No 330/H-R, 5. Chak No.281/H-R, 6. Chak No.176/7-R, 7. Chak No 187/7-R, 8. Chak No.167/7-R. 9. Chak No 304/H-R, 10. Chak No 296/H-R, 11. Chak No 213/H-R, 12. Chak No 226/H-R, 13. Chak No 185/7-R, 14. Chak No.209/9-R, 15. Chak No 260/H-R, 16. Chak No.264/H-R, 17. Chak No 289/H-R, 18. Chak No.204/9-R, 19. Chak No.199/8R, 20. Chak No.238/9R,	20
Haroon Abad	1.Chak No.30/3-R, 2. Chak No.42/3-R, 3. Chak No.33/3-R, 4. Chak No.23 /3-R, 5. Chak No.20/3-R, 6. Chak No.101/6R, 7. Chak No.15/1-R, 8. Chak No.94/6-R, 9. Chak No 98/6-R, 10. Chak No.142/6-R, 11.Chak No.133/6R, 12. Chak No.132/6R, 13. Chak No.58/4R, 14. Chak No.62/4R.13. Chak No.58/4R, 14. ChakNo.432/6R, 15. Chak No.86/5R, 16. Chak No.164/7R, 17. Faqir Wali I, 18. Faqir Wali II, 19. Chak No.150/2-L, 20. Chak No. 152/2-L, 21. Chak No.71/4-R, 22. Chak No.118/6-R, 23, Chak No.109/6-R, 24. Chak No.438/6-R,	25

(Data, 2015)

**Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan: A Case Study of Baba Guru Nanak's  
Dev Shrine - Kartarpur**

By

**Sara Iftikhar**

Research Officer Government College University, Lahore

---

**Abstract:**

*Pakistan is a place where people belonging to different cultures and religions are residing together. The founder of Pakistan Quaid e Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah gifted liberty to the minorities in Pakistan and constitution of Pakistan safeguards the fundamental rights of Non-Muslims. Non-Muslim Minorities in Pakistan (Sikhs, Hindus and Christians etc.) have awarded freedom to go their religious places for practicing their religious obligations. Government of Pakistan has established Evacuee Trust Property Board under Act No. XIII of 1975 (which was promulgated on 1st July 1974) for management, control and disposal of the Evacuee Trust properties all over Pakistan. Undoubtedly, Pakistan is a Muslim majority country with multi-religious and multi-sectarian population. Though, we keep hearing about events of inter and intra religious intolerance every now and then. This research papers gives a comprehensive detail about the interfaith harmony at Shrines in Pakistan in order to prove that all the news we are getting through print media, electronic media or social media about religious intolerance in Pakistan is only one side of picture. Withal throwing light on the interfaith harmonious culture at Shrines, it aims to explore the concept of religious harmony or interfaith harmony. This paper briefly encapsulates the background of different shrines in Pakistan and the communities visiting them. It pinpoints the facts, reasons and sentiments of shrine visiting communities behind their astonishing attachment with the shrines. Following paper ripostes all the above raised questions with specific reference to the Guru Nanak's Dev Shrine in Kartarpur. In addition to this, it spotlights the efforts of Evacuee Trust Property Board in managing and controlling Guru Nanak's Dev Shrine. Lastly, it explains the roles of Sikh Yatress and Sikh Diaspora for allowing other religious communities to visit their 2nd most sacred place. Also, it unveils the roles of government and people of Pakistan in reviving Sikh community in Pakistan. The findings will encourage the multi- religious and multi-sectarian society to maintain and build a firm relationship among them.*

**Introduction:**

Pakistan, a multi-religious and multi sectarian country, is a home to 184 million people. Muslims make up 95 percent of total population. Among these 20-25 percent are Shia Muslims. Ahmadis and Christians each make up around for 2 percent of the total population. Moreover, Hindus, Sikhs, Buddhists, Parsis, and others account for the rest 1–2 percent. There are also small portions of Jains, Kihals and Kalasha. This diversity in population shows the need to develop a pluralistic society and an interfaith harmony so that people with different faiths

### **Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan...**

and beliefs can live together in peace. Pakistan as an Islamic Republic (according to the constitution of 1973) and Islam as religion of state safeguard rights of all citizens without any discrimination of religion and faith. In the light of the vision of founder of the Pakistan Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Islam has proved to be a protector of human rights, who clarified in his speech of August 11, 1947. "You may belong to any religion or caste or creed- that has nothing to do with the business of the state. We are starting with this fundamental principle that we are all citizens and equal citizens of one state." This manifests his commitment to the rights and interests of the religious minorities and encouragement of the interfaith harmony.

#### **Religious Harmony- interfaith Harmony – A concept:**

The concept of interfaith harmony implies for promoting tranquility and bringing peace among people belonging to different religions or different sects of same religion at the individual and institutional level by positivity. The interfaith harmony follows the dictum to live and let others live in peace. 'Religious harmony or interfaith harmony means the harmonious development within and between individual religions as well as between the religious community and the larger society which is realized through the dialogue-generated enhancement of mutual understanding and empathy and the sharing of the common responsibilities of peace and justice on the precondition of recognizing religious diversity and differences.' Quaid-e-Azam narrated interfaith harmony by spotlighting the rights of minorities in Pakistan: "Minorities to whichever faith they may belong, they will be safeguarded. Their religion or faith or belief will be secure. There will be no interference of any kind with their freedom of worship. They will have their rights and privileges and no doubt, along with it goes the obligation of citizenship".

#### **Literature Review:**

Though there is not any specific substantial research produced to date, which deals with interfaith harmony at shrines in Pakistan. A few studies have briefly highlighted the Sikh shrines in Pakistan and Sikh history before and after independence of Pakistan. Among these works Iqbal Qaiser's work produced in three languages in very important. His book gives information about the present Sikh Shrines in Pakistan. A most influential archeological study has been produced by Khan Muhammad Vali Ullah Khan in which he has given details of the Sikh Shrines in West Pakistan. Famous historian Ian Talbot has also done a consider work on Sikhs. In his works, he has mainly focused on the pre-partition circumstances and conditions of Sikhs. Unfortunately, none of his book gives us information about Sikh community after 1947 in Pakistan. A comprehensive information regarding Sikh History from their Gurdwaras (Sikh Shrines) to the partition of Punjab can be found in Dr. Muhammad Jahangir's work. He has also discussed

#### **Muslim-Sikh relationship:**

In recent studies: Akhtar Hussain Sandhu aimed at proving Punjab as a land of peace by discusses Punjab's cultural heritage, religious traditions, and intellectual movements. He majorly highlighted the role of Guru Nanak Dev as a founder of Sikhism and inhibitor of Kartarpur Sahib village. Shazmina Saher, Munira

Tharwani and Basit Zafar are of the view that the opening of Kartarpur Corridor shows involvement of Indian Punjab in Pakistani Punjab and a combined effort of both to lessen the resistance in language, culture and civilizations for developing a new attitude of society. B.S Goraya has employed Kartarpur as symbol of harmony where three major religions of the region converge. He also put the death of Guru Nanak Dev and his three intact mausoleums under discussion. Iqbal Singh Sevea examines Kartarpur corridor as an attempt to use religious diplomacy as a means for developing better trade and diplomatic ties. Sevea also throws light on few challenges and issues that must have to resolve before the opening of corridor. The view that Kartarpur success should be seen as a confidence-building measure between Pakistan and India in terms of religious tourism and people-to-people contact is put forwarded by Tanvi Kulkarni. He illustrated that it is a victory of sub-national diplomacy or para-diplomacy. Taranjeet Kaur Chawla, Rayaz Hassan & Daljeet Kaur aimed to throw light on the importance of Kartarpur among Sikh Devotees. They also examined Kartarpur as a site for religious tourism and how it is developing the region's economic growth and boosting tourism industry in both countries. Raashid Wali Janjua employed that in a land of servants and saints Kartarpur is a metaphor for inter faith harmony. He supported the concept that Kartarpur is place of tolerance and religious pluralism. Dawood Mamoon has highlighted that Pakistan being a religious democracy is also giving space for secular voices. He says that opening of Kartarpur Corridor for Non-Muslims is a perfect example of this. Muqarrab Akbar and Hafsa Yaseen has figured out the meaning of interfaith harmony in Pakistan. By conducting a quantitative research among people mostly from South Punjab region they analyzed the state policies towards Non-Muslims and tried to find out that whether interfaith harmony prevails in Pakistan.

### **Interfaith Harmonious Culture at Shrines:**

Pakistan is a country having hundreds of the shrines of Sufis and Saints, and holy places related to Muslims, Sikhs, Buddhists, and Christians. There are many shrines (Muslim and Non-Muslim) in Punjab, Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa attracting many people from different religious communities all over the world. Among these some of the famous Muslim shrines are: Abdullah Shah Ghazi (d. 773 ad) shrine in Karachi attracts not Muslims but also Hindus and Christians. Thousands of devotees from across the country – from all religious backgrounds – Sunni, Shia, Hindu, Christian, Sikh, Parsi come to pay homage to Lal Shahbaz Qalandar's shrine (d. 1275) in Sewand every Thursday and participate in dhamaal – ecstatic devotional dance. Amidst many Muslim and Non-Muslim devotees of Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai (d. 1752) , there is a Hindu devotee Ishwar Das who has been living there since last twenty years trying to facilitate the visitors by collecting their shoes or pouring water in glasses. Moreover, millions of devotees from different religions are into visiting shrines of Data Ganj Bakhsh Ali Hajvery, Mian Mir, Shah Jamal, Bibian Pak Daman, Madhu Laal Hussain in Lahore, , Baba Farid in Pakpattan, Bullai Shah in Kasur, Shah Daula in Gujrat. Mian Sher Muhammad Sharaquri, Jamat Ali Shah Ameer e Millat and Jamat Ali Shah Saani in Narowal, Sufi Barkat Ali in Faisalabad and Mazar Ashab Baba in Peshawar, where visitors come in large numbers to seek spiritual satisfaction as well as social welfare benefits.

### **Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan...**

Non-Muslim shrines in Pakistan also magnetize people of different communities. Interfaith harmony has been found in Udero Lal , located in Tando Adam, Sindh where both Muslims and Hindus claim that the saint Udero Lal belongs to them. Most important Sikh shrines Gurudwara Janam Asthan Sahib, Nankana Sahib, Gurudwara Panja Sahib, Hasan Abdal ,Gurudwara Darbar Sahib, Kartarpur ,Gurudwara Dera Sahib, Lahore, Gurdwara Sacha Sauda, Farooqabad, Sheikhpura and Gurudwara Rori Sahib, Eminabad are visited majorly by Sikhs, Hindus (for practicing religious obligations) and Muslims (mostly for the sake of tourism). Moreover, one more interesting example of religious diversity and plurality is Agor. There are graves of the soldiers of Muhammad Bin Qasim who crossed Markan areas of Balochistan and ultimately vanquished Sindh in 712. They sowed the seeds of Islam in this part of the world. Also, there is Hinglaaj Mata Temple. The Hindus call it Hinglaaj Mata Temple and Muslims call it Nani Mandir (Grandmother's Temple). In this way Agor evokes veneration from both Hindu and Muslims alike on account of preserving their religious heritage. Other such places include Shri Varun Dev Mandir (Hindu temple) at Manora Island.

### **Shrine Visiting Communities:**

In Pakitan, visiting shrines is an integral part of religious life for most of the people. As it provides solace and strong psychological resilience to the devotees from all parts of life. The major mind set or reason behind visiting shrines is people's belief on holy personages. Shrine visiting people believe that buried holy personages can listen to them and can pray to God to fulfill their wishes and solve their problems. Holy personages are considered as a bridge between God and man. Generally, they assume that shrines are the place which can connect them to God or Divinity. There is a common perception of shrine visiting communities that prayers for anything are more likely to accept at shrines in the presence of God's dearest person. The intense devotion and loyalty of regular visitors make shrines intermediaries between God and man. So, for accommodating their wishes and strengthening their faiths, people visit shrines to pay homage to the holy personage. Some people give donations in cash, some in form of kindness and some volunteer time as a symbol of devotion and respect for the visited holy place. Shrine visiting activity is common in all religions. The followers and masses visit shrine and perform rituals regularly in order to release everyday tensions and to attain solace and internal satisfaction. At different shrines different kinds of activities and practices can be observed by the followers to achieve spiritual pleasure.

There are many other reasons as well behind visiting Shrines. Shrines perform several social welfare functions including purvey of free food (also known as Langar), shelter to needy and health facilities along with free provision of religious education, solace, spiritual enlightenment, and assistance solicited by the visitors. This welfare assistance offered by shrines also attract a lot of needy people to visit them on regular basis for sake of fulfilling their basic life necessities.

**Guru Nanak Dev's Shrine- Kartarpur:**

On the right bank of the Ravi River, Guru Nanak Dev (first guru of Sikhism) put the foundation stone Of Kartarpur in 1504AD. The literal meaning of Kartarpur is 'city of creator or God', it is derived from Punjabi "ਕਰਤਾਰ" (Kartar) means 'Lord of Creation' or Creator' or and "ਪੁਰ" (Pur) means 'city'. At this place, different people irrespective of their different religions and castes lived together and represented first Sikh community. Guru Nanak travelled for 20 years and eventually settled in Kartarpur with his family. His death in 1539, raised a conflict between Hindus and Muslims as both claimed him as their own. To end this dispute both Hindus and Muslims built mausoleums in his memory at Kartarpur with a common wall in between. The Ravi River changed course and washed away the mausoleums. The urn containing his ashes was saved by his son and he reburied it on the left bank of the river. Later at that place a new habitation was formed. The present day Dera Baba Nanak represents that very place. As, it is believed that Guru Nanak died at that place so, Kartarpur Sahib was built at that place. In Sikh Religion, this place is considered as second holiest place. In 1947, Radcliff line divided this region; the right bank of Ravi river – the Shakargarh Tehsil including Kartarpur was awarded to Pakistan and the left bank of the river-Gurdaspur Tehsil was awarded to India. Prime Minister Imran Khan inaugurated the opening of a cross-border Kartarpur Corridor allowing Indian Sikhs to visit Pakistan without a visa on 9th of November 2019.

The original building of Gurdwara Darbar Sahib Kartarpur was destroyed in the floods. The present building was constructed between 1920 and 1929 at a cost of Rs165,060 by Maharaja Sardar Phobinder Singh of Patiala. Later, it was renovated by the Pakistan government in 1995. Recently, Kartarpur corridor is inaugurated by Prime Minister Imran Khan in 2019. Gurdwara Darbar Sahib Kartarpur is also known as Gurdwara Kartarpur. Its building has been painted white and white stones have been used in the courtyard while the finishing has been done in gold. The religious beliefs of the Sikh community and customary Sikh structures have been considered while designing the building of the Gurdwara Kartarpur.

On the entrance of Gurdwara Darbar Sahib, there is a proper system of identity and security check. A visitor card is given to every visitor which he or she must keep with him/ her whilst visiting the Gurdwara. Visitor enter the Gurdwara from Roshan Dewari. Inside Roshan Dewari, on the very left side there is a room where devotees or tourists are supposed to remove their shoes and place it in the cabins. In Roshan Dewari Hall, models are placed to explain the visitors the whole structure of the Kartarpur corridor. In Roshan Dewari hall, there is a corridor that leads you to the Ashnan spot ( one of the religious ritual of Sikhs, Sikhs took bath in the pool for Ashnan and by doing this they believe that all their sins washed away). After that the guider will guide visitors to the central place, where it is believed that urn containing Baba Guru Nanak Ashes is buried. Guru Granth Sahib (the central Scripture of Sikhism) is also placed there. At the top of this building, there is resting place of Guru Nanak Sahib is well organized. The visitors are supposed to cover their heads whilst visiting the inside of this building and they do not have to back the holy personage, holy scripture, and Guru's resting place. A Diwan Asthan is also located a few steps ahead from the central place. A sword has been placed on a raised platform, which gives the details about

### Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan...

inauguration ceremony. There is an art gallery where various paintings related to Sikhism are placed. Common visitors are not allowed to click pictures there. A langar Khana has also established where visitors are served with food. Visitors are cherished with a thali that have four portions: containing sabzi, daal, rice and roti. Visitors can click pictures inside the gurdwara, but videos shooting is not allowed. There is a Mehman Khana that can house over 700 pilgrims if they intend to stay the night. For the facilitation of pilgrims, a medical emergency center and kiosk area has also been built.

The Gurdwara can be visited by members belonging to any religious communities. In Gurdwara Kar Sevak's belongs to different religions. The one who is taking care of Devotees visiting the Guru's resting place is a Hindu (who got this duty two months back). The presence of Hindu Kar Sevak at Sikhs sacred place shows the religious plurality in Sikhism. In an interview conducted at Evacuee Trust Property board Lahore, the Secretary General of Pakistan Sikh Gurdwara Parbhandhik Committee's Ameer Singh' told that the thing that Muslims and Sikhs have in common is that both believes in "Oneness of God (Operwala)". He said: In Islam it is your duty to invite non-Muslims to accept Islam but in Sikhism if you are a Muslim and you are not offering your Prayer in presence of a Sikh, it is the religious duty of Sikh to ask you to offer your prayer instead of giving you invitation of his religion.' He further told about the religious freedom Sikhs having here in Pakistan, he told: The religious freedom that is given to Sikhs in Pakistan is never given to any minority in any other part of the world. We are free to visit our religious places. He continued; even after Babri mosque incident in 1992, neither of our religious place was harmed in Pakistan. He gave a comparative analysis that: In India, during anti Sikhs riots in 1984 various Sikhs were killed also their golden temple was martyrize but in Pakistan there is not a single case like this. These details and interview show the plurality in Sikh religion and justifies the prevalence of interfaith harmony at shrines in Pakistan.

#### Evacuee Trust Property Board:

This research study is that the worldwide image of Pakistan being fanatic religious intolerant country is one side of the picture. There exists astonishing interfaith harmonious culture at Muslim and Non-Muslim shrines in Pakistan. The minorities in Pakistan are free to visit their religious places and practice their religious rituals. For making Pakistan religious pluralistic and minorities' friendly country government of Pakistan is playing very active role. Management of minorities' religious places and non-Muslim festivals are under conscientious control of Evacuee Trust Property board. Following is the list of functional gurdwaras which are under conscious control of Evacuee Trust Property board.

S.No	Gurdwaras	Location
1	Gurdwara Janam Asthan	Nankana Sahib
2	Gurdwara Patti Sahib	Nankana Sahib
3	Gurdwara Tambo Sahib	Nankana Sahib
4	Gurdwara Balila Sahib	Nankana Sahib
5	Gurdwara Panj vi Chatti Patshahi	Nankana Sahib
6	Gurdwara Malji Sahib	Nankana Sahib
7	Gurdwara Kiara Sahib	Nankana Sahib
8	Gurdwara Sacha Sauda	Farooqabad



9	Gurdwara Rorri Sahib	Eminabad, Gujranwala
10	Gurdwara Dera Sahib	Lahore
11	Gurdwara Shaheed Ganj Singh Singhnian	Lahore
12	Gurdwara Guru Ram Das	Lahore
13	Gurdwara Babay Nanki	Lahore
14	Gurdwara Darbar Sahib	Narowal
15	Gurdwara Panja Sahib	Hassanabdal
16	Gurdwara Bhai Joga Singh	Peshawar
17	Gurdwara Bhai Beba Singh	Peshawar
18	Gurdwara Babay Di Bairee	Sialkot

Different festivals of minorities are organized and managed by Evacuee trust property board. As per agreed protocol between India and Pakistan, following tables gives the information about the festivals which are organized by Evacuee trust property board and number of yaterees which can visit Pakistan on various occasions during a calendar year:

#### Sikh Yatress

Sr.No	Name of the Festival/ Place	Strength	Duration-Month
1	Vaisakhi Festival at Gurdwara Panja Sahib- 10 days - April	Hassanabdal	3000
2	Martyrdom Day of Guru Arjun dev Jeep - 10 days- June	Lahore	1000
3	Death Anniversary of Maharaja Ranjeet Singh - 10 days- June	Lahore	500
4	Birthday of Guru Nanak Dev Jee – 10days- Nov	Nankana Sahib	3000

#### Hindu Yatrees:

Sr.No	Name of the Festival/ Place	Strength	Duration-Month
1	Katas Raj temple District Chakwal	200	10days- Feb/Mar
2	Hayat Patafi/ Sadhu Bela Temple, Sukkur (Sindh)	400	10days- Nov/Dec
3	Katas Raj Temples District Chakwal	200	10days- Oct

On each festival Evacuee Trust Property Board provides best available facilities to the Yatrees, in coordination with other government departments for their comfortable stay in Pakistan. Emphasis is made to improve facilities like; reception/langar, travel arrangements, customs and immigration, security, accommodation, rituals, currency exchange, telephone facilities and health cover etc. to project Pakistan as a minorities' friendly country.

#### Conclusion:

In the light of different evidences and writings, it appears highly imperative that there is interfaith harmonious culture at shrines in Pakistan. So, the international image of Pakistan as country of inter and intra religious bigotry can be negated. This research study shows that the worldwide image of Pakistan being fanatic religious intolerant country is one side of the picture. There exists astonishing interfaith harmonious culture at Muslim and Non-Muslim shrines in Pakistan. The minorities in Pakistan are free to visit their religious places and practice their religious rituals. For making Pakistan religious pluralistic and minorities' friendly country government of Pakistan is playing very active role. Management of minorities' religious places and non-Muslim festivals are under conscientious

## Interfaith Harmony at Shrines in Pakistan...

control of Evacuee Trust Property board. Guru Nanak Dev's shrine at Kartarpur is a perfect example of interfaith harmonious culture. Teaching of Sikhism regarding religious harmony and roles of Sikh yaterees are also important for maintaining pluralistic culture at shrines. In short, government, different communities, and Evacuee trust board are putting enough efforts for making possible the prevalence of such culture.`

### Bibliography

1. Ahmed, Dania. "Lal Shahbaz Qalandar and Pakistan's Pluralistic History." Al Jazeera, February 18, 2017. <https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2017/2/18/lal-shahbaz-qalandar-and-pakistans-pluralistic-history/?gb=true>
2. Akbar, Muqarrab and Yaseen, Hafsa. "Interfaith Harmony in Pakistan: An Analysis." *Global Political Review* 1, no.2 (2020): 9-18.
3. Chawla, Taranjeet Kaur. Hassan, Rayaz and Kaur Daljeet, "Visa-Free Travel to Sri Kartarpur Sahib: Historic Pilgrimage and Religious Tourism from Indian Punjab to Pakistan Punjab." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities, India and narratives*, 12, no.3 (2020)
4. DEMOGRAPHIC INDICATORS - 1998 CENSUS
5. Evacuee Trust Property Board under Act No. XIII of 1975.
6. Evacuee Trust Property Board, List of Functional Gurdwaras, October 15th, 2020.
7. Evacuee Trust Property Board, Bilateral Protocol between India and Pakistan, Lahore: Oct 14th, 2020.
8. Evacuee Trust Property board, Facilities being provided to Pilgrims, Lahore: Oct 15th, 2020.
9. Evacuee trust property board, List of Important Gurdwaras, Lahore: October 15th, 2020.
10. Ferozi, Muzammil. "Udero Lal — The Best Example of Interfaith Harmony." *Daily times* February 3, 2020.
11. Ispahani, Farahnaz. *Purifying the Land of the Pure: Pakistan's Religious Minorities*. Noida: HarperCollins Publishers India, 2015.
12. Jinnah, M. Ali. "Speeches as Governor General of Pakistan 1947-1948." Karachi: Pakistan Publication, 1947.
13. Janjua, Raashid Wali. "Guru Nanak's Kartarpur," *Daily times*, November 9, 2019.
14. Khan, Sarfaraz and Sajid, Rizwan. "The Essence of Shrines in Rural Punjab." *Humanity & Social Sciences Journal*, 6, no.1 (2001).
15. Kulkarni, Tanvi & Abbasi, Rizwana. "Hot Takes Kartarpur Corridor and Indo-Pakistan Relations." *Wired*. Last modified Dec 3, 2018, <https://southasianvoices.org/hot-takes-kartarpur-corridor-and-india-pakistan-relations/>
16. Mamoon, Dawood. "Motivations from Kartarpur Corridor: Importance of secular identity in religious democracies like Pakistan." *Journal of Social and Administrative Sciences*, 5, no.4 (2018)
17. Mehmood, Asif. "THE First Phase of Kartarpur Corridor Project Completed, *The Express Tribune*, Nov 4th, 2019.
18. Malik, Adeel. "Religion, Land and Politics: Shrines and Literacy in Punjab." June 2015.

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/279173636\\_Religion\\_Land\\_and\\_Politics\\_Shrines\\_and\\_Literacy\\_in\\_Punjab](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/279173636_Religion_Land_and_Politics_Shrines_and_Literacy_in_Punjab)

19. Nesbit, Eleanor and Kaur, Gopinder. *Guru Nanak*, Calgary: Bayeux Arts, 1998.
20. Part II; Chapter 1: Fundamental Rights (Article 20, Constitution 1973).
21. Paracha, Nadeem F. "Abdullah Shah Ghazi: The Saviour Saint." *Dawn*, November 23, 2014.
22. Pirani, Farida M. "I will Accept Whatever Is Meant for Us. I wait for that—day and night": The search for healing at a Muslim shrine in Pakistan." *Mental Health, Religion & Culture journal*, 11, no.4, (2008), 375-386.
23. Qaisar, Iqbal. *Historical Sikh Shrines in Pakistan*. Lahore: Punjab History Board, 1998.
24. Qazi, Mudassar, "A Hindu Devotee of Shah Latif Runs a Sabeel and Stocks Shoes at his Shrine." *the Express Tribune*, July 02, 2018.
25. Sevea, Iqbal Singh. "The Kartarpur Corridor: Symbolism, Politics and Impact on India-Pakistan Relations" *Institute of South Asian studies*, no. 525 (2018)
26. Strohtmann, Linus. "Giving comfort, dispelling fear: social welfare at the shrine of Data Ganj Bukhsh." *Erdkunde journal*, 67, no.1, 49-61.
27. Singha, H.S. *The Encyclopedia of Sikhism*, (New Delhi: Hemkunt Publishers, 2000).
28. Siddiqui, Naveed. "'This is the beginning': PM Imran inaugurates Kartarpur Corridor on historic day". *Dawn*, 9 Nov 2019.
29. Talbot, Ian. *People on the Move*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2004.
30. Talbot, Ian. *Region and Partition*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1999.
31. Talbot, Ian. *Divided Cities*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2007.
32. Tammi, Muhammad Jahangir. *Baharat Mein Sikh Qaumi Tehreek*. Lahore: South Asian Research Center, Punjab University, 1992.
33. Tammi, Muhammad Jahangir. *Sikh Muslim Taloqat*. Lahore: South Asian Research Center, Punjab University, 2007.
34. Tammi, Muhammad Jahangir. *Sikh Ikisivein Said Mein*. Faisalabad: Shangrila Printers, 2007.
35. Waliullah, Khan Muhammad. *The Sikh Shrines in West Pakistan*, Karachi: Dept. of Archaeology Ministry of Education and Information, Govt. of Pakistan, 1962.
36. Yadav, V. and Sharma, H, *Strategic Disaster Risk Management in Asia*, New Delhi: Springer, 2015.
37. Zuo'an, Wang. "Religious Harmony: A Fresh Concept in the Age of Globalization." *State Administration for Religious Affairs of P. R. China*

**Women Empowerment and Women Rights during Pervez Musharraf Period**

By

**Rehana Kausar (Ph.D. Scholar)**

---

**Abstract:-**

*Women empowerment is defined as “the procedure by which females attain supremacy and acquire command and achieve the aptitude to make tactical alternatives and decisions”<sup>1</sup>*

*The "Empowerment of women" has become an essential and quite debatable topic due to diversity in cultures, religions and castes because of different ethnic, socio-cultural and diverse priorities of different nations. This study narrates certain factors that have lead to Empower Women in Pakistan over years specifically during the regime of Gen. Pervez Musharraf. After General Zia, the ruling government and leading elite classes realized the role of Women in development and well-being of our society. This issue gained quite a lot importance during regime of Gen. Pervez Musharraf. However, after General Pervez Musharraf the governments failed to implement those policies and situation was not improved as such. This study suggests how ruling Governments can play important role regarding empowerment of women.*

*This editorial examines the matter of constitutional rights and civil liberties of females in our country. Dissecting the approaches identified with constitutional rights of females specified by the progressive legislative bodies in the decision time of Gen. Pervez Musharraf, this editorial narrates that notwithstanding of scant assets, the arrangements for women enablement and improvement could create great outcomes however they neglected to convey because of absence of political will of the past governments to execute those strategies and to build up the objective of all inclusive instruction particularly for women.*

*This study concludes the basic flaws regarding provision of Empowerment to Women in Pakistan and how proper legislations regarding Women Rights and Empowerment can be implemented through a political gateway. There is a need to redefine social and cultural behaviors in order to provide empowerment.*

**Introduction:-**

Empowerment of women is a basic index for the accomplishment of practical turn of events. The full support and alliance of both genders is requisite for lucrative, productive and conceptive society, including common commitments concerning the contemplation of youth

---

<sup>1</sup> Chaudhary. I, Farhana Nausheen and M. IdreesLodhi (2012), “Women

Empowerment in Pakistan and preservation of the household. Everywhere around the globe, females are facing a lot many dangers and threats to their family, wellbeing and opulence due to having a lot much work and also due to their nonexistent and deficient strength and impact. All over the locales of the planet, females acquire fewer conformist preparations and practice than males, and concurrently, their own perceptions, intuitions and ability to handle anxieties frequently go unidentified. The forced relationships that hamper and obstruct ladies' achievement of sound and pleasing lives are prevailing in various spheres of community, ranging between most close ones to the outstandingly unknown people.<sup>2</sup> To make a change is a very complicated process. To achieve a change, it necessitates policy, plan of approach and actions so as to advance women's livelihood and economic possessions, to lighten the extraordinary contractual obligations regarding household chores, to banish genuine and justifiable hindrances to women's interests, and to elevate societal mentality with the help of viable venture of education and awareness.

According to global gender statistics, there are about 60% women around the globe. In Pakistan, 48% of the population comprises of women. Thus, they make a major portion of the society. So they must have all the human rights, equal to men. Gender equity implies that people should have correspondent resources and correspondent occasion and chance for autonomy, awareness and training. Women's empowerment is the indispensable element of carrying out gender impartiality and neutrality. This includes escalating a woman's sensation of confidence, self worth, her self- motivated energy, giving part in inheritance, her competence over all the matters of routine, giving respect both in the home and in the public and also boosting her innate abilities to make beneficial amendments for betterment of society.<sup>3</sup> Women's empowerment infers authority over possessions, decisions and all the opportunities equal to men. A betrothed lady will be one who is fearless and fundamentally examines her circumstances and who has authority for decisions and verdicts that control her life.

Women's entitlement has following components: self-worth, ability to create their own verdicts, the right of education, their right to have economic independence and their right to have an opinion.

Muslim leaders, like Sir Syed Ahmad Khan gave training and tried to hold women by their instruction. The great leader Jinnah possessed an uplifting mentality towards women. Subsequent to independence of Pakistan, the economic absurdities for women in the country were challenged and exterminated by Fatima Jinnah. There was a propensity for the women in Punjab to decide in support of the Muslim League before independence. Pretty much every nation, regardless of how dynamic, has a background marked by abusing women. At the end of the day, women from everywhere throughout the world have been defiant to arrive at the status they have today. While the western nations are as yet gaining ground, underdeveloped nations like Pakistan despite everything are far behind in Women Empowerment.

In Pakistan, empowerment of women is required like never before. Pakistan is among the nations which are undependable for women. There are different purposes behind this. Their family thinks it is entitled to end their lives and that they carry disgrace to their inheritable assets.

**Historical Background:-**

The reign of **Zulfikar Bhutto** started in 1970 and ended in 1977. It was a period of non-interventionist perspectives regarding females. At that time, all the organizations supported by ruling command were unbolted for females as well as the District Administrative Seats along with overseas services. Females were deprived of these services before and had never been given such chances. Concerning National Assembly, females were allocated 10% of the total vacancies as well as 5% seats were specified for women in Provincial Assembly. <sup>4</sup> Also there was no restriction on challenging other seats during election. Nevertheless, the execution of such strategies was pitiable for the reason that Government confronted an economic disaster because of the conflict with India. This conflict resulted into segregation of the country. In 1973, the sex equity was explicitly ensured in the constitution. It was specified in constitution that no gender discrimination will be done and also "no severance (separation) based over gender differences and discrimination." The Constitution moreover directs the assurance of matrimony, relations, folks and assures "full interest and concern by women among all fields of nationalized existence."<sup>5</sup> In 1975, the first symposium on women was held in Mexico. The spokesperson from Pakistan partook in that conference, which prompted Pakistani Women's Rights Committee.

**General Zia**, at that point chief of army staff, in 1977 toppled Zulfikar Bhutto regime by an armed forces overthrow on 5<sup>th</sup> of July. The Sixth Plan was implemented by General Zia in his military regime. This plan was loaded with logical inconsistencies. The regime stepped toward institutional structure for women for instance, the establishment of the female's allotment in Cabinet and the formation of another commission on the social Ranking of females. In that Sixth Plan, an explicit section on improvement of status of women was integrated. This built-in plan led to very fruitful consequences. Syeda Abida Hussain with a cluster of about 28 expert ladies formulated that section. She was executive officer of Jhang board around then. The primary goal as expressed in the Sixth Plan might have been "to embrace a coordinated way to deal with improved women' condition".

Gen. Zia selected the Federal Advisory Council in 1981. This council is also known as Majles-e-Shora. Gen. Zia accepted almost 20 ladies in that Advisory council; however official branch was not under the control of that council. The National Assembly amplified the quota for women in 1985. It reached to about 20 percent.<sup>6</sup> Anyway, Gen. Zia started the procedure known as Islamization by presenting prejudicial enactment in opposition to females, for instance, the Haddood ordinance etc were presented at that time. Women were restricted from taking part in sports by General Zia. The advancement of pardah was also remarkable. Likewise, every principal right that was made certain in the Constitution of 1973, was violated by General Zia. Similarly General Zia anticipated regulations regarding Qisaas and Diyat. These are the Islamic reformatory regulations overseeing vengeance (qisas) and pay (diyat) in wrongdoings. This also takes account of substantial injury. When the sufferer was a woman, the determined diyat was reduced by certain ratio. A plenty proof is available which elaborates that the enactment at that time has adversely

“Women Empowerment and Women Rights... affected the lives of women of Pakistan. This has also rendered them increasingly powerless against outrageous savagery. Majority of females that are in the jail have been accused, arrested and imprisoned are because of the Hadood Ordinance. Essentially, in a public report it was found that women who lived in Darul Aman, almost 20% of them were facing Hadood arguments. In a description presented by Amnesty International, it was clearly stated that more than 33% of ladies in jails of Pakistan were being held because of being blamed or seen as blameworthy for zinna.

Following the General Zia's system, a noticeable modification occurred in the arrangement setting for women. Seventh, Eighth, and Ninth plans have unmistakably put forth attempts to remember women's interests. However, arranged advancement neglected to deliver gender imbalances because of the difference between strategy plan and its accomplishment<sup>7</sup>. **Benazeer Bhutto** turned into first lady as the Prime Minister of Pakistan, and the principal lady to lead Pakistan. In the period of her political struggle, she uttered and raised her voice over communal problems of women, their well-being, oppressions and setbacks. Benazeer Bhutto additionally declared designs for development of females' police force headquarters, court of laws and advancement banks specified for females. Benazir Bhutto then additionally vowed that she will annul questionable Hadood laws because the laws abridged the privileges and civil liberties specified for ladies<sup>8</sup>. On the other hand, throughout the two deficient regimes in office; first one from 1988 to 1990 and the second

---

<sup>6</sup> Dr. N. Arab, Ibrahim and Waqar Ahmad (2012), “Socio-cultural impediments to women political

from 1993 to 1996, Benazir Bhutto was unable to put forward any enactment that could improvise and could make government administrations better for females. According to the 8th established alteration forced by Zia-ul-Haq, such legislations were shielded from common authoritative adjustment and legal reviews. The Ministry of Women's Development (MWD) built up communities for development of women studies at five different colleges which were located all over Pakistan i.e. in Islamabad, Lahore, Quetta, Karachi and Peshawar. At the moment these focuses gained much appreciation from public however later on most of such focuses turned out to be nearly non-useful because of absence of monetary and authoritative help. Only the community situated in Karachi had the option to make an ace of expressions agenda specified for women. To concentrate on women's money related requirements a bank was set up in 1989. This bank, specified for women issues was named as The First Women Bank Ltd and abbreviated as FWBL<sup>9</sup>. Then as a state- owned business bank, this bank was granted an important role in improvement of money establishment, just as of a social government assistance association. It works as 38 ongoing branches nationwide, oversaw and run by females. MWD donated a huge funding of about 48 million to FWBL.

The government of **Nawaaz Shareef** officially sanctioned the ordinance of Qisas and Diyat, which organized modifications in the criminal law of Pakistan based on Shariyat and basic moral values of Islam. The Commission for Women issued its report in 1997. In that inquest report it was

obviously expressed that there is dire need for cancellation or amendment of Hudood enactment because this ordinance victimizes ladies. Another thing that was also stated in this report was about how this ordinance contradicts essential civil liberties and rights of women. Similarly, in the time of Benazeer Bhutto a comparative inquiry report had already suggested revising specified portions of this Ordinance. Nonetheless, both Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif failed to actualize the already stated suggestions. In 1997, Pakistan 2010 Program, a basic strategy archive was presented. This program had 16 objectives.<sup>10</sup> The upgrade of women's status was articulated as a major goal for upcoming decade. But, when the report was presented publicly and the main concerns of this report were demonstrated it showed that up gradation of women's status was not its main concern. Essentially, another noteworthy archive, the "Development of Humans and Poverty diminution stratagem" was presented in 1999. This archive referenced women as a proposed group to reduce the poverty and destitution. In 1998, a specific college solely for women was initiated. This college was named as first Fatima Jinah College. However, this college faced postponements for arrival of advancement assets and monetary assets from the Government.

---

#### **Pervaiz Musharraf Reign:-**

There was tremendous political flimsiness in Pakistan from 1988 to 1999. Due to this political vulnerability and fragility and Pakistan was unable to present a solitary report to the CEDAW<sup>11</sup>. This CEDAW was a conference held to end inequity aligned with women. However, in 2004 Pakistan presented its report to CEDAW. In 2004, during the military government of Gen. Pervez Musharaff, a report was presented. This report included of around one hundred sheets. Nonetheless after this, the report that was suggested included only about 100 hundred pages. This report was additionally imparted to common society and non-legislative associations. This was completely a result of the enhanced perception and also because of CEDAW that Criminal Amendment Act 2004 was appreciated in Pakistan.

The Minister of Women Development was effective and quite valuable to plan and present a detailed document to a bench of CEDAW. Then in Pakistan different lawful arrangements were executed via the legislative administration. All these arrangements were respected by CEDAW. These legitimate changes happened as a result of the recognition of the National Plan of Action in 1998. In 2002, the National Plan for Advancement and Empowerment of females was presented. In 2002 the LFO<sup>12</sup> proved gainful regarding ladies to possess political cooperation. In 2002 the correction in Pakistan Citizenship Act alongside different changes proved to be very efficient.

In 2002, the dealing Ordinance and in 2004, the Criminal Law Amendment encouraged indictment and denunciation of esteem slaughtering. In 2005, the Gender Reforms Plan also triggered such incidents. The main achievements regarding enactment and authorization of women in Musharaff's military government were the Advancement of status of females in 2000, the first specified bank for women and National Commission. Protest was



“Women Empowerment and Women Rights... commenced by female campaigners and National along with global associations at that time in opposition to the Hudood Ordinance<sup>13</sup>. This happened because they perceived this ordinance as bias, vicious, ferocious, brutal and inhuman regarding females. After the Military Regime of Gen. Zia, the political legislature of Benazeer Bhutto and Nawaz Shareef came to control by means of the vow to annul the Hadood Ordinance yet they didn't get any change in the current laws because of the specific motivations to keep up the political solidness in the state. This procedure was initiated by the Gen. Parvez Musharaf. In 2004, this was done by the dispersion of Criminal Law Amendment Act. Certain developments that were offered in Hadood Ordinance by General Zia-ul-Haq were framed and altered by the male bigots through their own predilection.<sup>14</sup> This was indicated by biased and personal

---

<sup>11</sup> Convention on Elimination of discrimination against women

<sup>12</sup> Legal Framework Order judgments. According to this law the assailants should have been executed and snubbed, however the situation became worst because the law was executed and implemented just to rebuff the victims and sufferers. It happened when women who challenged for perpetrating offenses as infidelity but could not prove the allegations then she would face charges instead if getting justice. This is a legitimate fact that the Hadood laws were defective and were acknowledged in a traditionalist dictator's regime. Therefore it was very necessary that Hadood Laws should be scrutinized in the parliament. Also there was a need that partial arrangements ought to be abrogated. In March 2006 the Aurat establishment Peshawar and prescribed administration to change the Hadood laws, reported that these laws were a main reason for females' abuse and mistreatment over the years and also these laws were pronounced to be man-made laws to favor hooligan and ladies victimizers conversely gen. Zia system wrongly named them as Islamic laws. Roughly about 80% of ladies in jails were victims of the Hadood laws and others were sufferers of sexual maltreatment and abuse. Alot of females were in prisons due to the Hadood laws just because of hoisting up their rights in opposition to wrongdoings and assaults<sup>15</sup>. According to report of Human Rights Commission, the majority of ladies in correctional facilities were due to the charges of zina against them. Each year about 2000 evident cases were enrolled in opposition to females. The Shariah court under its watchful eye introduced about 4000 alterations in adultery cases. Such conditions were condemned by female workers and activists. They started various workshops and gatherings. It was unequivocally requested that the Hadood Ordinance, a partial should be renounced.

Parliamentarians Commission for Human Rights (P.C.H.R) additionally immovably upheld that our religion has given sky-scraping position and ranking to females and it was also stated that no other religion gives such status to women in their respective communities.

P.C.H.R gave various statements and suggestions just to manage the problems of basic constitutional liberties of women<sup>16</sup>. These suggestions included changes in the Hadood laws, esteem slaughtering and also Bill on household savagery just as alterations in the offense of adultery. So, the main disruptive act which needed immediate modification and dire nullification was the zina

Ordinance. There was requirement to present four males as a proof, however it was practically inconceivable for the victims and sufferers to demonstrate and present four males in the shariah based courts.

The Church of Pakistan appointed the first female deacons in the year

---

2000. Then in the year 2002 the instance regarding Makhtaraan Maai acquired a certain condition of assault casualties with specifically worldwide limelight. Later on, in year 2005 during court preliminaries this issue gained worldwide attention. The Ministry of Women Development was separated from Social Services and was made free service. In September 2004, Education Ministry was also isolated.

In July 2006, General Pervez Musharraf requested his Government to start corrections in the disputable 1979 Hudood Ordinance presented under Zia-ul-Haq's military ruling period. General Parvaiz Musharaff then asked Ministry of Law to fabricate the changes in these disputed and offending laws.<sup>17</sup> The Islamic Ideology council was also included in this whole rectification process. General Musharraf ordered for the prompt discharge of women that were being kept in prisons and were facing charges except mass murders. So under this law almost 1300 women were released on bail from jails in year 2006.

In year 2006, the Women's Protection Bill was passed by parliament of Pakistan. This bill revoked a portion of the Hudood laws. The women protection bill also took into consideration DNA and also focused on relevant medico-legal and logical proofs. These evidences were to be utilized in adultery (zina) cases. The cancellation of the Bill and the subsequent marking of this bill into law was done by President General Pervez Musharraf. This provoked some Islamic activists and also summoned fights with firm stance Islamic and activist Muslim pioneers along with their organizations. A few specialists then additionally expressed that such changes were more difficult to be implemented.

Then Cabinet affirmed specification of 10% amount for ladies in the Central Superior Services. This was decided by cabinet in its gathering in July 2006. This was the first time when women were given this much allocated reserved seats because there was 5% portion for ladies in previous decisions by ruling parties. In December 2006, Prime Minister Shaukat Aziz endorsed the suggestion to increase this share to about 10%<sup>18</sup>.

In year 2006, The Protection of Women (Criminal Laws Amendment) Act was additionally approved. Just because female students of the Military Academy accepted gatekeeper obligation on the tomb of Quaid-e-Azam, the Women's Protection Bill, was scrutinized by many organizations and parties including ladies' activists offering empty talk and neglecting to revoke the Hudood Ordinances.

### **Conclusion:-**

Empowerment of women isn't a significant element that empowers women socially, strategically and monetarily autonomous but it is significant for purpose, prosperity and progress of any civilization in any state. Mother assumes a significant job in the supporting

---

<sup>17</sup> UNCEDAW, decision, 2007 of youngsters, as same as women assume a significant job in the advancement of society. Strengthening of women makes them monetarily free however political strengthening of women makes them autonomous politically in taking their choices making themselves solid to challenge decisions, make them self-ruling and managing activities in support and advancement of state. This makes them autonomous so that they may join whichever ideological group they want. And also makes them able to communicate their ideas which have been permitted to women by the constitution of Pakistan.

Gender based segregation of women fluctuates from nation to nation and shows variance between certain cultures. This variety relies on social and monetary foundation of that area in which ladies are rewarding discriminately. They are viewed as defenseless in light of the fact that they have no dynamic force and this influences her status a great deal both in the public eye and family. Because of lawful, social and other obstructions, the females of Pakistan are constantly deemed as inferior. They are confined to participate in any political or social movement. Women are simply limited to deal with household, not made for financial portrayal, since the general public thought about that it is male overwhelmed area not for women. Also the women are made uniquely for local circle rather than for open circle. Because of male dominancy in political, lawful or monetary structure women aren't viewed as ready to partake in political exercises etc.

General Zia is very popular regarding abuse of women rights and prohibited ladies developments and also considered purdah as mandatory just by the forced implementation of Islamic laws in his dictatorship. He prohibited every major right of females by saying that the obligation of men is to function as a provider of all facilities to women and also proclaimed Hudood Ordinance. General Parvaiz Musharaff regime is celebrated for giving 33% reserved seats to women in practically every circle of social and financial independence and also by providing them certainty so that they may participate in all public and private exercises depending upon their own will. This period is also regarded as golden period for empowerment and enactment of women.

### **Discussion:**

The ideas of social enactment and women strengthening (empowerment) are a lot determined for women. Women are the component with whom world is prepping step by step. Presently this is a dire reality that is giving the status to females that they really deserve and merit. The strengthening of females is the most important dilemma of Pakistan from 1947, as from that time, Muslims were got isolated from non-Muslims yet women are from that point till current moment are considered inferior or sub-ordinate to men and are also weak financially because women don't possess any autonomous strengthening. Males are prevailing over every single lady amidst each circle whether if there should be an occurrence of strengthening or some other concerning dilemma. Certain laws were made regarding social and ethical problems of women and this legislation is named as social enactment/empowerment. Enactment in addition to purpose of any country is doing in an affirmative way and playing very crucial role. Numerous laws have been made yet real usage on these laws is extremely deficient and scarce. There should be made legitimate approaches to execute such laws into Pakistan, with

the goal that social state of female and their civil liberties ought to be developed to upper level. Enactment, if there should arise an occurrence of women problems is progressively significant in Pakistan because our country is a male prevailing state where females reserve less or absent privileges to raise their voices in order to oppose man centric framework. Here, the ladies are living in gender biased prevailing state and somehow extremely low consideration was given to social enactment of women.

**Iran And KSA Using Sectarian Proxy Warfare To Counter Each Other's  
Regional Influence - Implications For Pakistan**

By  
**Muhammad Ahsan Ghazali**

**Sajjad Hussain (Ph.D Scholar)**

---

**Abstract:-**

*This paper aims to explore the current chaotic condition of the Middle East region fuelled by the traditional rivalry between Saudi Arabia and Iran. A large plethora of factors play a part when this contending relationship is considered for analysis, such as competing legitimacies, geostrategic interests, historical enmity and the religious cum sectarian differences. Both States are highly involved in direct and indirect proxy warfare in Syria, Yemen, Iraq, Lebanon and Bahrain. Fueled by Sectarianism and Power Politics collectively, the Saudi-Iran rivalry have absolutely created the chances of a new cold war, one of the dangerous elements defining the politics of the region. The paper argues that the Saudi-Iran's sectarian proxy warfare in the Middle East is a means to counter each other's regional influence that has adverse implications for internal security of Pakistan. Following a qualitative approach and deductive method, the paper answers four main queries: To what extent the Iran-Saudi Rivalry a result of sectarian aspirations? How are both countries using proxy warfare method in the region to realize their interests vis a vis each other? What is the role of external powers like US or Russia in the proxy warfare? How does the rivalry between Iran and Saudi Arabia impact Pakistan? The study concludes that the outcome of the predicament in the Middle East has produced several policy encounters for Pakistan vis-à-vis its relations with the Middle East such as growing threat of sectarianism, violent extremism, domestic polarization and threats to its economic development.*

**PREFACE**

The region of Middle East is characterized by a situation of chaos, involatility and a battleground of power and influence. One of the chief causes of this current scenario is the Saudi-Iran traditional rivalry that has roots in multiple factors, owing largely to competing legitimacies, geostrategic interests and the religious cum sectarian differences. Both are highly involved in direct and indirect proxy warfare in Syria, Yemen, Iraq, Lebanon and Bahrain. Pakistan has a compatibility of security and economic interests with both Iran and Saudi Arabia. Pakistan aspires to deepen its ties with both these countries and wants to remain neutral in the strategic competition between Saudi and Iran but its stance is prone to several vulnerabilities for which Pakistan has to respond effectively to domestic and regional developments. Options for Pakistan are very limited as it cannot side with any one party in the Saudi-Iran

rivalry. This paper aims at exploring how are Iran and KSA with support of their allies using sectarian proxy warfare to counter each other's regional influence. It examines the implications of this proxy war on Pakistan? The paper takes a look at all the available options Pakistan have in the emerging strategic situation of the Middle East. The study further considers Pakistan needs a more proactive and balanced policy in dealing with both the States in the recent regional developments. And recommends that Pakistan can try to help resolve some Iranian and Saudi differences. It should take rigorous measures to ensure its own territory is protected from Iranian and Saudi proxies and their ideological propaganda. It needs to resort to a more proactive approach vis a vis the two rivals. Pakistan should also have a sincere dialogue with Iran and Saudi Arabia, over the issue of extremism and sectarian in Pakistan in order to make them realize the huge cost it has paid due to these problems.

I am greatly indebted to my Directing Staff, Lieutenant Colonel Khaldoon for his valued guidance, encouragement and cooperation without which it would have been very difficult for me to complete this Paper.

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	.....	iii
Preface	.....	iv
Table of Contents	.....	v
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	.....	vii
<b>Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION</b>		<b>1</b>
1.1 Background of the Study	.....	1
1.2 Problem Statement	.....	3
1.3 Hypothesis	.....	4
1.4 Research Questions	.....	4
1.5 Significance of Research	.....	4
<b>Chapter 2 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE</b>		<b>6</b>
2.1 Literature Review	.....	6
2.2 Literature Gap	.....	9
<b>Chapter 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>		<b>10</b>
3.1 Research Methodology	.....	10
3.2 Theoretical Framework	.....	10
<b>Chapter 4 ANALYSIS AND RESEARCH FINDINGS</b>		<b>12</b>
4.1 Saudi-Iran Rivalry: Historical Overview	.....	12
4.2 Iran-KSA Proxy Confrontation in Yemen and Syria	.....	14
4.2.1 Case of Yemen	.....	14
4.2.2 Case of Syria	.....	15
4.3 Role of Major Powers in the Sectarian Conflicts	.....	16
4.3.1 Role of USA	.....	16
4.3.2 Role of Russia	.....	17
4.4 Implications for Pakistan	.....	18
4.4.1 Using Islam for Vested Interests	.....	19
4.4.2 Sectarian Tensions in Pakistan	.....	19
4.4.3 Polarization in Pakistan	.....	20

4.4.4	Impact on Pakistan Economy	.....	20
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>		<b>21</b>
5.1	Conclusion	.....	21
5.2	Recommendations	.....	21
	<b>Bibliography</b>		<b>23</b>

### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

1. GCC	-	Gulf Cooperation Council
2. IS	-	Islamic State
3. KSA	-	Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
4. PMCs	-	Private Military Companies
5. UAE	-	United Arab Emirates
6. UNSC	-	United Nations Security Council
7. US	-	United States

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 **Background of the Study.** The region of Middle East is characterized by a situation of chaos, involatility and a battleground of power and influence. One of the chief causes of this current scenario is the Saudi-Iran traditional rivalry that has roots in multiple factors, owing largely to competing legitimacies, geostrategic interests and the religious cum sectarian differences. Neither of the two states has the capacity to totally defeat each other due to the alike political and economic difficulties, yet the diplomatic, economic and military leverages are large enough to perpetuate this rivalry to the end thereby ruining all the possibilities of a stable region<sup>1</sup>. Both are highly involved in direct and indirect proxy warfare in Syria, Yemen, Iraq, Lebanon and Bahrain. Fueled by both Sectarianism and Power politics collectively, the Saudi-Iranian rivalry have absolutely created a defining and perilous element of regional politics culminating in a new cold war.<sup>2</sup>

The roots of this persistent conflict lies in three significant events; the 1979 Islamic Revolution in Iran, the US-Iraq war (2003) and the Arab Spring.<sup>3</sup> The 1979 Islamic Revolution led by Ayatollah Khomeini initiated the wave by adding the sectarian layer to Iran's ambitions for geopolitical influence<sup>4</sup>. For him Islam was political and incited many Iraqi's Shia community to rise against the Sunni Baathist Saddam's Regime. His aggressive foreign policy massively threatened the Saudi Monarchy and Suadi's regional influence at the same time. The scenario depicting Saudi as status quo and Iran as revolutionary has resulted in zero-sum security dilemma in which each of the two countries are taking actions

<sup>1</sup> Ribale Sleiman-Haidar and Jack McGinn, "Saudi Arabia and Iran: Beyond Conflict and Coexistence?," Monograph, Aug 2018

<sup>2</sup> "Iran and Saudi Arabia's Cold War Is Making the Middle East Even More Dangerous - Vox," accessed September 11, 2019, <https://www.vox.com/2015/3/30/8314513/saudi-arabia-iran>.

<sup>3</sup> "Vatanka\_PolicyPaper.Pdf," accessed September 13, 2019, [https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Vatanka\\_PolicyPaper.pdf](https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Vatanka_PolicyPaper.pdf).

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

that are meant to increase one's own security while creating insecurity for the other<sup>5</sup>. Moreover, a protracted power tussle between Saudi Arabia and Iran to balance out the influence of their respective ideologies makes them involve in proxies wars. They both keep on intervening in politics and internal affair of the neighbouring countries in order to avoid any chance of building each other's influence in region. The Arab Spring opened up a new avenue for Iran to expand its influence. There started a tug of war between the two governments. On one hand, Iran makes its every effort to manipulate already volatile situation to threaten a pro Saudi regime in any regional country. On the other hand, Saudi never leave any case where Iranian friendly government finds it difficult to stay intact by further creating horrible miseries for it pushing it to the ultimate end.<sup>6</sup>

Pakistan has a compatibility of security and economic interests with both of the two regimes. The socio-religious linkages that it shares with the two are viewed as a product of multiplicity of factors such as commonality of civilization, culture and religion with shared interests and joint aspirations thus tensions between the two blocs also impact Pakistan. It aspires to deepen its ties with both these countries and wants to remain neutral in the strategic competition between Iran and Saudi but its stance is prone to several vulnerabilities for which Pakistan has to respond effectively to domestic and regional developments. Pakistan needs a more proactive and balanced policy in dealing with both the States in the recent regional developments<sup>7</sup>.

**1.2 Problem Statement.** The Saudi-Iranian strategic competition is a result of opposing political, ideological, religious and sectarian aspirations that has exacerbated the regional security situation. In the pursuit of their own narrative of political Islam, both countries try to reshape the regional order that would eventually help to promote their own interests. Both are actively involved in political movements and funding proxies in the conflicts in their neighboring states just to negate each other's influence. Whereas the KSA's interests lie more in maintaining the status quo preventing the rise of all the anti-Saudi elements, Iranians on the other hand are engaged in tilting the status quo and spreading their type of revolution. Pakistan shares deep socio-religious linkages with both Iran and Saudi Arabia hence aspires to deepen its ties with both countries and wants to remain neutral in their strategic struggle. Yet its stance is prone to several vulnerabilities for which Pakistan has to respond effectively. Pakistan faces a host of implications and adverse impacts in the wake of this rivalry. Many of the current internal security issues are directly connected to these externally sponsored factors as they pose a threat to national security and socio-economic development and allow anti-state nationalist elements to exploit the vulnerabilities. Options for Pakistan are very limited as it cannot side with any one party in the Saudi-Iran rivalry. Pakistan needs to ensure its territory is well protected from both Iranian and Saudi proxies and their political and ideological motives.

---

<sup>5</sup> Sleiman-Haidar and McGinn, "Saudi Arabia and Iran."

<sup>6</sup> Sleiman-Haidar and McGinn.

<sup>7</sup> Huma Yusuf, The, "Pakistan in the Middle East: A Cautious Balance," *The Diplomat*, accessed September 13, 2019,



The basic purpose of the study is to understand how are KSA and Iran with support of their allies using sectarian proxy warfare to counter each other's regional influence and analyse implications of this proxy war on Pakistan.

**1.3 Hypothesis.** The Saudi-Iran's sectarian proxy warfare in Middle East is a means to counter each other's regional influence that has adverse implications for internal security of Pakistan.

**1.4 Research Questions:**

**1.4.1 Primary Question.** How are Iran and KSA with support of their allies using sectarian proxy warfare to counter each other's regional influence and what are the implications of this proxy war on Pakistan?

**1.4.2 Secondary Questions**

- To what extent the Iran–Saudi Rivalry a result of sectarian aspirations?
- How are both countries using the proxy warfare method as a means for the realization of their interests in the region?
- What is the role of external powers like US or Russia in the proxy warfare?
- How does the rivalry between Iran and Saudi Arabia impact Pakistan?

**1.5 Significance of Research.** The traditional conflict between Saudi and Iran affects entire region of Middle East. Sectarianism is one of the serious concerns of all Muslim countries today. It truly has both internal and external sources in other neighboring Muslim states. Thus this research revolves around bringing the understanding of its nature hence very significant from both International and Pakistani perspective. Pakistani Muslims have been facing this problem since many decades but the intensity of it is more manifested when it has assumed the external characteristic especially the fallout of Middle Eastern conflicts. The roots not only are traced back to the Soviet's intervention in Afghanistan in 1979 that cleared the path for Saudi Arabia to exert its influence in this region but also to the Iranian Revolution in 1979 that allowed Iran to extend its Islamic ideals further. Since then Pakistan has been witnessing the menace of terrorism, sectarianism and massacre in the name of religion. This study is very important in this scenario for it will provide policy makers with a framework to ensure internal security and territorial integrity in the wake of such trends. Moreover the research would be fruitful as it provides future peaceful political options for Pakistan.

## CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

**2.1 Literature Review.** The literature reviewed on this particular topic can be easily subdivided into three groups. First set relates to those sources that relate the rivalry between Iran and KSA with the sectarian motives rather than the geopolitical power politics. The second set of sources put more focus on the power politics and geopolitical interests of the two regional players as compared to its Sectarian and ideological connections. The third set mostly talked about this rivalry in connection with regional dynamics and instability.

According to Alex Vatanka,<sup>8</sup> the religious tensions and the Sunni-Shiite divide between KSA and Iran have their origin in US-led invasion of Iraq of 2003 and more importantly Arab Spring uprisings of 2011. Both the events have led to a devastating condition. The Iraq war empowered the Shiites in the government while the Arab spring uprisings led Iran to maximize its influence to the neighbouring Gulf states.

Jack McGinn<sup>9</sup> argued in his study about the essence of Saudi-Iranian rivalry. He focused on their competing legitimacies. Both are determined to shape the regional order according to their own aspirations and interests. Despite of this fact, neither of the two rivals can marginalize or defeat one another in complete sense. However, they have enough capability to perpetuate their confrontation through all means, be they diplomatic, economic or military.

In another work, done by Max Fischer, it is observed that the rivalry between Iran and KSA is actually a struggle for dominance. This struggle has led them to use indirect and covert means as well which has triggered the region's direct problems such as religious extremism, dictatorship and militia violence. So instability, civil war and fragmented societies are very much possible and anticipated in the region's politics.<sup>10</sup>

Zack Beauchamp<sup>11</sup> noticed that Saudi Arabia and Iran are responsible for exacerbating the mess and crisis that is going on in many Middle eastern countries such as Lebanon, Bahrain, Iraq and Syria. Moreover the chief cause of the conflicts relate to the proxies that are employed by these two countries in their neighbours. They not only support opposing political parties, and fund their armies but also sometimes engage in direct confrontation with one another's proxies. Tali Grumet<sup>12</sup> also confirmed about the proxy confrontation and indirect warfare

---

<sup>8</sup> "Vatanka\_PolicyPaper.Pdf."

<sup>9</sup> Sleiman-Haidar and McGinn, "Saudi Arabia and Iran."

<sup>10</sup> Max Fisher, "How the Iranian-Saudi Proxy Struggle Tore Apart the Middle East," *The New York Times*, Nov 19, 2016, sec. World,

<sup>11</sup> Zack Beauchamp, "Iran and Saudi Arabia's Cold War Is Making the Middle East Even More Dangerous," *Vox*, Mar 30, 2015, <https://www.vox.com/2015/3/30/8314513/saudi-arabia-iran>.

<sup>12</sup> Tali Grumet, "New Middle East Cold War: Saudi Arabia and Iran's Rivalry," *Electronic Theses and Dissertations*, January 1, 2015, <https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd/1028>.

between Iran and KSA. The whole region is polarised on the politico-religious basis into two regional armed camps. Sectarianism has been promulgated in order to exploit weaker states. From Iraq to Lebanon, many of the states are experiencing the proxy effects of these two traditional rivals of the region. A New Middle East Coldwar is emerging in the near scenario. Infact Ankit Panda has approved in his work that religion and politics have played a larger role in the polarization that is emerging but it has negative ramifications for the entire region as well as the whole world.<sup>13</sup>

The U.S is determined to politically isolate Iran and financially weaken its economy.<sup>14</sup> The US presence in the Gulf War have minimized the chances of building a bridge between KSA and Iran. Sectarianism is one of the biggest tool that each side employs to increase one's influential sphere. The region remained divided into two largest religious sects of Islam, Shia and Sunni due to their differential approaches.<sup>15</sup>

Farhat Konein and Muhammad Shafiq in their paper argued that the messy relationship between Iran and KSA can have huge impacts for Pakistan mostly of negative nature. Pakistan due to several social, religious and cultural connections with the two states hopes for a common future.<sup>16</sup> Muzaffar et al. observed that Iran enjoys a historical relationship with Pakistan as its closest neighbor, while Saudia is an important strategic partner of Pakistan. Pakistan despite its balancing approach finds it difficult to maintain a healthy equilibrium in relationship towards both. The reason is the zero sum security dilemma between these two enemies who perceive one's friend as the enemy of other.<sup>17</sup> In connection with Pak-Iran relations, few scholars have even noticed that the regional dynamics, geopolitics and external powers intervention have structured Pakistan–Iran relationship since Pakistan's birth. Both had always kept different interests, alliances, and ideologies which have affected any chance of their working relationship.<sup>18</sup>

Zulqarnain Sewag pointed out that Iran and Saudi Arabian rivalry is the root cause of many of the internal security issues of Pakistan. Sectarianism, unrest, chaos, illiteracy, and immense poverty are the daily problems that have deteriorated peace in Pakistan.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup> Ankit Panda, "Pakistan's Approach to Navigating the Saudi-Iranian Split," United States Institute of Peace, accessed September 13, 2019, <https://www.usip.org/publications/2019/02/pakistans-approach-navigating-saudi-iranian-split>.

<sup>14</sup> Seth G. Jones, "War by Proxy: Iran's Growing Footprint in the Middle East | Center for Strategic and International Studies," accessed September 13, 2019, <https://www.csis.org/war-by-proxy>.

<sup>15</sup> Muhammad Khalid Rizwan et al., "From Rivalry to Nowhere: A Story of Iran-Saudi Ties," 2014, <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-199491101>.

<sup>16</sup> Dr Farhat Konain Shujahi and Muhammad Shafiq, "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018, 8.

<sup>17</sup> Muhammad Muzaffar, Robina Khan, Zahid Yaseen, "Saudi - Iran Strife: Complexities for Pakistan," *Global Regional Review* 2, no. 1 (2017): 119–34.

<sup>18</sup> Kayhan Barzegar and Abdolrasool Divsallar, "Political Rationality in Iranian Foreign Policy," *The Washington Quarterly* 40, no. 1 (January 2, 2017): 39–53,

<sup>19</sup> Zulqarnain Sewag, "Sectarian Rise in Pakistan: Role of Saudi Arabia and Iran," accessed September 13, 2019, [https://www.academia.edu/19001554/Sectarian\\_Rise\\_in\\_Pakistan\\_Role\\_of\\_Saudi\\_Arabia\\_and\\_Iran](https://www.academia.edu/19001554/Sectarian_Rise_in_Pakistan_Role_of_Saudi_Arabia_and_Iran).

Pakistan should follow a proactive approach towards both these rivals.<sup>20</sup> Multiple problems have emerged for the policymakers in Pakistan related to the Middle Eastern fiasco. Sectarianism, Polarisation and economic challenges lead the way. Pakistan has to steer its domestic and International Policy direction in a workable, pragmatic and effective way.<sup>21</sup>

**2.2 Literature Gap.** After going through a vast literature review on the Saudi-Iran rival relationship, it is found that though there is abundant literature available generally on the proxy confrontations of Iran and KSA, the rival competition between the two, its implications for the region and greater Middle East yet there is dearth of literature on the Saudi pursuit of its proxies. How it manages to act upon its indirect strategies to be the leader of the region. Most of the literature available deals with Iranian motives, its connection with the external powers, its ulterior motives in making the non-state actors as allies.

Moreover Literature also has shown that there is a need of more research on impacts of rivalry on Pakistan and Pakistan's policy options vis-a-vis Saudi-Iran Rivalry. This present research will try to fulfill this gap by analyzing thoroughly the negative fallouts of Middle Eastern Conflicts on Pakistan's Security and will recommend solid options.

### **CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

**3.1 Research Methodology.** This qualitative research is based on descriptive typology. It aims to assess and understand the use of sectarian proxy warfare by Saudi and Iran to nullify each other's strategic influences in the region. Data has been collected from the secondary sources such as books, articles of renowned Journals, web resources, policy evaluations, newspapers and the official reports. Data has been analyzed through document analysis method.

**3.2 Theoretical Framework.** The dynamics of zero-sum competition between Iran and KSA and its implications for the wider region can be best explored with the help of Regional Security Complex theory. This theory is propounded by Barry Buzan and Ole Weaver and it best explains the post-cold war regional dynamics. It focuses on the regional security threats faced by majority of the rival neighboring States causing implacable security dilemma by utilizing their maximum resources. Within a specific region these states form a security complex who have interlinked and interdependent security concerns. Considering the case of Middle East and growing aspirations of regional influences of Iran and Saudi Arabia in the region and their proxy involvement has minimized the chances of cooperation and increased enmities. Owing to ethnic, cultural, religious, sectarian, political and even civilizational diversities, the chances of cooperation are far less. Middle Eastern Security complex is three dimensional. At the domestic level,

---

<sup>20</sup> Hira A Shafi, "Iran – Saudi Rivalry: Options for Pakistan," n.d., 11.

<sup>21</sup> Kashif Mumtaz, "The Middle East in a Flux: How Should Pakistan Respond? | Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad," accessed September 13, 2019, <http://issi.org.pk/the-middle-east-in-a-flux-how-should-pakistan-respond/>.

Sectarian civil wars of Iraq, Syria, Yemen, economic disparities, ethnic issues, socio-developmental problems and governance issues are highlighted. At the regional level, the failed states of Syria, Yemen, Iraq's conflicts along with Iranian nuclear programme and the rise of Islamic State (IS), the Sunni regional allies of Saudi Arabia such as Turkey and others fighting Iranian allied Rebels are obstructing the peace. At the International level, Pakistan, Afghanistan and Central Asian States have been witnessing the worse impacts of Saudi-Iranian confrontation thus widening the circle of Security Complex and creating jolts in these countries' socio-economic and political structures.<sup>22</sup>

## CHAPTER 4 ANALYSIS AND RESEARCH FINDINGS

**4.1 Saudi-Iran Rivalry: Historical Overview.** Iran and Saudi Arabia's relationship has its origin in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, when the relations between these two states were highly turbulent yet sociable. Several issues became the cause of ups and downs in the diplomatic ties between them.<sup>23</sup> Both states became not only an important part of the US's twin pillar diplomacy in Middle East in 50's till 80's but also were the frontline states in fighting communism. In return they were the huge beneficiaries of the West in terms of military, economic and diplomatic support.<sup>24</sup> The Iranian Revolution of 1979, however became the breakthrough point that not only deteriorated the Saudi-Iran relations but also redefined Iran as an anti-western and anti-imperialist nation.<sup>25</sup> Iran desired to spread its revolutionary ideology to all parts of the region as well. However, it found it very difficult to enflame non-Shi'ites to rebel against their own governments. Even many other Shiites not only failed to accept and ascribe to the Khomeini's ideals and politics, but also do not see him as their spiritual leader.<sup>26</sup>

The Saudis in the first place tried to have shown enough flexibility to adjust to the new transitional phase of revolutionary Iran. They maintained a healthy relationship. But with the Haj incident of 1987 that killed 400 Iranian pilgrims, Saudis departed. Iran was undermining Saudis legitimacy and validity which paved the way for Saudis to side with Iraq with full cooperation and support in Iran-Iraq War. Resultingly the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) was established to marshal other Gulf States to assist Iraq in its war struggle. Saudi Arabia preferred to assist Iraq despite the fact that victory for both Iran and Iraq would be equally unacceptable for it, as both could have probable dangerous aspirations and intensions towards the larger Gulf region. Thus Iran and Iraq

---

<sup>22</sup> Nazir Hussain, Mansoor Ahmad, "Rising Iran: Implications for the Middle East and Pakistan | Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad," accessed September 13, 2019, <http://www.issi.org.pk/rising-iran-implications-for-the-middle-east-and-pakistan/>.

<sup>23</sup> Derika Weddington, "Rivalry in the Middle East: The History of Saudi-Iranian Relations and Its Implications on American Foreign Policy," n.d., 146.

<sup>24</sup> Cerioli and Cerioli, "Roles and International Behaviour."

<sup>25</sup> Weddington, "Rivalry in the Middle East: The History of Saudi-Iranian Relations and Its Implications on American Foreign Policy."

<sup>26</sup> Weddington.

collectively emerged as non-victorious in the end<sup>27</sup>.

After the Khomeini's death, his pragmatic successors sought after a reengagement with KSA. A rapprochement was in sight when Iran's foreign policy makers stopped advocating the dissemination of their ideology further. The focus was solely on the rebuilding of economic ties. It became more inclined in its foreign policy to inclusion into the world at large. Nevertheless things did not go as this turn. With the reigning in of Ahmadinejad, Saudi Iran relations turned sour once again and this time fall to a minimum decline. Further discouraging were the external events like US intervention in Iraq 2003, the fall of Iraq, and the Arab spring which played a decisive role in the expiration of their affiliation.<sup>28</sup> These events led to the opening of new battlegrounds and formulation of indirect proxies.

When it comes to the perspectives, Saudi and Iran totally contradict each other. The former not only considers itself as a supreme spiritual leader of the Muslim Ummah but also a wealthy, oil rich country of the region. An active, stable and successful Saudi monarchy would definitely view Iran's ideology as sectarian, militaristic and imperialist as against their own satisfaction with the prevailing regional order and status quo.<sup>29</sup>

At the same time, Iranian narrative revolves around their emphasis on their historical regional ascendancy and the continuation of it. Power politics is also a prime consideration in its foreign policy crafting just like any other state. The only variance is that of its anti-western ideology and views. While rejecting to align with the larger international community politically, the Khomeini's Iran desires economic integration into international trade flows at the same time. The political ideology of the ruling regime of Iran differentiates between the economy and politics. The government never wants to be open in national and internal security matters.<sup>30</sup> Iran confirming to its pan Islamic ideals, rejects the prevailing order as unacceptable for Muslim Societies.<sup>31</sup>

**4.2 Iran-KSA Proxy Confrontation In Yemen And Syria.** The ongoing strategic competition between Iran-Saudi Arabia have resulted into two major proxy wars in Middle East, namely Syria and Yemen though both have been extensively engaged in other parts of the region especially Iraq ,Bahrain and Lebanon for gaining political influence power projection.<sup>32</sup> Both perceive that influencing neighbors' policies and regional affairs is essential to generate alliances, and credibility.<sup>33</sup> A Proxy warfare is defined as a situation whereby the third parties in a conflict scenario try to involve and intervene by covert means for

---

<sup>27</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq, "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018.

<sup>28</sup> Muzaffar, Khan, and Yaseen, "Saudi - Iran Strife."

<sup>29</sup> Dr Farhat Konain Shujahi and Muhammad Shafiq, "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018, 8.

<sup>30</sup> Sleiman-Haidar and McGinn, "Saudi Arabia and Iran."

<sup>31</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq, "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018.

<sup>32</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq.

<sup>33</sup> Cerioli and Cerioli, "Roles and International Behaviour."

gaining a strategic influence in the conflict outcome.<sup>34</sup> This type of conflict requires the external actors such as states or non states to influence the internal behaviour of internal actors by providing them with the material support.

**4.2.1 Case of Yemen.** The country is very poor in terms of resources that has contributed towards the rise of ethnic rifts and tensions during the President Saleh era. Apart from these socio-economic grievances, political problems and corruption by the ruling regime played also a pertinent deformation role in the structuring of the state. This made all the people anti regime and revolutionary in 2011<sup>35</sup>. However it took four to five years for these disagreements and grievances to become violent and chaotic. By 2018, the Yemen ground was ripped enough to experience the most protracted and violent conflict of the Middle East region. This has created a huge humanitarian crises. Adding fuel to the fire, the internal and external forces have also played their role in the aggravation of already tensed and violent situation. Among the top opposing forces, Houthis emerged as the most frustrated and most violent group<sup>36</sup>.

Many scholars<sup>37</sup> have put this Yemen conflict in the category of Proxy sectarian warfare which has roots in the strategic and sectarian traditional antagonism between Saudi Arabia and Iran. For Saudia, Yemen like interventions are justified as Iran has provided huge indirect support to the Houthi rebellious movement thereby trying to overthrow the status quo. Iran despite its stressed economy is trying to dislocate the regional countries be it Lebanon or Yemen. In doing so, it has proven proficient at manipulating fault lines among the neighbouring regional countries.<sup>38</sup>

**4.2.2 Case of Syria.** Syrian conflict has been characterized by overlying external interests, bloody confrontation, shifted rivalries, prolonged civil war and massive scale human displacement in the form of refugees internal and international. Three particular layers of proxies are being functional in case of Syria. The US and Russian confrontation since very start make up the first layer. Iran and Saudi rivalry manifested in Shia Sunni competition forms the second set and US-Saudi supported Sunni groups against Iran-Russian sustained Assad's regime and Shiite groups' forms the third layer of main proxies. The complexity of war increases with the increasing involvement of Iran and its supporters.<sup>39, 40</sup>

Syrian Conflict manifests a highly polarized situation. While the conflict is more of a sectarian nature yet a direct faultline is not obvious. The proxy interventions of the two countries have rather exacerbated other direct and threatening issues of the region such as violence and regional extremism. While for Iran, Syria heavily counts in the rational calculation of its regional cum

---

<sup>34</sup> İrem Aşkar Karakir, "Yemen'de Devam Etmekte Olan Çatışma: Bir Vekalet Savaşı Mı?," *TESAM Akademi Dergisi*, August 30, 2018, 121–49,

<sup>35</sup> Jeremy M Sharp, "Yemen: Civil War and Regional Intervention," n.d., 21.

<sup>36</sup> Jeremy M Sharp, "Yemen: Civil War and Regional Intervention," n.d., 21.

<sup>37</sup> Karakir, "Yemen'de Devam Etmekte Olan Çatışma," August 30, 2018.

<sup>38</sup> Sleiman-Haidar and McGinn, "Saudi Arabia and Iran."

<sup>39</sup> Şafak Oğuz and Kadir Ertaç Çelik, "CONFLICT IN SYRIA: IS IT A PROXY WARFARE?," n.d., 26.

<sup>40</sup> Saman Zulfqar, "Competing Interests of Major Powers in the Middle East: The Case Study of Syria and Its Implications for Regional Stability," n.d., 27.

international ambitions and targets, at the same time, Saudi Arabia wants to revise the Sunni Shiite balance in the region by offering a sharp resistance to Iranian's revolutionary spread. Thus to support Sunni rebels is seemingly the only left out option for Saudia in their strategic analysis.<sup>41</sup>

Saudi-Iran competition is likely to reiterate and intensify the area of contention in the upcoming years which include Iran's covert support to the proxy groups fighting in Middle Eastern conflict. Iran is fighting against Saudi Arabia through these groups in Yemen, Syria, Bahrain and Iraq. Although Saudi Arabia is also alleged for its support to the proxy groups but it is not as strong as the Iranian support.<sup>42</sup>

### 4.3 Role of Major Powers in the Sectarian Conflicts:

**4.3.1 Role of USA.** The chief objectives of the US in Middle East are manifold. They include maintaining predominance in the region by employing all means of national power, ensuring the smooth and easy supply of oil for itself and its European and Asian allies, preventing the spread of nuclear weapons in the region, and obstructing any potential power to gain influence that can jeopardise US politico-economic interests<sup>43</sup>. For meeting its targets, the US has entered into several defence treaties and gained access to important bases and territorial rights. This has not only made US one of the largest arms supplier to Middle East but also a security guaranter for the region's security.<sup>44</sup>

The US has full moral, logistic and intelligence support for Saudi-led efforts in Yemen since Obama's administration. Present day US strategy towards the Middle east region revolves around cuddling Saudia. Hence it is involved in almost all the crisis going on in the region. Yemen and Syria are good examples. The US role in Yemen is obviously is that of highlighting the Iranian involvement and support to Houtis. In Syria, however in the absence of any legal authorization by the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) to resort to use of force, the role remained vocal in bringing forth the Syrian National Coalition in order to provide the opposition forces a legal international recognition.<sup>45</sup>

**4.3.2 Role of Russia.** Counteracting secessionist movements in the North Caucasus region has been one of the chief motive for Russia in the Middle East. For this, Russia keeps on accusing the Arab states particularly the Gulf countries to have sponsored extremism and rebellion. With the events of September 11, 2001 and the resulting war against terror, Russia got the opportunity to be a western ally. Russia has played a very small role in the Arab states' economies especially the Gulf states despite its economic aspirations. Russia has a balancing approach towards the region. While having effective links with Iran and attuned

<sup>41</sup> Oğuz and Çelik, "CONFLICT IN SYRIA: IS IT A PROXY WARFARE?"

<sup>42</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq, "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018.

<sup>43</sup> Zulfqar, "Competing Interests of Major Powers in the Middle East: The Case Study of Syria and Its Implications for Regional Stability."

<sup>44</sup> Zulfqar.

<sup>45</sup> Zulfqar.



states on one hand, Russia has compatibility of interests with Israel as well. Hence it emerged as the second largest arms export dealer in Middle East.

Russia has been involved in Yemen through all means be they diplomatic, informal or economic. For Russia, Yemen's sea ports are a strategic asset to have a secure access of for its naval fleet. Moreover the most important Russian involvement has been through the use of private military companies (PMCs) since 2014 whereby retired servicemen are recruited and sent to conflict zones as contractors,<sup>46</sup> that can ensure the strong role of Russia as a peacemaker in the country.<sup>47</sup> Russia has also offered its mediatory role in the effective resolution of the Conflict.<sup>48</sup>

Since the Cold war, Russia's role in Syria has been that of a strategic ally. Russia has implemented its veto power at three crucial times to block the burden of sanctions or use of force against the Syrian regime. Russia is one of the chief supporter of Assad's regime. Russia has always provided a sound military, logistical and political assistance to Syrian government. Additionally, Russia's naval interests regarding strategic base at Tartus is an effective reason for Russian's support to Assad.<sup>49</sup>

**4.4 Implications For Pakistan.** Pakistan enjoys a cordial and brotherly relationship with KSA since its independence. This relationship is not only depended on the religious affiliation but also is based on generosity that Saudia offers in the form of economic assistance to Pakistan. Both the countries have also concluded multiple defense agreements<sup>50</sup>. On the other hand, Iran is also a very important Muslim neighboring country that shares multiple regional interests with Pakistan. For Pakistan, siding with any one contestant in the Saudi-Iran rivalry creates a set of adverse implications. At the same time, choosing to remain neutral may be a desired luxury, because Pakistan would be compelled to defend itself from Iranian or Saudi regional strategies that may adversely - even inadvertently - impact Pakistan's national interests. There are many implications of the sectarian rife between Saudi Arabia and Iran in the Middle East on Pakistan. These are as follows;

**4.4.1 Using Islam for Vested Interests.** Each section in Pakistani society has become prone to jumble Islam for its vested interests. The religion Islam is not truly in practice due to the transgressions of its followers. This has resulted in a series of problems such as rising sectarianism, internal chaos, anarchy, pessimism, grave illiteracy, and enormous poverty. Iran and Saudi Arabia have been continuously acting as stimulating factors. Growing nexus between these countries and hardliners in Pakistan has led to a series of internal security issues and daunting challenges for trhe government. Likeminded groups have joined each

---

<sup>46</sup> Russi's role in Middle east

<sup>47</sup> Weddington, "Rivalry in the Middle East: The History of Saudi-Iranian Relations and Its Implications on American Foreign Policy."

<sup>48</sup> Anoushiravan Ehteshami, "Middle East Middle Powers: Regional Role, International Impact," n.d., 22.

<sup>49</sup> Zulfqar, "Competing Interests of Major Powers in the Middle East: The Case Study of Syria and Its Implications for Regional Stability."

<sup>50</sup> Sewag, "Sectarian Rise in Pakistan."

other for common objectives<sup>51</sup>.

**4.4.2 Sectarian Tensions in Pakistan.** In the recent past, there are news as regards to Saudi and UAE fundings of ultra conservative Sunni groups and madrassas operating in Balochistan, province of Pakistan. Some of these funding channels are allegedly linked to banned groups like Lashkar-e-Jhangvi, Ahle-Sunnat-wal-Jamaat<sup>52</sup>. Despite dismantling all these threats by Pakistan, Iran Pakistan has experienced a downward flow due to the killing of Iranian border guards and other anti-Iran activities of these banned groups. Iran on the other hand is also alleged to be backing and supporting some of the sectarian groups in Pakistan as ‘Zainebiyoun’ Brigade backed by Iran has been reported to be recruiting Pakistan Shia fighters to fight in Middle East<sup>53</sup>.

**4.4.3 Polarization in Pakistan.** The ups and downs in the Middle eastern politics and the resulting security challenges have increased the chances of unanticipated polarization in Pakistani public opinion. Both Saudi Arabia and Iran have sympathizers in Pakistan owing largely to their affiliations with respective sectarian affinities, Sunnis as pro-Saudi, whereas Shias, as pro-Iranian. The Liberal-conservative polarization is increasingly visible, with the former taking a clear pro-neutrality position and the latter leaning towards Saudi position.

**4.4.4 Impact on Pakistan Economy.** Pakistan’s economy can have severe ramifications by the Middle Eastern situation. The chaos in the region may obstruct the drift of huge remittances sent by the Pakistani employees working in the Gulf States and empower the economy. If the situation continues, the remittances will decrease substantially that could lead to catastrophic consequences for Pakistan’s economy. This may also create unemployment for Pakistani workers working overseas.<sup>54</sup>

## CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

**5.1 Conclusion.** This paper argued that the Saudi-Iran’s sectarian proxy warfare in the Middle East is a means to counter each other’s regional influence that has adverse implications for internal security of Pakistan. Iran-Saudi relationship is a story of rivalry and antagonism based on the religious and ideological aspirations. Both the countries have increasingly sabotaged the peace and stability of the region by following their versions of political Islam. It is acknowledged that the patronage provided by the two Islamic Sects-Shia and Sunni is one of the root cause of their rivalry.<sup>55</sup> This confrontation has led to the unbalancing of power and resources in the Middle East along with igniting the

<sup>51</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq, “EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY,” 2018.

<sup>52</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq.

<sup>53</sup> Shujahi and Shafiq.

<sup>54</sup> Ankit Panda, “Pakistan’s Approach to Navigating the Saudi-Iranian Split.”

<sup>55</sup> Madiha Afzal, “SAUDI ARABIA’S HOLD ON PAKISTAN,” n.d., 9.

sectarian fire between Shias and Sunnis. Iran and Saudi Arabia's contradictory relationship is poised on maintaining a regional balance of power in political cum religious spheres. The struggle is indirect which involves proxies and ideological propagation. However, in guise of sectarianism they are seeking regional partners and durable alliances. The Middle Eastern situation demonstrated the gruesome reality of what happens when state rivalries, separatist movements and terror groups all come to play together. The upshot of the Middle eastern imbroglio has challenged the Pakistani policymakers from multiple dimensions vis-à-vis its relations with the Middle East. Sectarianism, Extremism and Polarisation are the top most among these evils.

**5.2 Recommendations.** Pakistan in such scenario is left with minimum options that revolve around few recommendations. Pakistan can try to help resolve some Iranian and Saudi differences. It should take rigorous measures to ensure its own territory is protected from Iranian and Saudi proxies and their ideological propaganda. It must take a proactive approach vis-à-vis the two rivals. Pakistan should also have a sincere dialogue with Iran and KSA over the issue of extremism and sectarianism in Pakistan. It is paying huge cost due to these problems which must be got realized and recognized by the two. Pakistan may also enhance its internal security mechanism to enable it to deal with matters of immense importance for its security.<sup>56</sup>

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Afzal, Madiha. "SAUDI ARABIA'S HOLD ON PAKISTAN," n.d., 9.

Ahmar, Moonis. "Sectarian Conflicts in Pakistan" 9 (n.d.): 19.

Ankit Panda. "Pakistan's Approach to Navigating the Saudi-Iranian Split." United States Institute of Peace. Accessed September 13, 2019. <https://www.usip.org/publications/2019/02/pakistans-approach-navigating-saudi-iranian-split>.

Barzegar, Kayhan, and Abdolrasool Divsallar. "Political Rationality in Iranian Foreign Policy." *The Washington Quarterly* 40, no. 1 (January 2, 2017): 39–53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0163660X.2017.1302738>.

Beauchamp, Zack. "Iran and Saudi Arabia's Cold War Is Making the Middle East Even More Dangerous." *Vox*, March 30, 2015. <https://www.vox.com/2015/3/30/8314513/saudi-arabia-iran>.

Cerioli, Luíza Gimenez, and Luíza Gimenez Cerioli. "Roles and International Behaviour: Saudi–Iranian Rivalry in Bahrain's and Yemen's Arab Spring."

---

<sup>56</sup> Kashif Mumtaz, "The Middle East in a Flux."

Contexto Internacional 40, no. 2 (August 2018): 295–316.  
<https://doi.org/10.1590/s0102-8529.2018400200010>.

Ehteshami, Anoushiravan. “Middle East Middle Powers: Regional Role, International Impact,” n.d., 22.

Fisher, Max. “How the Iranian-Saudi Proxy Struggle Tore Apart the Middle East.” *The New York Times*, November 19, 2016, sec. World.  
<https://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/20/world/middleeast/iran-saudi-proxy-war.html>.

Gregory Aftandilian. “Maneuvering the Saudi-Iranian Rivalry in the Middle East: How the United States Can Preserve and Protect Its Long-Term Interests in the Region.” Accessed September 13, 2019.  
<https://ssi.armywarcollege.edu/pubs/display.cfm?pubID=1395>.

Grumet, Tali. “New Middle East Cold War: Saudi Arabia and Iran’s Rivalry.” *Electronic Theses and Dissertations*, January 1, 2015.  
<https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd/1028>.

Huma Yusuf, The. “Pakistan in the Middle East: A Cautious Balance.” *The Diplomat*. Accessed September 13, 2019.  
<https://thediplomat.com/2017/10/pakistan-in-the-middle-east-a-cautious-balance/>.

“Iran and Saudi Arabia’s Cold War Is Making the Middle East Even More Dangerous - Vox.” Accessed September 11, 2019.  
<https://www.vox.com/2015/3/30/8314513/saudi-arabia-iran>.

Karakir, İrem Aşkar. “Yemen’de Devam Etmekte Olan Çatışma: Bir Vekalet Savaşı Mı?” *TESAM Akademi Dergisi*, August 30, 2018, 121–49.  
<https://doi.org/10.30626/tesamakademi.456008>.

———. “Yemen’de Devam Etmekte Olan Çatışma: Bir Vekalet Savaşı Mı?” *TESAM Akademi Dergisi*, August 30, 2018, 121–49.  
<https://doi.org/10.30626/tesamakademi.456008>.

Kashif Mumtaz. “The Middle East in a Flux: How Should Pakistan Respond? | Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad.” Accessed September 13, 2019.  
<http://issi.org.pk/the-middle-east-in-a-flux-how-should-pakistan-respond/>.

Muzaffar, Muhammad, Robina Khan, and Zahid Yaseen. “Saudi - Iran Strife: Complexities for Pakistan.” *Global Regional Review* 2, no. 1 (2017): 119–34.

Nazir Hussain, Mansoor Ahmad. “Rising Iran: Implications for the Middle East and Pakistan | Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad.” Accessed September 13, 2019.  
<http://www.issi.org.pk/rising-iran-implications-for-the-middle-east-and-pakistan/>.

Oğuz, Şafak, and Kadir Ertaç ÇeliK. "CONFLICT IN SYRIA: IS IT A PROXY WARFARE?," n.d., 26.

Rizwan, Muhammad Khalid, Muhammad Usman Arshid, Muhammad Ali Waqar, and Saira Iram. "From Rivalry to Nowhere: A Story of Iran-Saudi Ties," 2014. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-199491101>.

Seth G.Jones. "War by Proxy: Iran's Growing Footprint in the Middle East | Center for Strategic and International Studies." Accessed September 13, 2019. <https://www.csis.org/war-by-proxy>.

Sewag, Zulqarnain. "Sectarian Rise in Pakistan: Role of Saudi Arabia and Iran." Accessed September 13, 2019. [https://www.academia.edu/19001554/Sectarian\\_Rise\\_in\\_Pakistan\\_Role\\_of\\_Saudi\\_Arabia\\_and\\_Iran](https://www.academia.edu/19001554/Sectarian_Rise_in_Pakistan_Role_of_Saudi_Arabia_and_Iran).

Shafi, Hira A. "Iran – Saudi Rivalry: Options for Pakistan," n.d., 11.

Sharp, Jeremy M. "Yemen: Civil War and Regional Intervention," n.d., 21.

———. "Yemen: Civil War and Regional Intervention," n.d., 21.

Shujahi, Dr Farhat Konain, and Muhammad Shafiq. "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018, 8.

———. "EVALUATING IRAN-SAUDI STRATEGIC COMPETITION IN MIDDLE EAST: IMPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL SECURITY," 2018, 8.

Sleiman-Haidar, Ribale, and Jack McGinn. "Saudi Arabia and Iran: Beyond Conflict and Coexistence?" Monograph, August 2018. <http://www.lse.ac.uk/middleEastCentre/home.aspx>.

"Vatanka\_PolicyPaper.Pdf." Accessed September 13, 2019. [https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Vatanka\\_PolicyPaper.pdf](https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Vatanka_PolicyPaper.pdf).

Weddington, Derika. "Rivalry in the Middle East: The History of Saudi-Iranian Relations and Its Implications on American Foreign Policy," n.d., 146.

Zahid Shahab Ahmed, Shahram Akbarzadeh. "Understanding Pakistan's Relationship with Iran | Middle East Policy Council." Accessed September 13, 2019. <https://www.mepc.org/journal/understanding-pakistans-relationship-iran>.

Zulfqar, Saman. "Competing Interests of Major Powers in the Middle East: The Case Study of Syria and Its Implications for Regional Stability," n.d., 27.

**Musharraf Legacy & Triple “N” Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR**

By

**Dr. Mian Saeed Ahmad**

---

**ABSTRACT**

*On October 12, 1999; it was fourth military coup in country, General Pervez Musharraf address to nation and said; the Armed Forces would never disappoint the public nor had it ever done. He assured that soldiers would spend last drop of their blood for the defense and solidarity of the country. He also appealed to nation to remain peaceful and lend him unflinching support for the prosperous and brighter Pakistan. After suspended the Constitution of 1973, General Pervez Musharraf imposed an Interim Constitution PCO on October 14, 1999 and created the post of Chief Executive (CE) instead of Chief Martial Law Administrator. It was a political strategy of Musharraf as this title was more acceptable in the western countries than Chief Martial Law Administrator. He presented the details about triple “N” on October 17, 1999, given below:*

- **NSC: National Security Council.**
- **NAB: National Accountability Bureau.**
- **NBR: National Bureau of Reconstruction.**

Musharraf explained the seven point agenda about the restoration of national Economy & Political Road Map.

- 1. Impartial Accountability for all countrywide.**
- 2. Reconstruction of National confidence and morale.**
- 3. Eradication of politics from the national institutions.**
- 4. Supremacy of Law and accomplishment by speedy justice.**
- 5. To strengthen the Federation and restoration of national integrity.**
- 6. Restoration of the Economy so the confidence of the investors might be restored.**
- 7. Transfer of Power at grass root level and compulsory participation of the public.**

General Pervez Musharraf launched ridicule & fundamental changes in governance. General Musharraf layout about the National Security Council (NSC) on October 17, 1999 in nationwide address. Musharraf was apex & Supreme Authority in National Security Council (NSC), it was comprised of Military and Civilian Members. It was constituted as a result of Chief Executive’s (CE) announcement & later; General Musharraf formed NSC on October 25, 1999. It is notable that the Constitution of Pakistan does not allow such as NSC. Under Article: 243 of the Constitution of 1973, the President is the Supreme Commander of the Armed Forces while, Article 245 envisage that, the Armed Forces shall defend Pakistan against external aggression or threat of war under the instructions of the Federal Government. That’s why the formation of NSC was thought to be

Supra-Constitutional. However, Musharraf denied the allegation and stressed that NSC would bring democratic changes in political structure of the country. 1. McGrath, Allen, 2001, p.159.

The President would be the Chairman of NSC and other Members would be Prime Minister, Chairman of the Senate, Speaker of the National Assembly, the Opposition leader, Chief Ministers, Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, and Chiefs of Staff of the Pakistan Army, Navy & Air Force. NSC Cabinet took oath on November 6<sup>th</sup>, 1999. It was consisted of eight members and Musharraf was Pattern in Chief. 2. General Pervez Musharraf, In the line of Fire, 2001, p.138.

Stabilized the NSC; other Armed Chiefs granted the members status. In addition; seasoned lawyer Syed Shariffudin Pirzada, Dr. Mahmud Ahmad Ghazi and Javed Jabber were appointed as Advisers. Furthermore; the school time friend of Pervez Musharraf, Mr. Tariq Aziz was entrusted the Secretary ship of the Council. Further; General Musharraf elaborates the aims & objectives of National Security Council.

Musharraf said NSC would discussion & consultation on strategic importance, governance and inter-provincial harmony. Musharraf enumerated various objectives of NSC & Seven Point Agenda. As he said: The Council shall deliberate upon, discuss and tender advice to the Chief Executive on such matters as the Chief Executive may deem expedient and necessary to refer to the National Security, Foreign Affairs, Law & Order, Corruption, Accountability, recovery of bank loans and public debts from defaulters, finance, economic and social welfare, health, education, Islamic ideology, human rights, protection of minorities and women development so as to achieve the aims and objectives enshrined in the Objectives Resolution of 1949. 3. Zaidi, S. Akbar, A Benevolent Dictatorship, Economic & Political, October 16- 29, 1999, p.4.

The major objective of NSC was to run the Govt. Affairs smoothly. It was an Institution in itself. Its main function was to hold check on the Prime Minister, his cabinet, his administration and even “on the institution of democracy itself”. The hidden motive behind the NSC was also to make the parliament ineffective: “The much dreaded NSC, introduced by General Pervez Musharraf, agitates against democratic values and undermines the growth of representative institutions.” 4. Baxter, Craig, Pakistan under the Military, 2003, p.71.

The establishment of NSC was not a democratic tradition; rather it was thought to be supra-constitutional act, which the military regime introduced to reduce the role of the Prime Minister to zero. It was the replay of the traditions of earlier military rulers, introduced the NSC for their own interests. The military regime, through the NSC, tried to run the state affairs from the back seat. The president in military uniform was to head the NSC for the next 5 years. Another drawback of the NSC was that the Chief Ministers could not be work independently, because they were appointed by Governors who were the nominees of the President of Pakistan. In short; NSC was an unrestricted body and all embracing invasive institution. Masses supported the Musharraf’s Agenda because they had fed up with the politics of the past. Numerous of political parties announced to support the political and social of Musharraf. In 1998; there was same idea of NSC given by General Jahangir Karamat but he has to resign over the differences with Nawaz Sharif about NSC.

Musharraf Legacy & Triple “N” Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR  
In 1977; General Zia-ul-Haq could not accomplish the set up of this National Security Council. He had presented the initial sketch of NSC in RCO 1985. 5. Article 152-A, General Pervez Musharraf established NSC1999.

However, General Zia ul Haq could not implement the same due to strong political reaction. And the 8<sup>th</sup> Amendment was approved without the National Security Council. The idea of NSC has been existed in Pakistan in different era but in Pervez Musharraf regime this institution came into being legally. First NSC was constituted during the rule of General Muhammad Yahya Khan which remained in power from March 25, 1969 to December 20, 1971. 6. Saighal, Vinod, Restructuring Pakistan, 2002, p.118.

It was the age of Interim Constitution or Legal Framework Order. Major General Ghulam Omar was the Secretary General of the Council and its President was General Muhammad Yahya Khan. Thus, the command was handed over to Bhutto, and then it was dissolved. Later, NSC was established by General Zia-ul-Haq, which remained intact from March 29, 1985 to August 17, 1988. 7. Hussain, Ishtiaq, “Pakistan’s October 1999 Military Coup: Its Causes and Consequences December 2000, p. 4.

Its Secretary General was Major General, Rao Farman Ali Khan and after the death of Zia-ul-Haq the Council also came to an end. Afterwards during Musharraf regime, NSC was necessitated and it was established on October 17, 1999. Its Secretary was Tariq Aziz and president was General Pervez Musharraf. 8. Zaidi, S. Akbar, Politics of Opportunism, November 2002, p.7. Due to 17<sup>th</sup> Amendment Musharraf had got the approval of NSC’s legal status. This council existed from April 8, 2004 to 2010, while Pervez Musharraf during his regime was his last President up till August 18, 2008. 9. The Dawn, Lahore, November 5, 1999.

Later on’ with the Promulgation of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment it was abolished. After August 18, 2008, the Secretary General of NSC, Major General (R) Mehmud Ahmad Durrani and its President, Prime Minister Yousaf Raza Gillani, its status as presidential ordinance remained intact from October 17, 2008 to April 2009, but after the 17<sup>th</sup> Amendment its Legal Framework was created. President Musharraf was of the view that the political crisis could be averted through NSC. As during past there was a political instability due to lack of communication, hence, now all the important political and government institutions would play their due role in resolving the crisis. This institute was legally constituted in the country by adding Article 152- A\* in the Constitution. Pervez Musharraf, after the formation of National Security Council, made appointments on the political posts which included Lt. General Safdar as Governor Punjab, Air Marshal Azeem Daudpota as Governor Sind, Lt. General Mr. Shafiq Ahmad as Governor of NWFP and Justice Ameer-ul-Mulk Mangal Governor for Baluchistan.

Pervez Musharraf was of the view that from now onwards the Governor and the Corps Commander would work together for betterment. The oath taking of the governors also remained a puzzle as the 1973 Constitution had been suspended and the PCO was imposed. Pervez Musharraf nominated technocrats and persons with good fame for the federal cabinet. He appointed his close friend and Ex-Governor Sind, Lt. General (R) Moin-ud-din Haider (1942-b), as Interior Minister. The Finance Minister was entrusted another close friend Shoukat Aziz(1950-b).Ministry of Religious Affairs to Dr. Mehmud Ahmed Ghazi(1950-2010), Local



Bodies to Umar Asghar Khan(1953-2002), Science and Technology to Prof. Dr. Atta-ur-Rehman(1942-b), Education to Zebeda Jalal(1959-b), Privatization to Altaf Hussain 1944-b), Law and Human Rights to Barrister Shahida Jameel(1944-b), Foreign Affairs to Abdul Sattar(1943-b), Information and Broadcasting to Nisar Memon (1942-b), Trade, Industries and Production to Abdul Razzaq Dawood, Health and Manpower to Dr. Abdul Malik Kansi, Food & Agriculture to Shafqat Jamoot, Railway to Lt. General Javed Qazi(1941-b), Petroleum and Communications to Lt. General Nasir Javed(1933-b). Aziz. A. Munshi (1933-2009) was appointed as Attorney General, while Chief Election Commissioner Justice (R) Abdul Qadir Choudary (1945-) and Governor State Bank Dr. Yaqoob were not changed and they completed their tenure of service. Pervez Musharraf was steadily moving ahead with his Triple “N”\*\* Policy and to achieve this objective, the set up of National Reconstruction Bureau was launched. Lt. General (R) Tanveer Naqvi was selected as its Chairman; General Pervez Musharraf confirmed his designation to Lt. General Naqvi also on the basis of personal relations. This institution further strengthened the political and social agenda of Pervez Musharraf.

In past when ever such policies were formulated on the national level that instability prevailed in the country and this factor further deteriorated the anarchy in Pakistan, hence, Pervez Musharraf launched this institution of NRB for compiling a policy on the national level. This institution was also set up due to the constitutional and the legislative consultation as per presidential ordinance on November 18, 1999. Musharraf had a clear vision how to run the affairs of the country and to strengthen it. In his speeches and addresses to the nation, from the very outset of his reign, he stressed on good governance, revival of economy, eradication of poverty, accountability and depoliticizing of state institutions. For all this, he announced to establish various institutions. National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) was established under the chairmanship of Lt. General Tanveer Naqvi on November 1999. NRB is one of the two main institutions, established by military regime. The other was NAB. The motive behind the establishment of NRB was to reform political, social and administrative structure of the society. The NRB was established to revise policies and strategies for national reconstruction. It was established to develop a scheme for devolution, in order to introduce democracy at grass root level. The establishment of NRB was one of the most moot decisions of the military regime. The NRB introduced novel innovations. It also demolished the old administrative and political system of the country. Introduction of the Local Government Scheme was one of its initial decisions. It launched on August 14, 2000, when the Musharraf presented the Local Government Plan 2000. 10. [www.lgs2000.govt.pk](http://www.lgs2000.govt.pk).

The NRB was led by Chairman, and it consisted of the three members who were appointed on the basis of their experience in the areas of their respective capabilities relevant to its goals. The Chairman would be able to appoint Consultants and other staff for operational support. They would be termed as “Think Tanks”. The Bureau's Secretariat would contain four wings, Good Governance Group Wing, Administration Wing, Operations Wing, and Media and Governance Cell. 11. Zaidi, S. Akbar, *State, Military and Social Transition: Improbable Future of Democracy in Pakistan*, December2005, p. 5.

Musharraf Legacy & Triple “N” Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR  
Furthermore, on November 2002, the Federal Cabinet approved that NRB would function as part of the Prime Minister's Secretariat and would perform the economics tasks. [www.nbr.govt.pk](http://www.nbr.govt.pk).<sup>12</sup>

**NRB would amend the Local Government Laws.**

**NRB would interact with the Government Organizations.**

**NRB would provide assistance to the Governments to implement the proposals.**

**NRB would support the by reconstructing and strengthening various institutions.**

**NRB would offer suggestions for the reconstruction of civil services at all levels.**

**NRB would present a report during the month to P M on the performance Bureau.**

**NRB would generate fundamental thoughts for the promotion of good governance.**

**NRB would reinforce the Federal & Provincial Governments for implementing LGS.**

**NRB would make coordination with the national as well as international Think Tanks.**

**NRB would arrange seminars and conferences and spread knowledge by using media.**

Corruption has been the major problem of the world and Pakistan is no exception. From the very outset of the history of Pakistan, the governments had been taking steps in a way or other to get rid of this menace. In 1947, the government promulgated Prevention of Corruption Act 1947. After that in 1961, Provincial Anti Corruption Establishment in 1961, was promulgated and the Federal Investigation Agency in 1975. In 1997; Accountability Bureau was established under political institution. In 1999, the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) was created for the eradication of corruption. In his Seven Points Agenda, Musharraf had stressed on swift and just accountability. In order to ensure accountability, the military regime promulgated on November 16, 1999, the National Accountability Bureau Ordinance 1999. As per Ordinance, NAB was set up under the Chairmanship of Lt Gen. Syed Muhammad Amjad Ali, who was with good name and fame. Headquarter of NAB was arranged in Islamabad & five regional offices started operation in Provinces. The Provincial Headquarters was wholly and solely perform monitoring functions. Further; Regional Offices perform the function of investigation. However, the headquarters held very restricted capability for investigation. National Accountability Bureau was awarded the mandate from January 1, 1985; for the eradication of corruption's wide spread in the country the investigation and prosecution of such cases, the recovery of large amounts from the defaulters, the recovery of state money and other assets and for the elimination of corruption through a holistic approach of awareness, prevention and enforcement. <sup>13</sup> Mehmud, Sohail, *Musharraf's Regime & the Governance Crisis*, 2008, p.164.

*NAB's main functions were ordered on practical lines and were arranged into four key divisions operations, Prosecution, Awareness and Prevention. The NAB formulated a National Anti Corruption Strategy (NACS) in 2002. It recommended anti corruption strategy of awareness, Prevention and enforcement in an environment, where corruption is widespread. From its inception to 2002, the NAB investigated included bureaucrats, politicians, businessmen and from Armed Forces, cases were referred to courts which convicted 239. The NAB's actions*

have resulted in convictions of hitherto sacrosanct persons in all fields of public life, 532 Bureaucrats, 180 Politicians, 149 Businessmen and 18 Armed Forces personnel have been investigated.<sup>14</sup>[www.nab.govt.pk](http://www.nab.govt.pk). The NAB was to deal with corruption cases, and punishments prescribed including imprisonment, fines and disqualification from holding public offices and getting loans financial institutions which were sponsored by the government. However, the NAB did not take any solid and unbiased steps for uprooting corruption. Rather, the NAB showed partiality towards the politically unwanted people. The NAB's credibility was not reliable. The evident proof of it was the regime's deal with Nawaz Sharif, the ex-Prime Minister, and his exile to Saudi Arab and amnesty to the members of his family. On the other hand, many politicians escaped from the clutches of the NAB only because of supporting the military regime. These politicians were those who were notorious for corruption, tax evasion, and loan defaulting and many other malpractices, "National Accountability Bureau was created by a Dictator by bypassing the Constitution of Pakistan by imposing Martial Law. If Martial Law of October 12, 1999 is invalid and illegal, then how can National Accountability Bureau be Legal?" 15. The Weekly Fact, Islamabad, November, 2001.

NAB was established for Accountability and proper check and balance over the performance of the Institutions. However, besides the NAB, Pervez Musharraf also launched a new parallel system "Army Monitoring Team" (AMT) on November 15, 1999. The approach behind the appointments of the Army Monitors Officers was to improve the efficiency of Civil Officers, "The AMT was required to receive input from the field and pass it on top military brass for policy formulation". 16. The Daily Dawn, Lahore, February 17, 2000.

The AMT were appointed in order to enhance the efficiency of civil departments as well as to keep check and balance so that the corruption might be avoided to possible extent. The AMT were asked to prepare and submit performance and evolution reports of Civil Officers and their duties. AMT send confidential reports to higher authorities. During 1999-2000; more than 3500 Civil Officers, including 1000 from Central Board of Revenue (CBR), faced inquiries on the Reports of Army Monitors Teams; approximately 1000 CBR Officers were suspended. 17. Ashok K. Behuria, "How Military Dominates the Political Space in Pakistan: a Study of Musharraf's Rule 1999-2008", 2009, p.5.

In Education Department; AMT visited various schools and colleges, where they were unwillingly welcomed, because of their interference in administrative and educational affairs. They visited these institutions and reported about teachers' performance, absence from schools without prior leave, about free delivery of books to the students. Many teachers had to face inquiries on their reports. Many were suspended and so many others were given hard warnings. On the whole, the system could not prove effective and useful. In order to strengthen the Army Monitoring System, the General Musharraf Govt. promulgated two Ordinances; Removal from Services Ordinance 2000. II. Civil Servants Ordinance 2000.\*\*\* Through, the Ordinances, the Army Monitors Teams were empowered special authority to dismiss the corrupt and inefficient officers and the premature retirement. However, the system proved imperfect due to many drawbacks & loopholes. The Army Monitors Teams cut in the proceedings and matters of the departments. They also misused their respective authorities. It also seems that the

---

<sup>1</sup>\*National Accountability Bureau Ordinance 1999, [www.nab.govt.pk](http://www.nab.govt.pk)

Musharraf Legacy & Triple “N” Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR rationale behind introducing this system was to deter political opponents and the civil bureaucracy from challenging and questioning the writ of military rule. The authority of this institution was extensive and it possessed supremacy on matters and departments in addition to the foreign policy including economic, interior and national harmony.

General Tanveer Ahmad Naqvi remained Chairman NRB from November 18, 1999 to July 25, 2002; he was mastermind & architecture of new Local Government System (LGS20001) in Pakistan. Having chalk out the LGS Plan 2001 & left the job. Mr. Daniyal Aziz appointed as new Chairman NRB; he served the institution for a long time. It was NRB, who floated the idea for the Presidential Referendum 2002 and proposed Constitutional Amendment.

In October 17, 1999; General Musharraf was presented a glorious seven point agenda and stressed the need of transparent Accountability. Hence, he inaugurated the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) on November 18, 1999. Although, the Accountability Institution already existed in country, but the previous government partial and Verdicts were granted from Courts, due to reason the institution had become notorious. General Pervez Musharraf tries to restore the confidence of Institution among public. So that, he appointed Lt. General Syed Muhammad Amjad as Chairman NAB.

AFP interviewed General Musharraf & he said that he has the longest time frame for the Restoration of Democracy after strict accountability process. Mrs. Benazir Bhutto termed about the NAB “New Accountability Cell is like old wine in a new bottle”.<sup>18</sup> *Benazir Bhutto, p.329*. While, Musharraf defend the Accountability & said, for speedy and cheaper justice the Accountability Courts had started function in across the country. The political activities were very calm down; a Session of All Pakistan Advisory Council and all political parties held at Lahore. Participants from leading political parties demanded from Musharraf in the Joint Statement; “Democracy should be restored; PCO, NSC and NBR are unacceptable”.<sup>19</sup> While, General Musharraf said; he has not come for a few months, he would accomplish my agenda. <sup>20</sup> *The Daily Washington Times, USA, December 24, 1999*. The outcome of the Accountability Courts began to reach the public and the Ex-Chief Minister of Punjab, Arif Nakai became the first victim of the Courts. Apart from the confiscation of the property he was disqualified from taking part in the politics for 21 years. <sup>21</sup> *Zaidi, S. Akbar, Elections: Continuity Rather Than Change, November 2002, pp. 2-7*.

After that a long sequence of such incidents began and the Accountability Courts were making decisions and these acts were getting popular among the public. It was a coincidence that mostly the politicians were victimized by the Accountability Courts. The performance of NAB remained unprecedented as it initiated corruption cases against big names and got the credit from the courts, while this institution deposited more than two Billion Rupees in the government treasury but no action could be taken by NAB against the military officers as they were declared above the law by the Presidential Ordinance. <sup>22</sup> *Elhan Niaz, 2010, p. 47*. The politicians were perplexed against the accountability law as they were of the view that the courts without taking the demands of justice in consideration were hastily deciding the cases though influence. While, Nawaz Sharif was also victimized by the Accountability Court. The Chairman NAB said to clean the filth of the country further many years were required and to accelerate the accountability activity twenty three more accountability courts were going to

establish. Nawaz Sharif termed this decision as engineered. But Pervez Musharraf said Courts are free and he has no influence, and as these are functioning according to the law.

### Reference:

1. McGrath, Allen, *The Destruction of Pakistan's Democracy*, New York, 2001, p.71
1. General Pervez Musharraf (Head) CE
2. Abdul Aziz Mirza (Chief of Naval Staff)
3. Air Marshal Mehdi Qurashi (Chief of Air Staff)
4. Shariffudin Pirzada (Legal Advisor)
5. Aziz A Munshi (Attorney General)
6. Dr. Mahmud Ahmad Ghazi (Member)
7. Dr. Attiya Inayatullah (Member)
8. Javed Jabber (Member)
2. Pervez Musharraf, *In the Line of Fire*, 2001, Rawalpindi, p138
3. Zaidi, S. Akbar, *A Benevolent Dictatorship*, Economic & Political, Weekly, Vol. 3, No. 34, October 16- 29, 1999, p.4
4. Baxter, Craig, *Pakistan Under the Military*, London, 2003, p.143
5. Article 152-A, General Pervez Musharraf established NSC in Pakistan 1999  
*Article: 152-A. According to the Constitution of Pakistan 1973*, There shall be a National Security Council to serve as a forum for consultation on strategic matters pertaining to the sovereignty, integrity and security of the State; and the matters relating to democracy, governance and inter-Provincial harmony. The President shall be the Chairman of the National Security Council and its other members shall be the Prime Minister, the Chairman of the Senate, the Speaker of the National Assembly, the Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly, the Chief Ministers of the Provinces, the Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, and the Chiefs of Staff of the Pakistan Army, Pakistan Navy and Pakistan Air Force.
6. Saighal, Vinod, *Restructuring Pakistan*, New Delhi: Manhas Publications, 2002, p.142
7. Hussain, Ishtiaq, *"Pakistan's October 1999 Military Coup: Its Causes and Consequences"*, Asian Journal of Political Science Volume 8 Number 2, December 2000, p. 4
8. Zaidi, S. Akbar, *Politics of Opportunism*, Economic & Political, Weekly, Vol. 37, No. 44, November 2-15, 2002, p. 7
9. The Daily Jung, Lahore, November 5, 1999

\* According to the Constitution of Pakistan 1973, There shall be a National Security Council to serve as a forum for consultation on strategic matters pertaining to the sovereignty, integrity and security of the State; and the matters relating to democracy, governance and inter-Provincial harmony. The President shall be the Chairman of the National Security Council and its other members shall be the Prime Minister, the Chairman of the Senate, the Speaker of the National Assembly, the Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly, the Chief Ministers of the Provinces, the Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, and the Chiefs of Staff of the Pakistan Army, Pakistan Navy and Pakistan Air Force.

Musharraf Legacy & Triple “N” Agenda NSC, NAB & NBR  
\*\* Triples “N” Agenda of Pervez Musharraf Govt, it is just co incident that Musharraf introduced his Policy and institution started from letter “N” NSC, NBR, and NAB & NRO.

10. LGS Plan 2000, [www.lgs2000.govt.pk](http://www.lgs2000.govt.pk)
11. Zaidi, S. Akbar, *State, Military and Social Transition: Improbable Future of Democracy in Pakistan*, Economic & Political, Weekly, Vol. 40, No. 49, December 3-9, 2005, p. 5
12. NBR Plan, [www.nbr.govt.pk](http://www.nbr.govt.pk)
13. Mehmod, Sohail, *Musharraf's Regime & the Governance Crisis*, New York, 2008, p.164
14. National Accountability Bureau Ordinance 1999, [www.nab.govt.pk](http://www.nab.govt.pk)
15. The Weekly Fact, Islamabad, November 3-10, 2003
16. The Daily Dawn, Lahore, February 17, 2000
17. Ashok K. Behuria, “*How Military Dominates the Political Space in Pakistan: a Study of Musharraf's Rule 1999-2008*”, Journal of Peace Studies, Vol. 16, Issue 1-2, 2009, p.5
18. Benazir Bhutto, p.329
19. APC, All Parties Conference held at Lahore on December 12, 1999. A joint statement was issued to demand to Musharraf to review the Martial Law 1999.
20. The Daily Washington Times, New York, USA, December 24, 1999
21. Zaidi, S. Akbar, Elections: Continuity Rather Than Change, Economic & Political, Weekly, Vol. 4, No. 37, November 2002, pp. 2-7  
\*\*\* Removal from Services Ordinance & Civil Servants Ordinance 2000, [www.govt.org.pk](http://www.govt.org.pk)

Elhan Niaz, *The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan 1947-2008*, Oxford: University Press, Karachi, 2010, p. 47 AFP; Agency France Press; Established 1835, the world top breaking news agency, AFP.com 2000